

1. **Pouvez-vous nous fournir la liste des menus offerts durant le voyage, avec les coûts ventilés lorsque possible, incluant le prix par repas ainsi que les boissons alcooliques? / Can you provide the list of menus offered during the trip, with costs broken down where possible, including the costs for each meal and alcoholic beverages?**

M. Pierre Paul-Hus: En général, est-il possible de voir la liste du menu qui a été demandé par Affaires mondiales Canada, avec les coûts associés, pour les différents plats qui ont été servis sur l'avion, ainsi que les boissons alcooliques?

M. Stewart Wheeler: C'est possible de vous montrer la liste du menu. (p.9)

Refer to Appendix A.
Voir l'annexe A.

2. **Pouvez-vous fournir les factures ventilées par coûts, pour inclure, lorsque possible : a) les coûts associés pour chaque plats, b) la gestion, c) la livraison des repas, d) l'entreposage, e) les articles jetables, f) les frais d'administration, g) les frais d'aéroport, h) les frais liés à la sécurité et; i) les taxes / Can you provide invoices broken down by cost, to include, where possible: a) associated costs for each dish, b) management, c) meal delivery, d) storage, e) disposables, f) administration fees, g) airport fees, h) security fees, and; i) taxes ?**

Mme Julie Vignola : Tout à l'heure, vous disiez, lieutenant-général Kenny, qu'il n'est pas possible de savoir quelle part des coûts des repas n'est pas liée à ceux de la nourriture, parce que le traiteur vous donne la facture du montant total. C'est bien ce que j'ai entendu. Donc, si nous vous demandions de ventiler ces 80 000 \$ pour inclure la gestion, la livraison de repas, l'entreposage, les articles jetables, les frais d'aéroport, les frais d'administration, les frais liés à la sécurité et les taxes, alors ce ne serait pas possible pour vous de le faire. Est-ce exact? (p.15)

3. **Quelles étaient les collations offertes sur le vol, combien de collations ont été servies, et quel était le coût? What were the snacks offered on the flight, how many snacks were served and what was the cost?**

Mme Julie Vignola : J'ai une dernière question. Vous dites qu'il y a eu des collations. Quand vous dites « collations », quel est le nombre et quel est le type de collations? Quel est le coût de ces collations?

Lgén Eric Kenny: Merci de la question. There were snacks that were served on the flights. I do not have the specific breakdown of the cost for the snacks with me at this time.

Mme Julie Vignola: D'accord. Est-il possible de les faire parvenir? (p.26)

Refer to Appendix A.
Voir l'annexe A.

4. Est-ce que la Défense nationale peut nous fournir les contrats avec les traiteurs, ventilés par coûts lorsque possible? / Can National Defence provide the contracts signed with the caterers, with costs broken down where possible?

Mme Julie Vignola: Pour ces repas, serait-il possible d'avoir par écrit les détails qui sont possibles d'avoir des traiteurs? Je sais que vous disiez que cela n'était pas possible pour certains d'entre eux, alors que, pour d'autres, cela l'était peut-être. Est-il possible d'obtenir ces détails? Le but au bout du compte serait vraiment de comprendre. Comme mon collègue le disait, si au Qatar, cela coûte « une beurrée et demie », au moins, on le saura, et peut-être prévoir. (p.16)

Mr. Kelly McCauley (Edmonton West, CPC): Thanks, Mr. Chair. Just very quickly, some of the committee members have asked for copies of the menus and that. There would have provided a banquet event order or catering event order for that. Can you confirm, please, you'll provide that to this committee as soon as possible for this issue? (p.20)

Mme Julie Vignola: Merci, monsieur le président. J'aimerais m'assurer que non seulement les menus seront donnés aux membres du Comité, mais également la ventilation des dépenses, telles que je l'ai demandé précédemment. Je comprends que certains traiteurs ne ventilent pas leurs coûts, mais je serais assez surprise si tous les traiteurs refusent de ventiler leurs coûts. Je veux m'assurer qu'on reçoive bien la ventilation. (p.25)

5. Est-ce que la Défense nationale peut nous fournir les estimés et les factures finales, ventilés par coûts lorsque possible? Can National Defence provide the estimates and final bills, with costs broken down where possible?

Mr. Kelly McCauley: Okay. Would you provide us with the estimates, then, and the final bill and the menus, please, to the committee?

LGen Eric Kenny: If I can. Once we look through it, and we have the final invoices, the total cost turned out to be \$80,000.

Mr. Kelly McCauley: Will you provide us, please, with those estimates, the contracts and the menus for all the flights in question?

