

WOMEN'S ECONOMIC SECURITY: SECURING THE FUTURE OF CANADA'S ECONOMY

Report of the Standing Committee on the Status of Women

Karen Vecchio, Chair



JUNE 2018 42nd PARLIAMENT, 1st SESSION Published under the authority of the Speaker of the House of Commons

SPEAKER'S PERMISSION

The proceedings of the House of Commons and its Committees are hereby made available to provide greater public access. The parliamentary privilege of the House of Commons to control the publication and broadcast of the proceedings of the House of Commons and its Committees is nonetheless reserved. All copyrights therein are also reserved.

Reproduction of the proceedings of the House of Commons and its Committees, in whole or in part and in any medium, is hereby permitted provided that the reproduction is accurate and is not presented as official. This permission does not extend to reproduction, distribution or use for commercial purpose of financial gain. Reproduction or use outside this permission or without authorization may be treated as copyright infringement in accordance with the *Copyright Act*. Authorization may be obtained on written application to the Office of the Speaker of the House of Commons.

Reproduction in accordance with this permission does not constitute publication under the authority of the House of Commons. The absolute privilege that applies to the proceedings of the House of Commons does not extend to these permitted reproductions. Where a reproduction includes briefs to a Standing Committee of the House of Commons, authorization for reproduction may be required from the authors in accordance with the *Copyright Act*.

Nothing in this permission abrogates or derogates from the privileges, powers, immunities and rights of the House of Commons and its Committees. For greater certainty, this permission does not affect the prohibition against impeaching or questioning the proceedings of the House of Commons in courts or otherwise. The House of Commons retains the right and privilege to find users in contempt of Parliament if a reproduction or use is not in accordance with this permission.

Also available on the House of Commons website at the following address: www.ourcommons.ca

WOMEN'S ECONOMIC SECURITY: SECURING THE FUTURE OF CANADA'S ECONOMY

Report of the Standing Committee on the Status of Women

Karen Vecchio Chair

JUNE 2018
42nd PARLIAMENT, 1st SESSION

NOTICE TO READER
Reports from committees presented to the House of Commons
Presenting a report to the House is the way a committee makes public its findings and recommendations on a particular topic. Substantive reports on a subject-matter study usually contain a synopsis of the testimony heard, the recommendations made by the committee, as well as the reasons for those recommendations.

STANDING COMMITTEE ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN

CHAIR

Karen Vecchio

VICE-CHAIRS

Pam Damoff

Sheila Malcolmson

MEMBERS

Terry Duguid* Stephanie Kusie

Sean Fraser Emmanuella Lambropoulos

Rachael Harder Eva Nassif

Bernadette Jordan Marc Serré

^{*} Non-voting member, pursuant to Standing Order 104(5).

OTHER MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT WHO PARTICIPATED

John Aldag	Greg Fergus	James Maloney
John Barlow	Peter Fonseca	Irene Mathyssen
Bob Benzen	Colin Fraser	Christine Moore
Luc Berthold	Hon. Hedy Fry	Joe Peschisolido
Daniel Blaikie	Mark Gerretsen	Tracey Ramsey
Rachel Blaney	Marilyn Gladu	Randeep Sarai
Sylvie Boucher	Gudie Hutchings	Jamie Schmale
Shaun Chen	Gord Johns	Martin Shields
Julie Dabrusin	Jenny Kwan	Bev Shipley
Sukh Dhaliwal	Paul Lefebvre	Sonia Sidhu
Nicola Di Iorio	Michael Levitt	Anita Vandenbeld
Earl Dreeshen	Wayne Long	Mark Warawa
Fayçal El-Khoury	Karen Ludwig	Kevin Waugh
Ted Falk	Tom Lukiwski	Kate Young

CLERK OF THE COMMITTEE

Kenza Gamassi

LIBRARY OF PARLIAMENT

Parliamentary Information and Research Service

Clare Annett

Dominique Montpetit

Laura Munn-Rivard

THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN

has the honour to present its

TWELFTH REPORT

Pursuant to its mandate under Standing Order 108(2), the Committee has studied the economic security of women and has agreed to report the following:

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SUMMARY		1
LIST OF RECO	DMMENDATIONS	3
INTRODUCTI	ON	19
FACTORS CO	NTRIBUTING TO WOMEN'S ECONOMIC INSECURITY	22
A. SYSTE	EMIC AND STRUCTURAL BARRIERS IN THE ECONOMIC SYSTEM	23
B. BIAS,	DISCRIMINATION AND SEXISM AGAINST WOMEN	25
C. GEND	ER-BASED HARASSMENT AND VIOLENCE	26
1. In	timate Partner Violence	27
2. Ge	nder-Based Harassment and Violence in the Workplace	29
D. THE G	ENDER WAGE GAP	31
1. Ov	verview of the Gender Wage Gap	31
2. Fa	ctors Contributing to the Gender Wage Gap	33
3. Me	easures to Address the Gender Wage Gap	37
E. LACK	OF INVESTMENT IN SOCIAL INFRASTRUCTURE	38
1. La	ck of Access to Affordable Housing	40
2. Ch	allenges with Transportation	43
F. INCRE	EASING PRECARIOUS AND PART-TIME EMPLOYMENT	45
1. Pa	rt-Time Employment	45
2. Pr	ecarious Employment	46
G. SHOR	TAGE OF COMPREHENSIVE SUPPORT SERVICES	50
1. Ac	cess to Justice and Legal Aid	51
H. UNPA	ID WORK	54
1. Ge	nder and the Division of Unpaid Work	55
2. Im	pact of Unpaid Care Work on Women's Economic Security	57
3. Re	cognizing the Value of Unpaid Work	60

	4.	Ca	ring for Family Members	62
		a.	Caring for Elders	62
		b.	Caring for Children	64
		c.	Caring for Family Members and Children Living with Disabilities	64
I.	W	OM	EN AT RISK OF ECONOMIC INSECURITY	68
	1.	Ind	digenous Women	69
		a.	Colonization and Racism	70
		b.	Violence against Indigenous Women	71
		c.	Education and Childcare	72
		d.	Employment and Training Programs for Indigenous Women	74
	2.	W	omen in Rural and Remote Communities	75
	3.	Sir	ngle Mothers	76
	4.	Im	migrant and Refugee Women	77
		a.	Challenges to Economic Security of Immigrant and Refugee Women	78
		b.	Immigrant and Refugee Sponsorship	81
	5.	W	omen Living with Disabilities	83
		a.	Women Living with Disabilities in the Workplace	84
		b.	Employment Support for Women Living with Disabilities	86
	6.	Elo	derly Women	88
INCR	EAS	ING	WOMEN'S ECONOMIC SECURITY	90
A.	CH	IILD	OCARE	90
	1.	Но	ow Women Benefit from Access to Childcare	92
	2.	Fe	deral Leadership on Childcare	94
	3.	Ke	y Elements of a Canadian Childcare Framework	96
B.	EN	1PL	OYMENT INSURANCE — REGULAR BENEFITS	.100
	1.	Ov	verview of Employment Insurance in Canada	.100
	2.	Su	ggested Changes to Employment Insurance	.101

C.	SPECIAL BENEFITS)	105
	1. Dedicated Parental Leave for a Second Parent	108
	2. Eligibility Requirements, Wage Replacement and Other Features of Federal Parental Leave	112
D.	PAY EQUITY	114
E.	WOMEN'S ACCESS TO EDUCATION	119
	1. An Overview of Women's Access to Education	119
	2. Barriers to Women's Access to Education	120
	3. Federal Grant and Loan Programs for Students	121
F.	INITIATIVES TO PROTECT INCOME SECURITY	124
	1. Overview of Initiatives to Protect Income Security	124
	2. Minimum Wage	124
	3. A Living Wage	125
	4. Universal Basic Income	126
	5. Working Income Tax Benefit	127
G.	RETIREMENT AND PENSION SECURITY	128
	1. An Overview of Retirement and Pension Security	128
	2. Canada Pension Plan	133
	3. The Federal Old Age Security and Guaranteed Income Supplement	134
Н.	TOOLS FOR GENDER-SENSITIVE ECONOMIC POLICY-MAKING	135
	1. National Efforts to Promote Gender Equality	135
	2. Collection and Dissemination of Disaggregated Data	135
	3. The Application of Gender-Based Analysis Plus	137
INCRE	EASING WOMEN'S ECONOMIC LEADERSHIP	141
A.	WORKPLACE POLICIES FOR WOMEN	141
B.	WOMEN IN TRADITIONALLY MALE-DOMINATED PROFESSIONS	146
	Women in Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields	148

		a.	Overview of Women in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields	148
		b.	Advantages of Increasing Women's Employment in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields	
		c.	Economic Benefits of Employment in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields	151
		d.	Challenges to the Recruitment and Retention of Women in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields	153
		e.	Solutions for Addressing Women's Under-representation in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields	160
	2.	W	omen as Entrepreneurs	166
		a.	Overview of the Women as Entrepreneurs	166
		b.	Challenges for Women as Entrepreneurs	167
		c.	Solutions to Increase Women's Representation as Entrepreneurs	171
		d.	Access to Procurement Contracts	175
	3.	W	omen in Academia	176
		a.	Challenges to the Retention and Advancement of Women in Academia	177
		b.	Solutions to Increase Women in Academia	179
		c.	Federal Government Research Programs	180
			(i) Canada Research Chairs Program	180
			(ii) Canada Excellence Research Chairs Program	182
			(iii) The Three Federal Research Granting Agencies	183
C.	W	OMI	EN IN SENIOR MANAGEMENT POSITIONS	184
	1.		ctors Contributing to Women's Under-representation in Senior inagement Positions	184
	2.	Th	e Importance of Gender-Diverse Management Teams	185
	3.		e Retention and Promotion of Women in Senior Management sitions	186

D. WOMEN ON CORPORATE BOARDS	187
1. Benefits of Gender-Diverse Corporate Boards	188
Strategies to Increase Women's Representation on Corporate Boards	190
a. The Comply-or-Explain Model	190
b. Gender Quotas	192
c. Other Strategies	195
E. ROLE MODELS, MENTORING AND SPONSORSHIP	197
1. The Importance of Role Models	197
2. Mentorship and Sponsorship Programs	199
F. THE ROLE OF MEN AND BOYS	201
Appendix A: List of Witnesses	
Appendix B: List of Briefs	217
Request for Government Response	223
Dissenting Opinion of the Conservative Party of Canada	225
Supplementary Opinion of the New Democratic Party of Canada	231

Over the past half a century, the economic security and participation of women in the Canadian economy has undergone an incredible transformation. Women's workforce participation increased steadily, from around 24% in 1953 to 76% in 1990. By 2016, women made up approximately 47.3% of the Canadian labour force. While this evolution has been advantageous to Canadian women and to the economy as a whole, there remain significant challenges to women's full and equal participation in the Canadian economy. Improving women's economic security is essential as it contributes significantly to the maintenance and growth of the Canadian economy.

For this reason, the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women (the Committee) agreed on 14 November 2016 to undertake a study on the economic security of women in Canada. The Committee held 22 meetings from 2 February to 9 November 2017 and received testimony from 108 witnesses, 19 of whom appeared as individuals, and the remainder representing 69 organizations. As well, the Committee was briefed by officials from 11 government departments and agencies. In addition, the Committee received written briefs from a number of organizations, along with written speaking notes and follow-up responses to questions from the Committee members.

Throughout the hearings, the Committee was told about both the progress made and the challenges remaining regarding women's economic security and economic leadership in Canada. Specifically, the key themes that emerged during the course of the study were:

- 1) factors contributing to women's economic insecurity;
- 2) measures to increase women's economic security; and
- 3) measures to increase women's economic leadership.

Factors contributing to women's economic insecurity are numerous and include systemic and structural barriers in the economy; bias, discrimination and sexism; gender-based harassment and violence; the gender wage gap; a lack of investment in social infrastructure; precarious and part-time employment; insufficient comprehensive support services; and the burden and effects of unpaid work. The Committee recognizes that while these factors may affect all women, certain women are particularly at risk of economic insecurity, for instance Indigenous women, women living in rural and remote

communities, single mothers, immigrant and refugee women, women living with disabilities, and elderly women.

Witnesses identified a variety of potential measures to help increase women's economic security and economic leadership. Regarding women's economic security, the Committee agreed with witnesses that measures related to improving childcare, Employment Insurance, maternity and parental leave, pay equity, access to education, income security, retirement and pension security, and gender-sensitive economic policymaking, are recommended for increasing women's economic security.

Other measures that the Committee believes can have a positive influence on women's economic leadership include implementing workplace policies for women, and increasing women's representation in traditionally male-dominated professions, in senior management positions and on corporate boards.

The Committee intends this report to provide guidance to the federal government on efforts and initiatives that can be implemented to improve women's economic security. The 86 recommendations presented in this study provide a path towards achieving full equality for women through improving women's economic security and participation in Canada.

LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS

As a result of their deliberations, committees may make recommendations which they include in their reports for the consideration of the House of Commons or the Government. Recommendations related to this study are listed below.

That the Government of Canada develop an official definition of poverty, incorporating both qualitative and quantitative measures, to be used across all federal government departments and projects25
Recommendation 2
That the Government of Canada, in consultation with relevant stakeholders, immediately introduce legislation to modify the <i>Canada Labour Code</i> to implement paid leave for victims of intimate partner violence
Recommendation 3
That the Government of Canada, immediately and on an ongoing basis, invest in programs to address violence against women, in which federal spending is delivered to service providers
Recommendation 4
That the Government of Canada develop and implement a public education campaign to raise awareness of bias, discrimination, and sexism faced by women in the workforce, with the goal of changing societal attitudes
Recommendation 5
That the Government of Canada develop and deliver an awareness campaign targeted to employers that is designed to improve awareness of gender-sensitive workplace policies
Recommendation 6
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with provinces and territories, implement workforce practices that will create equitable working environments, free from harassment and discrimination

Recommendation 7
That the Government of Canada implement workforce practices in federally regulated workplaces to prevent harassment and discrimination
Recommendation 8
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with provinces and territories, increase funding for initiatives focused on reducing violence and harassment against women in the workplace
Recommendation 9
That the Government of Canada study the factors that contribute to the gender wage gap, including – but not limited to – women's chosen field of work, level of education, the decision between part-time or full-time work, and the use of family benefit programs
Recommendation 10
That the Government of Canada fund initiatives for employers and employees that: 1) raise awareness of the existence of the gender wage gap; 2) provide training to counter some of the root causes of the gender wage gap, such as the effect of unconscious biases and stereotypes on hiring, salary negotiations and promotion processes; and 3) provide guidance on the implementation of measures to address the gender wage gap, such as the use of internally defined salary bands by businesses.
Recommendation 11
That the Government of Canada table legislation to realize the right to housing in Canada, in accordance with its international obligations, and invest without delay, through the National Housing Strategy, in affordable housing to address the housing affordability crisis
Recommendation 12
That the Government of Canada, immediately and on an ongoing basis, provide funding for social infrastructure – facilities and services that assist individuals and families to meet their social needs – in order to provide benefits to women who work in and rely on these sectors

Recommendation 13
That the Government of Canada expand the eligibility requirements of the Public Transit Infrastructure Fund to include not-for-profit and non-governmental community transit organizations, where municipally funded transportation services are not available
Recommendation 14
That the Government of Canada, immediately and on an ongoing basis, increase investment in public transportation that will ensure affordable, accessible, frequent and safe transit services for women
Recommendation 15
That the Government of Canada commit to ending the practice of providing stipends for individuals living with disabilities to perform work, which has the effect of compensating these individuals at a lower rate than the minimum wage established in each province and territory, and to creating meaningful employment and opportunities for individuals living with disabilities
Recommendation 16
That the Government of Canada end the practice of unpaid internships in the federally regulated sector, and that it replace any existing unpaid internship placements under its jurisdiction with paid internship opportunities
Recommendation 17
That the Government of Canada develop a mechanism to: 1) assess the quality and success of federally funded projects; and 2) enable the extension of funding for projects that are deemed to be successful
Recommendation 18

That the Government of Canada, immediately and on an ongoing basis, provide secure multi-year operational funding to women's organizations and front-line

community groups to ensure they can meet the growing demand for services. 51

Recommendation 19
That the Government of Canada, in the Canada Social Transfer, earmark funds for civil legal aid to ensure that women have access to justice in all jurisdictions, with a particular focus on legal aid for female survivors of violence, Indigenous women and women living with disabilities
Recommendation 20
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, ensure that the Legal Aid Program is responding to the demands of economically vulnerable persons for legal aid
Recommendation 21
That the Government of Canada consider changing the non-refundable Family Caregiver Tax Credit into a non-taxable Family Caregiver Benefit
Recommendation 22
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with provinces and territories, increase financial support to community organizations and community-based projects that provide services to adults living with disabilities and their families
Recommendation 23
That the Government of Canada support the continuation of the Indigenous Friendship Centre Program to facilitate Indigenous women's equitable participation in the Canadian economy
Recommendation 24
That the Government of Canada provide funding for employment programs and services geared specifically to Indigenous women

That the Government of Canada, in partnership with Indigenous peoples and communities, study and seek to improve the socio-economic conditions of the Indigenous population, with specific attention paid to: 1) improving access to quality health services, including mental health services; 2) increasing educational opportunities at both the secondary and post-secondary level; and 3) improving Indigenous women's economic participation and economic security.
Recommendation 26
That the Government of Canada, when renewing all departmental programs and funding streams focused on the economic well-being of Indigenous peoples and communities, use evidence-based policy development approaches that incorporate information on urban Indigenous populations; approaches that demonstrate success in service delivery; and ensure the equitable delivery of services for all Indigenous people
Recommendation 27
That the Government of Canada, in partnership with Indigenous peoples and communities and in collaboration with the National Aboriginal Capital Corporations Association, fund Aboriginal Financial Institutions to provide training on financial literacy, financial management, and how to start a business, and that this training be offered to Indigenous peoples, regardless of where they live. 75
Recommendation 28
That the Government of Canada consider the distinctive context of rural and remote communities when implementing policies and programs, with the goal of responding to the unique challenges faced by women living in these communities
Recommendation 29
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, and in consultation with relevant not-for-profit organizations, increase its funding to subsidized language training, including accompanying childcare services, for immigrant and refugee women

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and	
territories, and in consultation with relevant not-for-profit organizations,	
examine the best practices in place in other Canadian jurisdictions, in order to	
implement customized programs for the integration of economic class	
immigrants, and that these programs respond to the needs of women in every	
region where resettlement services are already offered	82

Recommendation 31

Recommendation 32

Recommendation 33

Recommendation 34

That the Government of Canada develop and fund a program to provide small- and medium-sized enterprises with financial support to 1) install physical infrastructure to increase accessibility in the workplace for employees living with disabilities; and 2) develop and implement workplace policies and practices designed to accommodate employees living with disabilities
Recommendation 36
That the Government of Canada provide funding to community organizations to support programs that work to increase employment rates among women living with disabilities
Recommendation 37
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, ensure that all childcare investments are accompanied by reporting mechanisms and indicators for long-term data collection that will provide all levels of government with appropriate forecasting and analysis tools to improve childcare services, with the goal of achieving high-quality, universal, accessible, flexible, affordable and inclusive childcare
Recommendation 38
That the Government of Canada, when investing in childcare, recognize the specific and unique needs of: children in rural, remote, northern and urban communities; children from low-income families; children from single-parent families; children of different cultural backgrounds, including new immigrants; children with different abilities; and Indigenous children
Recommendation 39
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, provide childcare options, including care in the home, for parents working irregular hours and shift work
Recommendation 40
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, collect national data about the availability of subsidized childcare on post-secondary education institutions' campuses