LGen Eric Kenny: We'll take it on in order to look into those...providing what we have for you.

Mr. Kelly McCauley: I'm not asking you to look into it. Will you provide it for us, please?

LGen Eric Kenny: We'll take a look at it, yes, or to provide.

Mr. Kelly McCauley: I think I have the will of the committee to ask that you provide it for us. (p.21)

6. Quelle était la durée de chaque vols pris pendant le voyage? / What was the flight length of each of the trips involved?

Mr. Kelly McCauley: I'm going to share a bit of my time with my colleague, Mr. Redekopp. Just quickly, Lieutenant-General Kenny, would be able to provide us with the flight length of each of the trips involved that we're discussing?

LGen Eric Kenny: Thank you for the question, Mr. Chair—

Mr. Kelly McCauley: Sorry. Just to the committee. Not right now. Just when you have time.

7. **Quel était le coût par personne du recent voyage entrepris par le premier ministre et la gouverneure générale à Londres et à New York? Pouvez-vous nous fournir les contrats et les menus pour ce voyage? / What was the cost per person for the recent trip the PM and the GG took to London, and then to New York? Can you provide the contracts, and the menus for that trip?**

Mr. Kelly McCauley: Okay. What was the cost per person for the recent trip the Prime Minister and the GG took to London, and then to New York?

LGen Eric Kenny: Thank you for the question, Mr. Chair. I do not know what the cost was per person.

Mr. Kelly McCauley: Could you provide that for us, and the contracts and the menus? (p.22)

8. **Quelle était la contingence en 2019, à combien avait-t-elle été réduite, et à combien l'avez-vous à nouveau réduite en 2022? / What was the contingency in 2019, what did you reduce it to, and then what did you reduce it to in 2022?**

Mr. Brad Redekopp (Saskatoon West, CPC): Thank you, Mr. Chair. I want to pick up on that point of contingencies. You've mentioned that there were contingencies, you eliminated part of them in 2019, and now again. Can you tell us a bit more about that? When you had the beef, chicken and pork options, how much contingency did you actually have if you had, say, 30 people on board—did you have 35 meals? What were the typical contingencies? What would happen to those excess meals once the flights were completed?

LGen Eric Kenny: The contingency percentage...I don't actually have the exact number of meals that were purchased for each flight and the contingency amount. What I can tell you is when you go on an airline right now, they'll often go in order, the first person has two choices, they get what they want, and as they go down, they run out of a specific meal set, so that's the contingency where that's offered to more people than not, and that's what we've reduced specifically.

Mr. Brad Redekopp: Could you provide the committee with that information—what was the reduction, what was the contingency in 2019, what did you reduce it to, and then what did you reduce it to now?

LGen Eric Kenny: We can look into that.

Mr. Brad Redekopp: If you could provide that, that would be great. (p.31)

M. Pierre Paul-Hus: Ma dernière question porte sur le plan de contingence à l'égard des repas, quel est le pourcentage actuel accordé aux repas? Quel est le pourcentage de la contingence? Est-ce 50 %?

Lgén Eric Kenny: Maintenant, c'est 20 %.

M. Pierre Paul-Hus: On nous dit qu'il y a eu un changement. Quel était le pourcentage précédemment?

Lgén Eric Kenny: Le changement a eu lieu en juin de cette année.

M. Pierre Paul-Hus: Et avant, c'était combien?

Lgén Eric Kenny: C'était 65 %. (p.35)

9. **Par rapport à la révision des procédures entamée par le bureau du protocole, pouvez-vous nous fournir les délais ainsi que les résultats de cette révision? / Regarding the process review undertaken by the Protocol Office, can you provide the committee with timelines as well as the result of that review?**

Mr. Brad Redekopp: Okay, thank you. One last question here for Mr. Wheeler. You mentioned that the protocol office was doing a review, you were going to have maybe some new procedures and some new policies, could you give us a little bit of a timeline on that, and then could you provide that review to the committee so we could see the results of that?

Mr. Stewart Wheeler: Yes, absolutely, Mr. Chair, I'm happy to take that on board.

We are constantly working together, and these people work together all the time. What we are asking our teams to do is to work in between the actual operational working on a specific visit to sit down to say what isn't working here, let's look at the numbers now that we see those line numbers and ask why this is part of the standard operating procedure. Nobody asks for this, why is that part of it? Can we eliminate that in the future? Can we decide that we're going to set up some flags so flags go up and then a question comes over and we make an alternate choice? That's what we're hoping, to instill that kind of rigour. I think we're hoping it will be an ongoing process and it isn't a one-stop review and then it's over, we want this to be the new practice.