Recommendation 41
That the Government of Canada apply gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) to the federal Employment Insurance program and update any Employment Insurance requirements to improve access for precarious, seasonal, and low-wage workers
Recommendation 42
That the Government of Canada immediately establish, in the federal jurisdiction, dedicated parental leave for the second parent in the style of "use it or lose it" in order to encourage the sharing between parents of care responsibilities and leave from the workplace
Recommendation 43
That the Government of Canada examine domestic and international parental leave best practices, with the goal of promoting the equitable sharing of child-rearing responsibilities between men and women and increasing men's participation in childcare
Recommendation 44
That the Government of Canada adopt all of the recommendations found in the 2016 House of Commons Special Committee on the Pay Equity report entitled It's Time to Act
Recommendation 45
That the Government of Canada request that at the next meeting of Canada's Federal, Provincial and Territorial Ministers responsible for labour, the Minister of Employment, Workforce Development and Labour urge all jurisdictions to consider implementing proactive pay equity legislation
Recommendation 46

That the Government of Canada immediately implement proactive federal pay

appropriately funded. 118

equity legislation and that the implementation of this legislation be

Recommendation 47
That the Government of Canada conduct a gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) of federal grant and loan programs available to post-secondary students, including the Canada Student Grant for Full-Time Students, the Canada Student Loans, and the Repayment Assistance Plan
Recommendation 48
That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, examine the possibility of introducing a national universal basic income
Recommendation 49
That the Government of Canada raise awareness among Canadians of the eligibility requirements and the benefits available with the Working Income Tax Benefit
Recommendation 50
That the Government of Canada amend the Working Income Tax Benefit eligibility in a way that the tax benefit is awarded and income is assessed based on the individual, rather than a couple or household
Recommendation 51
That the Government of Canada immediately include or expand the caregiving and disability drop-out provisions in the Canada Pension Plan
Recommendation 52
That the Government of Canada, recognizing that unpaid work is disproportionately undertaken by women, 1) examine international best practices in the collection of data on unpaid work; and 2) include a question in the 2021 long form census on the allocation of time for household activities,

with the goal of measuring unpaid work...... 137

That the Government of Canada implement gender equity provisions in the terms and conditions for all projects and programs that receive federal funding; and that if the evaluation of these projects deems the equity provisions inadequate, or to include bias, discrimination, or sexism towards women, then funding may be suspended or removed until a minimum standard of gender equity is achieved.	139
Recommendation 54	
That the Government of Canada, recognizing the importance of applying gender-based analysis plus (GBA+), maintain its commitment to conducting GBA+ assessments on all programs and policy decisions taken by federal government departments	139
Recommendation 55	
That the Government of Canada conduct gender-responsive budgeting to ensure that the needs of diverse groups of women, men and gender-diverse people are reflected in the government's fiscal, social and economic policies	139
Recommendation 56	
That the Government of Canada, in the development of its Poverty Reduction Strategy, apply a gender-based analysis plus (GBA+), employ a human rights-based approach, and include a focus on responding to the needs of marginalized groups.	140
Recommendation 57	
That the Government of Canada, in partnership with civil society, the private sector and labour organizations, work to implement flexible and family-friendly work arrangements designed to recruit, retain and advance women in the workplace.	146
Recommendation 58	
That the Government of Canada repeal changes to the Federal Contractors Program made in 2013, and examine ways to improve the Legislated Employment Equity Program	146

That the Government of Canada fund initiatives that raise awareness among girls and young women of the opportunities presented by all career paths, including in traditionally male-dominated professions, with the goal of ensuring that all economic opportunities are available to them
Recommendation 60
That the Government of Canada implement gender equity provisions in future international trade agreements
Recommendation 61
That the Government of Canada, when setting priorities for Canada Summer Job allocations, include as one priority the promotion of jobs for young women in traditionally male-dominated fields
Recommendation 62
That the Government of Canada decline to support conferences and events both nationally and internationally that do not include women on panels and as speakers and experts
Recommendation 63
That the Government of Canada create a task force, in partnership with relevant private sector stakeholders, to develop and share best business practices and resources designed to advance women's careers in their chosen fields, with a particular focus on the advancement and retention of women in traditionally male-dominated sectors.
Recommendation 64
That the Government of Canada conduct research on the reasons and possible solutions for women's under-representation in the skilled trades and in science, technology, engineering and mathematics fields

That the Government of Canada fund and support projects that provide education and immersive experiences for women and girls in traditionally male-dominated fields, such as the skilled trades and science, technology, engineering and mathematics fields
Recommendation 66
That the Government of Canada establish a coordinated national approach to support female entrepreneurs through dedicated funds to local organizations that fill gaps of economic and entrepreneurial development and increase access to centralized knowledge hubs
Recommendation 67
That the Government of Canada work with the Business Development Bank of Canada to highlight to private venture capital firms the benefits of investing in female entrepreneurship
Recommendation 68
That the Government of Canada apply a gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) to the recipients of federal grants and loans for entrepreneurs to ensure that all genders benefit equally from this financial support
Recommendation 69
That the Government of Canada fund and promote initiatives that deliver networking and mentorship opportunities to female entrepreneurs
Recommendation 70
The Government of Canada, in consultation with the provinces and territories, ensure that infrastructure projects funded by the federal government include provisions that require companies working on projects to seek to achieve and maintain a workforce that is representative of the Canadian workforce, including members of the four designated groups – women, Aboriginal peoples, persons with disabilities and members of visible minorities – under the Employment Equity Act.

Recommendation 71	
That the Government of Canada collaborate with Crown corporations to invest in women's entrepreneurship, including in programs for female entrepreneurs living in rural and remote communities.	174
Recommendation 72	
That the Government of Canada ensure that Crown corporations apply genderbased analysis plus (GBA+) to any procurement policies and contracts	174
Recommendation 73	
That the Government of Canada encourage the provinces and territories, as well as municipalities and local governments, to apply gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) to all infrastructure projects.	175
Recommendation 74	
That the Government of Canada ensure that gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) is applied to each Request for Proposal developed by federal government departments.	176
Recommendation 75	
That the Government of Canada eliminate the barriers facing female-owned small- and medium-sized enterprises when bidding on federally issued procurement projects, including altering the design and criteria of contracts to increase bidding access for small- and medium-sized enterprises	176
Recommendation 76	
That the Government of Canada support female researchers and academics by increasing funding opportunities in traditionally female-dominated disciplines	179
Recommendation 77	
That the Government of Canada recognize the importance of empowering female researchers and academics, and increase access to research funding for emerging and established female researchers and academics in traditionally	170

That the Government of Canada conduct a gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) of all federal government research programs, including the Canada Research Chairs Program and the Canada Excellence Research Chairs Program, and implement solutions to address any under-representation among chairholders of four designated groups: women, persons living with disabilities, Indigenous peoples, and members of visible minorities
Recommendation 79
That the Government of Canada examine the reasons and possible solutions to women's under-representation in senior management positions
Recommendation 80
That the Government of Canada gather data and evidence of the financial benefits of having a gender-diverse board of directors, and disseminate this data and evidence to private sector companies
Recommendation 81
That the Government of Canada take the following actions: 1) measure on an annual basis the effectiveness of the comply or explain model outlined in the Act to amend the Canada Business Corporations Act, the Canada Cooperatives Act, the Canada Not-for-profit Corporations Act and the Competition Act in increasing women's representation on corporate boards in Canada; 2) make any data collected through this process publicly available; 3) conduct a review three years after the passage of the Act to determine whether the comply or explain model has been successful; and 4) consider implementing, if the model is deemed to be unsuccessful, alternative measures to increase women's representation on corporate boards based on international best practices, including both quotas and targets.
Recommendation 82
That the Government of Canada increase investments in organizations and programs that champion the advancement of women in all workplaces through greater access to networking, mentorship and training

Recommendation 83	
That the Government of Canada, in consultation with the private sector, develop initiatives designed to increase the mentoring, sponsoring and championing of women in the workplace.	201
Recommendation 84	
That the Government of Canada work with the provinces and territories as well as private sector stakeholders to encourage male leaders to sponsor and mentor women in the workplace	204
Recommendation 85	
That the Government of Canada continue to support and fund community organizations that are leading public education campaigns that address "toxic masculinity," that counter the negative myths associated with gender norms, that refute gender stereotypes within the post-secondary education sector and labour force, and that promote gender equality, and that the Government of Canada issue a call for proposals for projects that seek to engage men and boys as allies in the fight for gender equality.	204
Recommendation 86	
That the Government of Canada study international best practices to engage male civil society leaders to advocate on behalf of gender equality	204



INTRODUCTION

Over the past half a century, the economic security and participation of women in the Canadian economy has undergone a transformation. Women's workforce participation increased steadily, from around 24% in 1953 to 76% in 1990. By 2016, women made up approximately 47.3% of the Canadian labour force. While this evolution has been advantageous to Canadian women and to the economy as a whole, there remain significant challenges to women's full and equal participation in the Canadian economy.

The House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women (the Committee) agreed on 14 November 2016 to conduct a study on the economic security and participation of women in the Canadian economy with the goal of examining these ongoing challenges. The Committee adopted the following motion:

That, pursuant to Standing Order 108(2), the Committee study the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy; and that the study:

- a) include an examination of the higher incidence of poverty among women and the factors which contribute to it;
- b) consider the impact of federal income security programs such as Employment Insurance and the Working Income Tax Benefit on women;
- c) identify the impact of part-time, unpaid care work, and precarious work on women's economic security;
- d) identify the problems affecting women's income, including gender pay gap, occupational segregation, lack of access to key growth sectors;
- e) identify possible tools to strengthen women's economic security including government programs and support parental leave and childcare;
- f) examine ways to increase women's entry, participation, retention and representation in leadership and high paying positions, including in private and public sectors, in corporate boards, in male-dominated occupations and in science, technology, engineering and mathematics;

Statistics Canada, <u>Labour force characteristics by sex and age group</u>; Statistics Canada, "<u>The surge of women in the workforce</u>," *The Daily: Canadian Megatrends*, 2017.



That the Committee report its findings to the House; and that, pursuant to Standing Order 109, the government table a comprehensive response thereto.²

The Committee received testimony from 108 witnesses — 19 of whom appeared as individuals, with the remainder representing 69 organizations. As well, the Committee was briefed by officials from 11 government departments and agencies.³ The briefings and testimony were received over a total of 22 meetings held from 2 February 2017 to 9 November 2017. In addition, the Committee received written briefs from a number of organizations, many of which had appeared before the Committee, along with written speaking notes and follow-up responses to questions from Committee members. Appendix A of this report includes a list of all witnesses who appeared before the Committee and Appendix B includes a list of all submitted briefs.

Over the course of the study, the Committee was informed of both the progress made and challenges remaining with respect to women's economic prosperity and economic leadership in Canada. The key themes that emerged during the course of the Committee's study were:

- 1) factors contributing to women's economic insecurity;
- 2) measures to increase women's economic security; and
- 3) measures to increase women's economic leadership.

The significance of the study was acknowledged by both Committee members and witnesses. An official from Status of Women Canada (SWC) said the Committee's study will "drive forward our shared goal to achieve equality for women, particularly for the most vulnerable."

According to witnesses, there are many reasons that Canada should improve women's economic security and participation: it is a human rights obligation; it reduces poverty

House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women (FEWO), <u>Minutes of Proceedings</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 14 November 2016.

The government departments and agencies included: Department of Employment and Social Development, Department of Industry, Department of Natural Resources, Statistics Canada, Status of Women Canada, Canadian Space Agency, Department of Citizenship and Immigration, Department of Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development, Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada, and Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

House of Commons, Standing Committee on the Status of Women (FEWO), <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

and the harmful effects of poverty among women and children;⁵ it enables women to fully exercise their talents, education and experience;⁶ and it contributes significantly to the maintenance and growth of the Canadian economy.⁷

The Committee heard that, in order to comply with its international human rights commitments to gender equality and fairness in social and economic rights as embodied by the *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, Canada needs to improve women's economic security and participation. In addition, Canada has committed to the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals, the 17 goals outlined in the United Nations' global agenda for peace and prosperity, in particular goal 5 to "achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls."

The Committee also recognizes that in order to improve women's economic security, the federal government must work alongside its provincial, territorial counterparts and other stakeholders. An official from SWC said that the federal government must "encourage and engage leadership across governments" and "encourage collaborative partnerships between levels of government, non-governmental organizations, institutions, and employers." ¹⁰

The Committee intends this report to provide guidance to the federal government on efforts and initiatives that can be implemented to improve women's economic security. The Committee recognizes the important contributions made by witnesses and thanks them for sharing their knowledge, experiences and recommendations during the course of this study.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0845 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Ibid.; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation).

Bibid.; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1000 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1015 (Michèle Biss, Legal Education and Outreach Coordinator, Canada Without Poverty); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0955 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women).

⁹ Government of Canada, <u>The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development</u>.

¹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0850 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).



FACTORS CONTRIBUTING TO WOMEN'S ECONOMIC INSECURITY

Despite the significant progress that has been made in recent decades, many women in Canada still live in poverty or face significant challenges in establishing economic security. In a written brief, Statistics Canada told the Committee that low-income rates for women are higher than for men: in 2014, 13.5% of women had low incomes compared to 12.5% of men. As well, low-income rates are significantly higher for women (and men) in the following groups when compared to the general population: Indigenous people, visible minorities and recent immigrants, people living with disabilities, unattached individuals and lone-parent families. The Committee also heard that poverty is multi-generational in nature, which means that "[o]nce women are impoverished, their children are impoverished."

The Committee was informed that the Government of Canada has committed to developing a Canadian poverty reduction strategy, a project led by the Honourable Jean-Yves Duclos, Minister of Families, Children and Social Development.¹⁵

In a written brief, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women stressed the importance of ensuring that the Canadian Poverty Reduction Strategy "protect the rights of all women, with a focus on the most disadvantaged and vulnerable groups, by integrating a human rights-based and gender-based approach." ¹⁶

According to Megan Hooft, Deputy Director at Canada Without Poverty, Canadian women experience "significant levels of poverty, inadequate housing, homelessness, and

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1100 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).

¹² Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0905 (Janet Currie, Co-Chair, Canadian Women's Health Network).

¹⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0955 (Doug Murphy, Director General, Social Development Policy, Department of Employment and Social Development).

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing
Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017.

hunger that are disproportionate to the country's economic wealth."¹⁷ However, witnesses described many barriers women face when attempting to achieve full economic participation, including systemic and structural barriers in the economic system; bias, discrimination, and sexism; gender-based harassment and violence; the gender pay gap; unpaid work; precarious and part-time employment; lack of access to affordable housing and transportation; and a shortage of comprehensive support services. These barriers are discussed in the sections that follow.

A. SYSTEMIC AND STRUCTURAL BARRIERS IN THE ECONOMIC SYSTEM

The Committee heard that there are systemic and structural barriers in the economic system that prevent women from participating fully in the economy, and that serve to further marginalize certain groups of women. ¹⁸ Lisa Kelly, Director of the Women's Department at Unifor, told the Committee:

Women aren't born vulnerable. They're made vulnerable by laws and policies.... The barriers are not inherent in the inequality of women themselves but are in the system they face. ¹⁹

Margot Young, Professor at the Allard School of Law at the University of British Columbia said that the traditional economic model does not support the promotion of gender equality. She explained that the complex interaction of "institutional practices, attitudes and stereotypes, economic structures, and patterns of social relations" serves to reinforce women's economic insecurity.²⁰

The first key point the Committee heard was that "[m]acroeconomic policies, as currently practised ... are not gender-neutral but rather gender-blind" as they systematically underestimate women's contribution to the economy and do not measure the

¹⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1010 (Megan Hooft, Deputy Director, Canada Without Poverty).

Ibid., 1040 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress);
FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1000 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0900 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor).

¹⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0900 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1000 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, as an individual).



contribution of the unpaid care economy to the productivity of the economy.²¹ The Committee heard that macroeconomics should instead recognize national output as the interaction of four sectors: the private, the public, the domestic, and the voluntary.²²

Second, the Committee was told that the current economic model in Canada "relies on women's cheap labour to maximize shareholders' profits." A representative from Oxfam Canada recommended that the federal government consider corporate accountability for working conditions — including decent wages and labour standards — "as part of its feminist agenda" and that the federal government commission a study to examine the ways the economic system can uphold gender equality. Without corporate responsibility, "economic growth does not necessarily reduce inequality or even provide hope of escaping poverty." ²⁵

Finally, the Committee was informed that the design of federal government systems, programs and policies can create structural inequalities. Jane Stinson, Research Associate at the Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, stated that economic insecurity is "deeply rooted" in "pay systems, hiring systems ... the EI system, parental leave systems, and the absence of a childcare system." Many of these systems were designed to reflect how families were organized decades ago and should be updated to reflect how current and future families will be structured; these systems, programs and policies should be restructured by applying gender-based analysis plus (GBA+). The Committee also heard that sufficient funding of social assistance and public

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual).

²² Ibid

²⁴ Ibid., 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

²⁵ Ibid., 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

²⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0945 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual).

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

services has a positive impact on many women who rely on these services for their basic needs.²⁹

In response to systemic and structural barriers, Margot Young, Professor at the Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia suggested that the federal government establish a "national gender equity strategy," because "effective policy development and implementation to address women's inequality requires a coherent and a coordinated line of policy." Such a strategy would address "the structural factors causing persistent inequalities, including intersecting forms of discrimination, against women and girls, with a special focus on disadvantaged groups of women and girls," and would be formulated in consultation with all Canadians, including the most marginalized. Furthermore, this strategy would require the establishment of "effective accountability mechanisms, benchmarks, oversight mechanisms, and time frames." Such as the Allard School of British Columbia and School of British

Recommendation 1

That the Government of Canada develop an official definition of poverty, incorporating both qualitative and quantitative measures, to be used across all federal government departments and projects.

B. BIAS, DISCRIMINATION AND SEXISM AGAINST WOMEN

The Committee heard that women still face gender bias, discrimination and sexism which affect their ability to achieve full economic security.³³ Imogen Coe, Professor and Dean of the Faculty of Science at Ryerson University, told the Committee:

From the moment [babies are] wrapped in a blue blanket or a pink blanket, their frame of reference is defined. They're drenched in cultural conditioning and they are gender

²⁹ Canadian Women's Foundation, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee</u>," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1000 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual).

³¹ Ibid., and 1005.

³² Ibid., 1005.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1210 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations, Office of the Co-ordinator, Status of Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1015 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society); Canadian Women's Foundation, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017; Nanaimo Family Life Association, "<u>Policy Brief: Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief.</u>



stereotyped. While we think we're a progressive country in Canada, we're just as bad at this as everybody else is. These societal attitudes frame their worlds and limit their potential, both boys and girls. Gender stereotyping disenfranchises boys as much as it does girls.³⁴

Kasari Govender, Executive Director at West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund, said that the "systemic problems underlying women's economic inequality include the legacy of colonialism, xenophobia, and institutionalized patriarchy." ³⁵

The Committee heard that bias can be conscious, such as deliberately not hiring a woman for a position, or it can be unconscious, such as "enacting policies that unconsciously discriminate against pregnancy." Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, at the Canadian Women's Foundation, said that "[u]nconscious bias is the idea that we all, inside of ourselves, have attitudes and ways that we behave toward people, judgments we make about people, regardless of what our higher thinking is telling us to do." ³⁷

The Committee was told that the responsibility for changing the culture we live in should rest with the people who control the culture, such as the people in leadership positions.³⁸ In order to eliminate sexist attitudes and discrimination, witnesses suggested establishing and funding public education campaigns and educational programs that challenge sexist and patriarchal structures.³⁹

C. GENDER-BASED HARASSMENT AND VIOLENCE

Gender-based harassment and violence have a direct influence on women's income and economic security: violence may prevent women from accessing and succeeding in

³⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1100 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

³⁵ Ibid., 1205 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

³⁶ Ibid., 1200 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0935 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1120 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1005 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society); Women Against Violence Against Women Rape Crisis Centre, "<u>Policy Brief: Economic Security Of Women In Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>; Nanaimo Family Life Association, "<u>Policy Brief: Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1015 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

post-secondary education, ⁴⁰ and undermine women's ability to work or to be productive at work and therefore leave them vulnerable to job loss. ⁴¹ Violence can "cost women their jobs, their health and their education." ⁴² The Committee heard that both intimate partner violence and gender-based harassment/violence in the workplace contribute to women's economic insecurity, as explained in the sections that follow.