Mr. Brad Redekopp: Can you provide that review to us, though?

The Chair: Sorry, it's not a bad question, if you could provide that, thank you. (p.32)

Global Affairs Canada and the Department of National Defence have formed a working group that meets before and after each of the Governor General and Prime Minister's visits involving the Canadian Forces Airbus. The working group's objective consists of ensuring mutual understanding and agreement of what meals must be served on each flight leg, the contingencies/overages that will be ordered and constantly reassessing standards of in-flight catering to ensure maximum value for money. The working group that has been established will now be an ongoing part of our operations to ensure that cost-consciousness permanently remains at the forefront of our planning. When costs are projected to be particularly high at a given destination, the working group adjusts the selection or standard of meal and accompaniments for cost-efficiency.

The working group is also tasked with ensuring that all catering orders reflect the actual needs of the travelling delegation and does not include any superfluous elements. The group will report to the Chief of Protocol as to specific decisions and cost savings identified for each visit.

One of the areas that together our teams identified was around the availability of choice of main course. Ordering enough meals of each option so that passengers have a choice is a challenging art of balancing service and overage (or waste). While the number of contingency meals ordered for each flight has been significantly reduced to 20% in recent years, we have decided to forego choice altogether and passengers are no longer being offered options, other than dietary restrictions such as a vegetarian meal.

Affaires mondiales Canada et le Ministère de la Défense nationale ont formé un groupe de travail qui se réunit avant et après chacune des visites de la gouverneure générale et du premier ministre impliquant l'Airbus des Forces canadiennes. L'objectif du groupe de travail consiste à assurer une compréhension et un accord mutuel sur les repas qui doivent être servis pour chaque segment de vol, sur les contingences/suppléments qui seront commandés et sur la réévaluation constante des normes de restauration en vol afin de garantir un rapport qualité-prix maximal. Le groupe de travail fera désormais partie intégrante de nos opérations afin de garantir que la sensibilisation aux coûts reste en permanence au premier plan de notre planification. Lorsqu'il est prévu que les coûts seront particulièrement élevés à une destination particulière, le groupe de travail ajuste la sélection ou la norme du repas et des accompagnements pour diminuer les coûts.

Le groupe de travail est également chargé de veiller à ce que toutes les commandes de restauration reflètent les besoins réels de la délégation en déplacement et n'incluent pas d'éléments superflus. Le groupe fera rapport au Chef du protocole des décisions spécifiques et des économies identifiées pour chaque visite.

L'un des éléments que nos équipes ont identifiés concerne la disponibilité du choix du plat principal. Commander suffisamment de repas pour chaque option afin que les passagers aient un choix est un art difficile qui consiste à trouver l'équilibre entre le service et le surplus (ou le gaspillage). Bien que le nombre de repas supplémentaires commandés pour chaque vol ait été considérablement réduit à 20 % ces dernières années, nous avons décidé de renoncer totalement au choix et les passagers ne se voient plus proposer d'options, hormis les restrictions alimentaires telles qu'un repas végétarien.

10. Quels sont les étapes entreprises par la Défense nationale et Affaires mondiales Canada pour adresser ces coûts? / What are the steps National Defence and Global Affairs Canada are taking to address the costs?

Mr. Kelly McCauley: We keep hearing, "Well, we're reviewing and reviewing". We've been reviewing for years. I don't have a lot of faith—and Mr. Johns was getting at it—it's actually going to get done. We hear a lot of reviewing. Would you be able to maybe put in writing to this committee actual firm steps you're taking to address the costs?

Mr. Stewart Wheeler: Absolutely. I think to answer your question around the style of meals, standard commercial airline practice meals is what we're ordering, in line with health and safety and travel regulations as the General mentioned, but we are looking at concrete savings and we'd be happy to make that available to the committee. (p.22)

Global Affairs Canada and the Department of National Defence have formed a working group that meets before and after each of the Governor General and Prime Minister's visits involving the Canadian Forces Airbus. The working group's objective consists of ensuring mutual understanding and agreement of what meals must be served on each flight leg, the contingencies/overages that will be ordered and constantly reassessing standards of in-flight catering to ensure maximum value for money. The working group that has been established will now be an ongoing part of our operations to ensure that cost-consciousness permanently remains at the forefront of our planning. When costs are projected to be particularly high at a given destination, the working group adjusts the selection or standard of meal and accompaniments for cost-efficiency.

The working group is also tasked with ensuring that all catering orders reflect the actual needs of the travelling delegation and does not include any superfluous elements. The group will report to the Chief of Protocol as to specific decisions and cost savings identified for each visit.