Many witnesses recommended that the federal government, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, develop a national action plan to end violence against women. Many witnesses also suggested that the federal government provide stable and non-restrictive funding for community organizations specialized in violence against women. Many witnesses also suggested that the federal government provide stable and non-restrictive funding for community organizations specialized in violence against women. Many witnesses also suggested that the federal government provide stable and non-restrictive funding for community organizations specialized in violence against women.

1. Intimate Partner Violence

The Committee heard that intimate partner violence has a negative effect on women's economic security and that economic insecurity can make women more vulnerable to

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0905 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

Women Against Violence Against Women Rape Crisis Centre, "Policy Brief: Economic Security Of Women In Canada," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0855 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada) and 0930, 0935 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0945 (Anne Davis, Program Coordinator, Comox Valley Transition Society).

⁴² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1000 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives).

Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —

A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence,

1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0950 (Anne Davis, Program Coordinator, Comox Valley Transition Society); FEWO, Evidence,

1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada) and 1005 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives); United Steelworkers, "Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women —

Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, April 2017; Mariam Pirzada, "Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women in the Workforce," Submitted Brief; Alana Changoor, Submitted Brief, August 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0950 (Anne Davis, Program Coordinator, Comox Valley Transition Society) and 1015 (Ellen Frood, Executive Director, Alberni Community and Women's Services) and 1005 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0925 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1000 (Ellen Frood, Executive Director, Alberni Community and Women's Services); Nanaimo Family Life Association, "<u>Policy Brief: Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>.



gender-based violence.⁴⁵ Anne Taylor, Executive Director of the Haven Society, explained that "[w]hen a woman is forced to make the choice to leave her home because of violence, she is really being forced to make the choice to step into poverty and to bring her children along with her."⁴⁶ In a written brief, the Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter said that "[a]lthough women of all economic backgrounds experience violence from men, leaving relationships when poor is extremely difficult, sometimes impossible."⁴⁷ Female victims of gender-based violence may choose to stay in an abusive relationship because of a lack of funds.⁴⁸ Some groups of women, such as women living with disabilities and women who cannot speak either French or English, face additional barriers when seeking to escape an abusive relationship.⁴⁹

Intimate partner violence can lead to absenteeism and poor work performance, which leaves victims vulnerable to discipline and job loss, leading to increased economic insecurity. On Anne Davis, Program Coordinator at the Comox Valley Transition Society, noted that women who experienced intimate partner violence report that it negatively affected their work performance.

Witnesses explained that when women leave abusive relationships, they have to deal with psychological trauma, housing concerns, medical issues, legal issues (such as child support arrangements), and employment challenges.⁵² For instance, these women may

45 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); Nanaimo Family Life Association, "<u>Policy Brief: Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>; Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter, "<u>Economic Security for Women in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, August 2017.

⁴⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1000 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society).

⁴⁷ Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter, "Economic Security for Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, August 2017.

⁴⁸ Women Against Violence Against Women Rape Crisis Centre, "Policy Brief: Economic Security Of Women In Canada," Submitted Brief.

⁴⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1235 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

⁵⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

⁵¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0945 (Anne Davis, Program Coordinator, Comox Valley Transition Society).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1235 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

need to take unpaid leave from work or quit their jobs in order to re-establish their lives.⁵³

Witnesses recommended that the federal government introduce legislation to modify the *Canada Labour Code* and grant paid leave for victims of intimate partner violence so that women would be able to protect themselves while rebuilding their lives without the fear of losing their jobs.⁵⁴ The province of Manitoba is an example of a jurisdiction that provides paid leave to victims of intimate partner violence.⁵⁵

Recommendation 2

That the Government of Canada, in consultation with relevant stakeholders, immediately introduce legislation to modify the *Canada Labour Code* to implement paid leave for victims of intimate partner violence.

2. Gender-Based Harassment and Violence in the Workplace

Some women experience gender-based harassment or violence in the workplace, which makes their workplace an unsafe environment. The Committee heard that victims of workplace harassment or violence may turn to their unions for help, but that it can take years of arbitration to find resolutions. In a written brief, Annette Banach, a survivor of workplace harassment, suggested that unions "have the power to ignore potentially dangerous situations, if members handling complaints are uneducated with handling violence and harassment in the workplace." The Committee heard about the success of

⁵³ Ibid.

See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1005 and 1025 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress) and 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions, "<u>Submission by the Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions (CFNU) to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women,"</u>

Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1020 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions); Alana Changoor, <u>Submitted Brief</u>, August 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0930 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada) and 0925 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation).

⁵⁶ Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁵⁷ Annette Banach, "Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, 2017.

⁵⁸ Ibid.



Unifor's women's advocates, whereby advocates are trained to help women work through the job implications of domestic or workplace violence.⁵⁹

The Committee heard that there is no regulatory body "overlooking employer investigations and dealings, nor is there mandatory reporting for [harassment or violence] events." A number of witnesses asked that the federal government address sexual harassment in the workplace and enforce existing laws prohibiting such behaviour to ensure safe workplaces for women. As well, the Committee heard about the importance of eliminating power dynamics that make sexual harassment and violence more likely to happen to women working in precarious and part-time work.

Recommendation 3

That the Government of Canada, immediately and on an ongoing basis, invest in programs to address violence against women, in which federal spending is delivered to service providers.

Recommendation 4

That the Government of Canada develop and implement a public education campaign to raise awareness of bias, discrimination, and sexism faced by women in the workforce, with the goal of changing societal attitudes.

Recommendation 5

That the Government of Canada develop and deliver an awareness campaign targeted to employers that is designed to improve awareness of gender-sensitive workplace policies.

⁵⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0940 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor).

Annette Banach, "Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, 2017.

⁶¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0905 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0930 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada).

Advancement of Women Halton, "<u>Women and the Workforce</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017; YWCA Canada, "<u>Improving Economic Security for Women — YWCA Canada — Brief to the House Standing Committee on Status of Women Study on Women's Economic Security," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017.</u>

⁶³ Unifor, "Women's Economic Security: A Working Women's Agenda," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

Recommendation 6

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with provinces and territories, implement workforce practices that will create equitable working environments, free from harassment and discrimination.

Recommendation 7

That the Government of Canada implement workforce practices in federally regulated workplaces to prevent harassment and discrimination.

Recommendation 8

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with provinces and territories, increase funding for initiatives focused on reducing violence and harassment against women in the workplace.

D. THE GENDER WAGE GAP

1. Overview of the Gender Wage Gap

Many witnesses spoke of the persistent gender pay gap that exists in every jurisdiction in Canada⁶⁴ and its harm to women's economic prosperity, as it results in low annual incomes, limited access to employment insurance and other benefits, and limited retirement income later in life.⁶⁵ The gender pay gap represents the relative difference between the earnings of men and women⁶⁶ and can be measured in a number of ways: by comparing total annual earnings of all men and women, by measuring the full-year,

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1135 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1100 (Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0915 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0945 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual); Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, "A Concise Summary of Gender Gaps in Employment," Submitted Brief, February 2017; FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0850 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual).

Coalition of Provincial and Territorial Advisory Councils on the Status of Women, "Submitted Brief, March 2017.

The gender wage gap is often expressed as a female-to-male earning ratio.



full-time wage gap between men and women, and by measuring the hourly wage gap between men and women.⁶⁷

While select laws have been in place since the 1960s to support equal pay for work of equal value, these laws have not been sufficient to close the gender wage gap between men and women. According to a Statistics Canada official, in 2016, the average hourly wage of full-time women workers was 88% that of men. While the wage gap has been narrowing, most likely as a result of women's rising participation in the labour market and rising educational attainment, the wage gap persists even between men and women with the same level of education. According to Jacqueline Andersen, Director of Industry Relations at Women Building Futures: Higher education was once an argument for why women made less, but we know now that although more women in Canada have post-secondary degrees as compared with men, they're still making less.

According to a SWC official, the gender pay gap in Canada is the eighth largest among Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) countries. ⁷² The Committee was provided with a number of compelling examples of the gender wage gap in Canada:

- Women are paid less than men in 469 out of 500 occupations monitored by Statistics Canada;⁷³
- In a written brief, a group of Canadian arts and culture representatives said that "as actors and comedians, women earned 26% less than men; as authors and writers, 12% less; and as producers, directors,

⁶⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0935 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

⁶⁸ Ibid., 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

⁶⁹ Ibid., 0910.

⁷⁰ Ibid., 0855.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures); Canadian Federation of University Women, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.</u>

⁷² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

⁷³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); Mariam Pirzada, "<u>Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women in the Workforce</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>; Alana Changoor, <u>Submitted Brief</u>, August 2017.

choreographers, and in other related roles, women earned 16% less than men";⁷⁴

 Women working in university-level science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) occupations earned on average \$61,000 annually, compared to \$71,000 earned by men;⁷⁵

While the gender wage gap exists for all women in Canada, this wage gap is more significant for Indigenous women, women living with disabilities and immigrant women.⁷⁶

2. Factors Contributing to the Gender Wage Gap

A number of factors contribute to the gender pay gap; some of the gap is explained by observable differences, such as work experience and educational background, but a large part of the gap is a result of more complex factors, as outlined in this section.⁷⁷

Canadian Dance Assembly, Playwrights Guild of Canada, Professional Association of Canadian Theatres, Opera.ca, Pat the Dog Theatre Creation, Theatre Ontario, Cultural Pluralism in the Arts Movement Ontario, and Canadian Artists' Representation/Le Front des artistes canadiens, "Economic security of women within the arts and culture sector," Submitted Brief, August 2017.

⁷⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0850 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0850 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.); Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, "A Concise Summary of Gender Gaps in Employment," Submitted Brief, February 2017; Engineers Canada, "Engineers Canada's Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief; Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.



Firstly, witnesses pointed to occupational segregation as a central reason for the gender wage gap. The Occupational segregation was described as a workforce that is structured so that industries remain male- or female-dominated, with female-dominated occupations typically having lower salaries — even when they involve the same skill level as male-dominated occupations — because of historic and ongoing under-valuation of the sectors where women work. The occupation is a central reason for the gender wage gap. The gender was described as a workforce that is structured so that industries remain male- or female-dominated, with female-dominated occupations typically having lower salaries — even when they involve the same skill level as male-dominated occupations — because of historic and ongoing under-valuation of the sectors where women work.

Social norms and stereotypes, which are upheld at home, in school and in society, influence girls' and young women's educational paths, and consequently their professional careers, contributing to occupational segregation and the gender wage gap. ⁸⁰ As a result, women are under-represented in some profitable and in-demand careers, such as the skilled trades and STEM sectors. ⁸¹

A number of witnesses asked if the wage premium in male-dominated occupations is justified, as these jobs do not always require more skill. ⁸² Jacqueline Andersen, Director of Industry Relations at Women Building Futures, provided the example that "truck drivers, 97% of whom are male, make an average annual wage of \$45,000, whereas

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0945 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0915 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); United Steelworkers, "<u>Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, April 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0910 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual).</u>

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation) and 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1020 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0915 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0850 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0910 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

Canadian Federation of University Women, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0945 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual); Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail, "<u>Economic Security of Women — Brief submitted by the Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail (CIAFT) to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, May 2017.</u>

childhood educators, 97% of whom are female, make \$25,000."⁸³ In a written brief, the Women's Economic Council said: "Paid work that resembles 'women's work' in the home is paid consistently lower, even when educational requirements are higher than those required by higher paid male-dominated fields."⁸⁴ Research has demonstrated that as the percentage of female employees increases in an occupation, wages stagnate or decrease.⁸⁵

Secondly, in any sector, women are generally over-represented in part-time, temporary and contract work, which hurts their overall earning ability. Women often accept part-time and precarious work because of their responsibility for unpaid care work. Therefore, during prime earning years, many women's incomes flatten, while men's incomes continue to rise. Moreover, women's professional advancement and resulting pay raises are often interrupted by care responsibilities for children, elderly and the sick; this significantly reduces women's earning potential.

- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); Canadian Federation of University Women, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0910 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).</u>
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0850 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual).
- Mariam Pirzada, "<u>Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women in the Workforce</u>," Submitted Brief; Alana Changoor, <u>Submitted Brief</u>, August 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); Canadian Federation of University Women, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.</u>

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures).

Women's Economic Council, "Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 —
Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1000 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0855 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0910 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0915 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); Canadian Federation of University Women, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0855 and 0900 (Willem Adema, Senior Economist, Social Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development).</u>



Another reason for the gender pay gap is the continuing bias and discrimination against women in the workplace, both deliberate and unconscious. ⁹⁰ Employers may have an unconscious bias, which was described by the Canadian Women's Foundation as "social stereotypes about certain groups of people that individuals form outside their own conscious awareness (gender, age, race, sexuality);" this can lead them to prefer male candidates, regardless of the candidates' qualifications. ⁹¹

The Committee heard that merit-based appointments can be compromised because "merit contains a significant amount of unconscious bias" and "merit is defined by those in power," who are often men. ⁹² Through training and with awareness-raising, there is evidence that biases can be understood and addressed in the workforce and in the hiring and promotion processes. ⁹³

A further reason for the gender wage gap is that women typically receive lower rates of promotion to higher-paid positions, including senior management positions, as a result of caregiving responsibilities, bias and discrimination, and other factors. ⁹⁴ Women receive fewer offers of high-profile assignments needed for advancement and requests for flexible work arrangements for care responsibilities lead to lower-profile work roles. ⁹⁵

In addition, evidence indicates that the gender pay gap starts early, with female graduates earning less than their male counterparts as soon as post-secondary education ends. ⁹⁶ Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director of Catalyst Canada, stated that "studies we've done show that Canadian high-potential women earn \$8,000 less than

⁹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0915 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0850 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

⁹¹ Canadian Women's Foundation, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee</u>," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017.

⁹² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0850 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

⁹³ Canadian Women's Foundation, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee</u>," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁹⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

⁹⁵ Catalyst Canada Inc., Submitted Brief.

⁹⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0850 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.); Engineers Canada, "<u>Engineers Canada's Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," <u>Submitted Brief.</u></u>

men do in their first post-[Master's in Business Administration] job and are more likely to start at a lower-level position despite same levels of experience and education." ⁹⁷

3. Measures to Address the Gender Wage Gap

There are a number of measures that could be used to address the gender wage gap in Canada. Some witnesses spoke of employers' responsibility in keeping track of pay inequities and addressing any noticeable gender gaps in pay. Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director of Catalyst Canada, said employers should implement methods to measure pay equity within their organization and implement strategies to eliminate any existing gap. Companies should make "long-standing commitment[s] to inclusion and ... intentional efforts to promote equality throughout the talent management processes, ranging from hiring to performance evaluations." As an example, "Gap Inc. became the first Fortune 500 company in the United States to publicly disclose and validate that it pays women and men equally for equal work."

As well, witnesses spoke of the effectiveness of pay transparency policies in addressing the gender wage gap. ¹⁰¹ The federal government could strongly promote or require all employers to implement and uphold pay transparency policies in order to tackle pay inequity. ¹⁰² In this way, organizations and companies may be required to publish annual salary data, such as the median wage for men and women and the exact salaries and bonuses of male and female employees. ¹⁰³

⁹⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0850 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

⁹⁸ Ibid., 0855.

⁹⁹ Catalyst Canada Inc., <u>Submitted Brief</u>.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid.

¹⁰¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0850 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1000 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0910 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor).

See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0905 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0910 (Willem Adema, Senior Economist, Social Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development); Advancement of Women Halton, "<u>Women and the Workforce</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017.

Engineers Canada, "<u>Engineers Canada's Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," *Submitted Brief*; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).



In order to address the discrimination and bias that contributes to the gender wage gap, the Canadian Women's Foundation suggested that employers provide training to and raise awareness among employees, as discussed in greater detail in the section on workplace policies. ¹⁰⁴

Witnesses also recommended that the federal government address the pay gap by improving the quality and pay in roles traditionally dominated by women, such as the care economy. As well, to address the perpetuation of lower salaries among female employees, Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director of Catalyst Canada Inc., suggested that the federal government should "adopt a prohibition on compensation based on salary history."

Lastly, witnesses recommended adopting pay equity legislation, as discussed in an upcoming section.

Recommendation 9

That the Government of Canada study the factors that contribute to the gender wage gap, including – but not limited to – women's chosen field of work, level of education, the decision between part-time or full-time work, and the use of family benefit programs.

Recommendation 10

That the Government of Canada fund initiatives for employers and employees that:

1) raise awareness of the existence of the gender wage gap; 2) provide training to counter some of the root causes of the gender wage gap, such as the effect of unconscious biases and stereotypes on hiring, salary negotiations and promotion processes; and 3) provide guidance on the implementation of measures to address the gender wage gap, such as the use of internally defined salary bands by businesses.

E. LACK OF INVESTMENT IN SOCIAL INFRASTRUCTURE

The Committee heard that investments in social infrastructure serve to support women's economic prosperity and benefit the country as a whole. Social infrastructure describes

¹⁰⁴ Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

¹⁰⁵ Unifor, "Women's Economic Security: A Working Women's Agenda," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

¹⁰⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0855 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

facilities and services that assist individuals and families to meet their social needs. Social infrastructure can include infrastructure that is designed for the delivery of childcare, affordable housing, public transportation, health, care work, education, and arts and culture. Investments in social infrastructure help women in two ways: 1) as women are disproportionately responsible for unpaid care work, because of gender stereotypes and social norms, any investments in social infrastructure serves to alleviate the weight of those responsibilities; and 2) women are the majority of workers in many sectors supported by social infrastructure, such as the early learning and childcare sector, and thus any social infrastructure support also benefits them.

The Committee heard that investing in social infrastructure is "a job multiplier," particularly for female workers. According to recent research, "government expenditure or government investment in social infrastructure, including education, health, and care work, will produce more bang for the buck than will physical infrastructure projects like bridges and highways." However, Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor at Oxfam Canada, noted that most public infrastructure spending instead serves to support male-dominated sectors, such as the construction industry. 112

See for example: Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants, "Submission to Standing Committee on the Status of Women On the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0855 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual); Coalition of Provincial and Territorial Advisory Councils on the Status of Women, "Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada: Provincial and Territorial Perspectives," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); Women Against Violence Against Women Rape Crisis Centre, "<u>Policy Brief: Economic Security Of Women In Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>.

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1005 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec); YWCA Canada, "Improving Economic Security for Women — YWCA Canada — Brief to the House Standing Committee on Status of Women Study on Women's Economic Security," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017; FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1020 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women); Coalition of Provincial and Territorial Advisory Councils on the Status of Women, "Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada: Provincial and Territorial Perspectives," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017.

¹¹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0925 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual).

¹¹¹ Ibid., 0850.

¹¹² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).



Witnesses told the Committee that women face many challenges with regards to social infrastructure, particularly in accessing affordable housing and transportation.

1. Lack of Access to Affordable Housing

The Committee heard that access to affordable housing has a direct impact on women's economic security. Housing stability provides women with a safe environment which allows them to foster "personal development and community connections." An official from Indigenous and Northern Affairs Canada (INAC) said "[h]ousing is the starting point for better social, economic ... results." In a written brief, Interval House explained that lack of affordable housing is one of the principal barriers preventing women from achieving greater economic security. 115

A number of witnesses told the Committee that there is currently a housing crisis and a shortage of affordable housing across Canada. ¹¹⁶ Violet Hayes, Executive Director at the Island Crisis Care Society, explained:

Prices of housing have skyrocketed in Nanaimo, and on Vancouver Island generally, so we're seeing many landlords who are deciding to just sell their properties and cash in. That leaves people not able to find a place to rent. People who have lived in their rental units for 15 years are calling us, because now they're not going to have anywhere to go. The possible places they can go to and afford at this time are very slim. Landlords with vacancies are able to charge extortionate rates because there's so little available. 117

Women are disproportionately affected by the shortage of affordable housing because, compared to men, they are more likely to be renters and because they generally earn

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 0955 and 1000 (Sheilagh Murphy, Assistant Deputy Minister, Lands and Economic Development, Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development).