One of the areas that together our teams identified was around the availability of choice of main course. Ordering enough meals of each option so that passengers have a choice is a challenging art of balancing service and overage (or waste). While the number of contingency meals ordered for each flight has been significantly reduced to 20% in recent years, we have decided to forego choice altogether and passengers are

no longer being offered options, other than dietary restrictions such as a vegetarian meal.

Affaires mondiales Canada et le Ministère de la Défense nationale ont formé un groupe de travail qui se réunit avant et après chacune des visites de la gouverneure générale et du premier ministre impliquant l'Airbus des Forces canadiennes. L'objectif du groupe de travail consiste à assurer une compréhension et un accord mutuel sur les repas qui doivent être servis pour chaque segment de vol, sur les contingences/suppléments qui seront commandés et sur la réévaluation constante des normes de restauration en vol afin de garantir un rapport qualité-prix maximal. Le groupe de travail fera désormais partie intégrante de nos opérations afin de garantir que la sensibilisation aux coûts reste en permanence au premier plan de notre planification. Lorsqu'il est prévu que les coûts seront particulièrement élevés à une destination particulière, le groupe de travail ajuste la sélection ou la norme du repas et des accompagnements pour diminuer les coûts.

Le groupe de travail est également chargé de veiller à ce que toutes les commandes de restauration reflètent les besoins réels de la délégation en déplacement et n'incluent pas d'éléments superflus. Le groupe fera rapport au Chef du protocole des décisions spécifiques et des économies identifiées pour chaque visite.

L'un des éléments que nos équipes ont identifiés concerne la disponibilité du choix du plat principal. Commander suffisamment de repas pour chaque option afin que les passagers aient un choix est un art difficile qui consiste à trouver l'équilibre entre le service et le surplus (ou le gaspillage). Bien que le nombre de repas supplémentaires commandés pour chaque vol ait été considérablement réduit à 20 % ces dernières années, nous avons décidé de renoncer totalement au choix et les passagers ne se voient plus proposer d'options, hormis les restrictions alimentaires telles qu'un repas végétarien.

11. **La semaine précédant le voyage de la gouverneure générale au Moyen-Orient, le premier ministre et la vice-première ministre ont entrepris un voyage à Londres et en Pologne, et les coûts étaient les 2/3, même avec 50% plus de personnes à bord. Comment peut-on expliquer un si grosse difference? / The previous week, the PM Deputy PM and 58 other people went on a trip to London, Poland, and the cost was about 2/3 with about 50% more travelling. How do we end up with such a massive discrepancy?**

Mr. Kelly McCauley: The previous week, to the GG's trip to the Middle East, the Prime Minister, the Deputy Prime Minister and 58 other people went on a trip to London, Poland, various stops, eight stops, 60 people and the cost was about two-thirds, so we had about 50% more travelling and yet two-thirds less cost for that trip for catering.

How do we end up with such a massive discrepancy between caring for the Prime Minister—so it's not like it's 60 members of OGGO, you know, we're talking top echelon—how do we end up with such a massive difference?

LGen Eric Kenny: Thank you for the question, Mr. Chair. I don't have the specifics of those costs with me.

Mr. Kelly McCauley: It's on the same order paper. Maybe you can let us know. (p.23)

Appendix A – In-Flight Menus for Visit to United Arab Emirates, State of Qatar and State of Kuwait - March 16 to 23, 2022

Flight Leg	Flight duration	# of Meals	Menu items	# Pax	# Crew
<p>#1 Ottawa (YOW) to Stansted (EGSS)</p> <p><i>Catering from: Ottawa</i></p>	<p>Wednesday, March 16</p> <p><u>Flight duration:</u> 6 hrs 45 min</p> <p><i>(Departure: 2000 hrs / Arrival: 0645 hrs (March 17) Time change: +4hrs)</i></p> <p><i>Refuel time: 1 hour 30 minutes</i></p>	2	<p><u>Dinner</u> Mediterranean Grilled Vegetable, Chickpea and Feta Salad -- Butter Chicken Tikka Masala Cauliflower Rice Steamed Zucchini</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Apple and Cranberry Stuffed Pork Tenderloin Maple Gravy Oven Roasted Squash and Sautéed Brussels Sprouts -- Nanaimo Bar -----</p> <p><u>Light Breakfast</u> Selection of Artisan Meat and Cheese, sliced melon, yogurt, croissant</p>	24	12
<p>#2 Stansted (EGSS) to Dubai (OMDW)</p>	<p>Thursday, March 17</p> <p><u>Flight duration:</u> 7 hrs 15 min</p> <p><i>(Departure: 0815 / Arrival: 1930 hrs Time change: +4hrs)</i></p>	2	<p><u>Breakfast</u> Fresh Fruit Yogurt Parfait Cranberry Orange Muffin -- Omelette with Boursin Cheese, Sundried Tomatoes and Chives Grilled Artisan Pork Sausages Sautéed Button Mushrooms</p> <p>OR</p>	29	17