¹¹⁵ Interval House, "Brief for Status of Women Committee's Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1005 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0955 (Violet Hayes, Executive Director, Island Crisis Care Society); Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "<u>Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in <u>Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, October 2017.</u>

¹¹⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0955 (Violet Hayes, Executive Director, Island Crisis Care Society).

less than men.¹¹⁸ In a written brief, Abiola Akande and colleagues stated that "more than a quarter of shelter users in 2014 were women [and that n]early 90% of families using emergency shelters were headed by single women." Megan Hooft, Deputy Director at Canada Without Poverty, stated that other options should be put in place to provide assistance to women who do not want to go to a shelter, such as rent supplement programs and transitional housing options. ¹²⁰

As well, the Committee heard that some groups of women are experiencing unique challenges in terms of having access to affordable and suitable housing. Amanda Deseure, Manager of Socio-Economic Development at Pauktuutit Inuit Women of Canada, told the Committee that "[h]ousing and overcrowding and lack of infrastructure is a dire crisis in the north," with a shortage of infrastructure for childcare and housing alternatives for women who want to leave violent situations. ¹²¹ In addition, obtaining access to shelter is more difficult for women living in rural and remote communities and women living with disabilities. ¹²² In a written brief, the Canadian Women's Foundation recommended that the federal government "address the gap between funding of on-reserve shelters and those that are funded through provincial governments." ¹²³

Many witnesses stressed the need to invest in and build safe and affordable housing and shelters for women, particularly for vulnerable women, such as women recovering from

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "<u>Economic Security — A Question</u> of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017.

¹¹⁹ Ibid.

¹²⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1025 (Megan Hooft, Deputy Director, Canada Without Poverty); Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "<u>Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in <u>Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, October 2017.</u>

¹²¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0925 (Amanda Deseure, Manager, Socio-Economic Development, Pauktuutit Inuit Women of Canada).

¹²² FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0930 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada).

¹²³ Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.



domestic violence, and for seniors. ¹²⁴ A number of witnesses stressed the importance that the federal government's National Housing Strategy, announced in November 2017, take into account the needs of all women, in particular the needs of women more vulnerable to economic insecurity. ¹²⁵ Jonathan Will, Director General of the Economic Policy Directorate in the Strategic and Service Policy Branch at the Department of Employment and Social Development, said that the federal government has announced that, in support of the National Housing Strategy, "budget 2016 proposed to invest \$11.2 billion over 11 years, starting in 2017-18, in a variety of initiatives designed to build, renew, and repair the stock of affordable housing to ensure that Canadians have affordable housing." ¹²⁶

The Committee heard that increasing the availability of affordable housing would lessen the pressure on shelters; witnesses explained that when women are ready to leave shelters, they may not be able to do so because of the lack of affordable housing options available to them.¹²⁷ The limited availability of beds in shelters can also create a situation

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 and 0850 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1000 (Violet Hayes, Executive Director, Island Crisis Care Society); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0935 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1030 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1000 (Ellen Frood, Executive Director, Alberni Community and Women's Services); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0930 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada).

Interval House, "Brief for Status of Women Committee's Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 and 0855 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society); Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017; Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1215 (Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate, Strategic and Service Policy Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

¹²⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0945 (Anne Davis, Program Coordinator, Comox Valley Transition Society); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0925 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada).

where a woman who has suffered domestic violence may choose to stay with or return to her abuser to avoid being homeless. 128

The federal government's Homelessness Partnering Strategy (HPS) is a "community-based program aimed at preventing and reducing homelessness by providing direct support and funding to 61 designated communities in all provinces and territories." Violet Hayes, Executive Director at the Island Crisis Care Society, suggested that the HPS funding be provided to organizations on a multi-year basis instead of on an annual basis and that the HPS funding be allowed to fund capital projects, as capital funding helps shelters to be able to expand their bed availability or the space they use and therefore provide more services. An official from the Department of Employment and Social Development told the Committee that the federal government has announced \$2.5 billion of funding over the next 11 years for the HPS.

Recommendation 11

That the Government of Canada table legislation to realize the right to housing in Canada, in accordance with its international obligations, and invest without delay, through the National Housing Strategy, in affordable housing to address the housing affordability crisis.

2. Challenges with Transportation

A lack of transportation options can be a barrier to the full economic participation of women. Access to public transit systems plays an important role in supporting women's ability to access the workforce, as well as supporting services and resources, such as

¹²⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 and 0855 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0955 (Violet Hayes, Executive Director, Island Crisis Care Society); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0925 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1000 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1025 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1215 (Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate, Strategic and Service Policy Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

¹³⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0955 and 1000 (Violet Hayes, Executive Director, Island Crisis Care Society).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1215 (Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate, Strategic and Service Policy Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).



health services and childcare.¹³² As Tracy Lee, Chair of the First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, stated, "[t]ransportation is the number one barrier to ... accessing educational opportunities, and accessing employment."¹³³

In urban settings, the cost of public transit and the lack of suitable schedules are barriers to the economic participation of women. ¹³⁴ In northern, rural and remote communities, there is often an absence of public transit which can be a problem for women who may not be able to afford a car. Speaking about Indigenous communities, Tracy Lee, Chair of the First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, said:

Our roads [on reserve] are very substandard. When you're living in a community that is at or below poverty, people are living from one junker car to the next junker car. If the roads were better, their cars would last longer. If they had reliable cars, they could drive to employment, health care, and those educational opportunities. 135

Jaime Smith, Executive Lead of the Centre for Employment Innovation at St. Francis Xavier University, said that community transit organizations "offer very innovative solutions for local communities" in providing much-needed transportation services. She agreed that it would be helpful if federal funding was provided to support community transit organizations that help rural communities. ¹³⁶

Recommendation 12

That the Government of Canada, immediately and on an ongoing basis, provide funding for social infrastructure – facilities and services that assist individuals and families to meet their social needs – in order to provide benefits to women who work in and rely on these sectors.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0935 (Jaime Smith, Executive Lead, Centre for Employment Innovation, St. Francis Xavier University, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1015 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

¹³⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1025 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1015 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

¹³⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0930 (Jaime Smith, Executive Lead, Centre for Employment Innovation, St. Francis Xavier University, As an individual).

Recommendation 13

That the Government of Canada expand the eligibility requirements of the Public Transit Infrastructure Fund to include not-for-profit and non-governmental community transit organizations, where municipally funded transportation services are not available.

Recommendation 14

That the Government of Canada, immediately and on an ongoing basis, increase investment in public transportation that will ensure affordable, accessible, frequent and safe transit services for women.

F. INCREASING PRECARIOUS AND PART-TIME EMPLOYMENT

The Committee heard that a lack of access to safe and stable work is a systemic barrier that holds women back from achieving economic security. ¹³⁷ In a written brief, the Women's Economic Council explained that there has been an increase in non-standard employment, which includes precarious and part-time employment. ¹³⁸ Women are more likely to work in these non-standard jobs than men. ¹³⁹

1. Part-Time Employment

An official from Status of Women Canada reported that approximately 70% of part-time workers in Canada are women, and that 37.8% of them work part-time involuntarily. She also explained that "if there were more supports by private sector, public sector, and other employees, then [those women] would prefer to work full-time." According to Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher at the National Office of the Canadian Centre for

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1050 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress).

Women's Economic Council, "Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

See for example: Statistics Canada, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief,
February 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0925 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy
Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament,
7 March 2017, 1010 (Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist, Canadian Labour Congress); British Columbia
Federation of Students, "<u>A Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief; FEWO,
<u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 1030 (Grace-Edward Galabuzi, Professor, Politics and
Public Administration, Ryerson University, as an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0910 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

¹⁴¹ Ibid.



Policy Alternatives, if women working part-time for involuntary reasons were fully participating in the economy, "they would have brought home an additional \$20.6 billion in wages last year." 142

In a written brief, Statistics Canada noted that women are more likely than men to cite reasons, such as illness, caring for children, and personal preference, as the reason they work part-time. For example, 25.7% of women who work part-time cite "caring for children" as the reason why they work part-time, compared to 4.7% of men. Here was some debate among witnesses over whether "caring for children" should be categorized as a voluntary or involuntary reason for working part-time. Statistics Canada includes "caring for children" as a voluntary reason for working part-time, while a number of other witnesses stated that it should be viewed as an involuntary reason because many women cannot find affordable, accessible childcare.

The Committee heard that women who work part-time may not work enough hours to qualify for employment insurance benefits, which can be a problem because "during an economic downturn, [part-time and precarious] jobs are often withdrawn from the market." As well, in a written brief, the Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington said that part-time employment has a "negative effect on [the Canada Pension Plan] and private pension contributions." 147

2. Precarious Employment

The Committee heard that the precarious employment sector has a negative impact on women's economic security. According to the International Labour Organization, precarious employment often refers to the "absence or the insufficient level or rights and protection at the workplace," and includes informal employment, as well as forms of

¹⁴² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1000 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives).

¹⁴³ Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

¹⁴⁴ Ibid.

¹⁴⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1000 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives); Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the <u>Canadian economy'</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1030 (Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist, Canadian Labour Congress).</u>

Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women — A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid.

formal employment, such as "sub-contracting, temporary contracts, agency work, ... and involuntary part-time." As well, the Committee was told that the precarious employment sectors provide women with employment that has low wages and few benefits.

The Committee was told that public service jobs are becoming more precarious, which disproportionately affects women who are the majority of employees in the sector. For instance, Jennifer Howard, Executive Director at the Public Service Alliance of Canada, stated that there is a decrease in the number of full-time employees and an increase in short-term and contract employment in the federal public service. ¹⁴⁹ Jane Stinson, Research Associate at the Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, argued that since the public service is an important source of good jobs for women, the increase of precarious employment negatively affects women's poverty and inequality. ¹⁵⁰ The Committee heard that it is important to reverse the trend of short-term and contractual employment in the public sector through collective bargaining, ¹⁵¹ and encouraging the federal government to create "permanent employment opportunities."

Women working in the arts sector and in academia are more likely than men to be offered contract positions and are less likely to be in a leadership position. ¹⁵³ Margot Young, Professor at the Allard School of Law at the University of British Columbia, said

¹⁴⁸ International Labour Organization, ACTRAV Symposium on Precarious Work (4-7 October, 2011).