			<p>French Crepes with Sweet Caramelized Peaches Potato Rösti Turkey Bacon -----</p> <p><u>Dinner</u> Caprese Salad Balsamic Vinaigrette -- Pan-fried Chicken Scallopini on Fettuccini Creamy Mushroom Wine Sauce with Capers Steamed Asparagus and Grilled Red Peppers</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Beef Wellington with Red Wine Jus Roasted Potatoes with Rosemary and Garlic Glazed Baby Carrots -- Red Velvet Cake Red Berries and Chantilly Cream</p>		
<p>#3 Dubai (OMDW) to Doha, Qatar (OTBD)</p>	<p>Sunday, March 20</p> <p><u>Flight duration:</u> 1 hrs 15 min</p> <p><i>(Departure: 1115 hrs / Arrival: 1230 hrs Time change: -1hr)</i></p>	1	<p><u>Boxed lunch and Plated Lunch (cabin)</u> Wild Rice and Arugula Salad Cucumber, Cranberries, Almonds, Spring Onion and Mint Lemon Vinaigrette -- Roasted Mediterranean Vegetable Wrap Hummus</p> <p>OR</p> <p>Smoked Turkey with Cucumber on Whole Wheat Mustard and Mayonnaise</p>	29	17

			-- Apple Crumble		
#4 Doha, Qatar (OTBD) to Kuwait City (OKBK)	Tuesday, March 22 <u>Flight duration:</u> 1 hr 20 min <i>(Departure: 0830 hrs / Arrival: 0950 hrs)</i>	1	<u>Cold Breakfast Box</u> Fresh Cut Fruit Croissant -- Greek Yogurt Breakfast Bowl Fresh Berries, Bananas, Chia Seeds and Honey OR Bagel with Smoked Salmon, Avocado, Cream Cheese	30	17
#5a Kuwait City (OKBK) to Stansted (EGSS)	Wednesday, March 23 <u>Flight duration:</u> 7 hrs 30 min <i>(Departure: 1330 hrs / Arrival: 1800 hrs Time change: -3hrs)</i> <i>Refuel time:</i> 1 hour 30 minutes	2	<u>Lunch</u> Spinach, Apple and Goat Cheese Salad Pear Vinaigrette -- Grilled Fresh Salmon with Lemon Butter Sauce Herb Infused Polenta Broiled Green Beans OR Vegetable Stew with a Tomato Sauce Egg Noodles Grilled Fresh Mushrooms -- White Chocolate Pistachio Cake ----- <u>Snack</u> Assorted Meats and Cheeses with crackers	27	17

#5b Stansted (EGSS) to Ottawa (YOW)	Wednesday, March 23	2	<u>Dinner</u> Rainbow Quinoa, Roasted Beetroot and Cucumber Olive Oil and Apple Cider Vinaigrette -- Green Thai Chicken Curry Fragrant Jasmine Rice Stir Fried Mixed Pepper Medley OR Beef Steak and Mushroom Pie Parisienne Potatoes Roasted Carrot and Grilled Zucchini -- Sticky Toffee Pudding -----	27	14 +17 deadhead
	<u>Flight duration:</u> 7 hrs 40 min (Departure: 1930 hrs / Arrival: 2310 hrs Time change: -4hrs)		<u>Snack</u> Veggies and hummus		

Wine	Quantity	Cost/unit	Cost
Mission Hill Family Estate Reserve Merlot, British Columbia 2018	4	\$10.50	\$42.00
Rosehall Run Vineyards JCR Chardonnay, Ontario 2017	9	\$17.05	\$153.45
Le Clos Jordanne Le Grand Clos Pinot Noir, Ontario 2017	4	\$28.00	\$112.00
Rust Wine Company Gamay, British Columbia, 2019	2	\$12.00	\$24.00
Sub-total	19		\$331.45

Beer		Quantity	Cost/unit	Cost
Beau's Local Organic Ale, 473 ml		3	\$3.85	\$11.55
Moosehead Lager, 473 ml		4	\$2.39	\$9.56
SteamWhistle Pilsner, 473 ml		6	\$3.16	\$18.96
Beau's Local Organic Ale, 473 ml		2	\$3.95	\$7.90
Sub-total		15		\$47.97
Total				\$379.42