¹⁴⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

¹⁵⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1030 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

¹⁵¹ Ibid., 1005; YWCA Canada, "Improving Economic Security for Women — YWCA Canada — Brief to the House Standing Committee on Status of Women Study on Women's Economic Security," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

¹⁵² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

Canadian Dance Assembly, Playwrights Guild of Canada, Professional Association of Canadian Theatres,
Opera.ca, Pat the Dog Theatre Creation, Theatre Ontario, Cultural Pluralism in the Arts Movement Ontario,
and Canadian Artists' Representation/Le Front des artistes canadiens, "Economic security of women within
the arts and culture sector," Submitted Brief, August 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament,
9 February 2017, 1015 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an
individual); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1100 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair,
Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).



that individuals with teaching contracts receive lower pay and benefits than those who have tenure-track positions. 154

As well, the Committee was told that there are concerns about the precarious working conditions in the retail sector, in which the majority of employees are women. Debora De Angelis, Regional Director for Ontario at United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada, explained to the Committee that workers in the retail sector have unpredictable schedules and that "[e]mployers do not always give guarantees as to how many hours a part-time employee will receive." As a result, employees receive "insufficient notice of shifts, last-minute changes to schedules, cancelled shifts right before they begin, and abbreviated shifts once the employee has arrived." Debora De Angelis suggested amending relevant legislation "to compel employers to provide reliable scheduling practices and better notice periods" for employees working on shifts. 157

Internships are a common form of precarious work for students; women are disproportionately affected compared to men by this form of work, which leads to financial insecurity and contributes to the gender wage gap. According to a written brief by the British Columbia Federation of Students, "unpaid interns are predominately female, which reflects the continuing devaluing of women's labour," and contributes to "the repetition of historical inequities that women have faced." ¹⁵⁸

Many traditionally female-dominated employment sectors have unpaid internships as an educational requirement, while traditionally male-dominated sectors are more likely to offer paid internship options. As a result, women in these sectors can face significant financial pressures, feel devalued as an employee and suffer from overwork and exhaustion. Furthermore, evidence indicates that unpaid internships do not significantly increase a student's success rate in seeking employment. Some witnesses

157 Ibid.

¹⁵⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1015 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual).

¹⁵⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada).

¹⁵⁶ Ibid.

British Columbia Federation of Students, "<u>A Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief.

¹⁵⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1015 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association); British Columbia Federation of Students, "<u>A Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief.

¹⁶⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1015 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association).

asked for an end to unpaid internships;¹⁶¹ however, it was noted that the federal government can only act to end unpaid internships within federally regulated sectors of the economy.

A number of witnesses suggested that the federal government "provide high-quality, universal public services," ¹⁶² such as childcare, to put a stop to precarious work. ¹⁶³ To protect individuals working in precarious positions, Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair of the Equity Committee of the Canadian Association of University Teachers, recommended that the federal government "work with the provinces and territories to ensure protections through employment legislation for workers in precarious employment, including ladders to full-time employment." ¹⁶⁴

Recommendation 15

That the Government of Canada commit to ending the practice of providing stipends for individuals living with disabilities to perform work, which has the effect of compensating these individuals at a lower rate than the minimum wage established in each province and territory, and to creating meaningful employment and opportunities for individuals living with disabilities.

Recommendation 16

That the Government of Canada end the practice of unpaid internships in the federally regulated sector, and that it replace any existing unpaid internship placements under its jurisdiction with paid internship opportunities.

British Columbia Federation of Students, "<u>A Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>,"

Submitted Brief; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1015 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0910 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

¹⁶² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1010 (Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist, Canadian Labour Congress).

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0925 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

¹⁶⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1100 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).



G. SHORTAGE OF COMPREHENSIVE SUPPORT SERVICES

The Committee heard that many women would benefit from access to various types of support services in order to achieve greater economic security, including job search training, ¹⁶⁵ legal aid, childcare, mentorship, and transportation. ¹⁶⁶ For example, Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor at Mount Saint Vincent University, told the Committee about a federally funded program offered to marginalized and low-income women that helps them access job search skills training and enter a 12-week entry-level job placement. ¹⁶⁷ Other witnesses spoke about the services their organizations offer to women leaving shelters, such as referral services, counselling, and job search help. ¹⁶⁸ Anne Davis, Program Coordinator at the Comox Valley Transition Society, told the Committee:

... our role, really, is to provide the counselling, the practical support services for a woman who's trying to transition into or back to employment. Through our employment program, we help her with things like writing resumés, finding appropriate clothing for job interviews, ... and ... walk beside her as she goes through the process. ¹⁶⁹

As well, Anuradha Dugal, Director of Violence Prevention Programs at the Canadian Women's Foundation, stated that there is a need for emergency funds for women so that if they face sudden economic challenges, they are able to obtain an emergency loan. ¹⁷⁰

Representatives from the Pathways Health Centre for Children suggested that the federal government invest in efforts to help families access all available resources and services, through a number of approaches, including developing an initiative to

¹⁶⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0955 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women).

¹⁶⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1020 (Denise Watters, Welding Intern, Women Unlimited, Irving Shipbuilding Inc.) and 0900 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 and 0850 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1030 (Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual).

¹⁶⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1030 (Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual).

¹⁶⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1020 (Ellen Frood, Executive Director, Alberni Community and Women's Services; Anne Davis, Program Coordinator, Comox Valley Transition Society).

¹⁶⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1020 (Anne Davis, Program Coordinator, Comox Valley Transition Society).

¹⁷⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 and 0925 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation).

coordinate services; providing training to service providers about the resources available; and establishing a service to help families navigate the various systems. ¹⁷¹

Witnesses spoke of the need for multi-year core funding for community organizations to work with women to improve their economic security. 172

Recommendation 17

That the Government of Canada develop a mechanism to: 1) assess the quality and success of federally funded projects; and 2) enable the extension of funding for projects that are deemed to be successful.

Recommendation 18

That the Government of Canada, immediately and on an ongoing basis, provide secure multi-year operational funding to women's organizations and front-line community groups to ensure they can meet the growing demand for services.

1. Access to Justice and Legal Aid

The Committee heard that access to justice and legal aid services is a key element to protect women's economic and social rights. ¹⁷³ Kasari Govender, Executive Director at West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund, explained the importance of providing family law legal aid for women:

Studies suggest that women's median income for the year of their separation or divorce drops by about 30%, whereas men's median income decreases by only about 6%. Studies also show that eventually men's income recovers and women's doesn't. Divorce itself is expensive. A two-day divorce trial will cost around \$20,000. It is also expensive to be the parent primarily responsible for raising children, and we know women are still in that role, and to be the parent statistically making less money because of pay inequality. All these factors together mean that having a lawyer when you're leaving a

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0910 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children) and 0940 (Jenny Greensmith, Executive Director, Pathways Health Centre for Children).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1005 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society); Women Against Violence Against Women Rape Crisis Centre, "<u>Policy Brief: Economic Security Of Women In Canada</u>," Submitted Brief.

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017.



relationship will help your economic situation and will ultimately increase economic equality in the country. ¹⁷⁴

The Committee was informed that there are several concerns with regards to women's access to justice. First, the Committee was told that there has been a diminution of financial support from civil legal aid programs. The Kasari Govender, Executive Director at West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund, told the Committee that legal aid funding, in particular civil legal aid, should be increased in order to ensure that women have access to adequate legal aid in all jurisdictions, in particular women who are victims of violence, Indigenous women and women with disabilities. Should be increased in Sacrifice economic legal entitlements for the sake of holding on to custody and to keep themselves and their children safe in situations of violence.

In a written brief, the Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter suggested that legal aid funding be available to mothers fleeing domestic violence to help them with the legal fees they may face when seeking custody of their children. The organization said that "[m]en often have more money to hire legal representation while women must rely on duty counsel, the inadequate amount of free legal aid hours, or settle through mediation or other alternative processes that require her to comply with his demands and help maintain some of his control over her."

Furthermore, in a written brief, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women suggested that the income test for the eligibility to civil legal aid has

¹⁷⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1205 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1105 (Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1205 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017. Also see: FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1205 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

¹⁷⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1205 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

¹⁷⁸ Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter, "Economic Security for Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, August 2017.

prevented many low-income women from accessing this service. The group called for a review of the criteria so that more women can qualify to receive civil legal aid. ¹⁷⁹

As well, the Committee heard about the newly reinstated Court Challenges Program, which will "provide financial support to Canadians to access the courts for the litigation of test cases of national significance, to help clarify and assert certain constitutional and quasi-constitutional official language rights and human rights in Canada." In a written brief, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women recommended that the Program provide funding for claims under section 7 of the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*, "fund equality rights challenges to provincial, territorial and federal laws," and "preserve its community-based structure." 181

Finally, the Committee heard concerns from witnesses about the allocation process for child support payments. Kasari Govender, Executive Director at West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund, said it is important to streamline the application process in order to decrease the legal costs for women and provide them with the possibility of not going through the legal system. She recommended the federal government engage in a consultation process to figure out a better system, perhaps an administrative legal system that would reduce the toll on the court system and the cost of counsel for parents.

Recommendation 19

That the Government of Canada, in the Canada Social Transfer, earmark funds for civil legal aid to ensure that women have access to justice in all jurisdictions, with a particular focus on legal aid for female survivors of violence, Indigenous women and women living with disabilities.

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017.

¹⁸⁰ Government of Canada, <u>Backgrounder — Court Challenges Program</u>.

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing
Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017.

¹⁸² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1210 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

¹⁸³ Ibid.



Recommendation 20

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, ensure that the Legal Aid Program is responding to the demands of economically vulnerable persons for legal aid.

H. UNPAID WORK

The Committee was informed that women work a higher number of unpaid hours than their male counterparts, which limits their participation in the workforce and hurts their economic advancement. Donna Lero, Professor Emerita at the Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being at the University of Guelph, explained that unpaid work includes hours that are spent on housework, elder care, the care of family members living with disabilities, and the care of children. While volunteering is also deemed to be a form of unpaid work, it was not discussed in detail by witnesses.

Recent Statistics Canada data indicate that Canadian women perform 65% of the total hours spent caring for children in households. As well, women undertook approximately 4 hours of unpaid care work every day, compared to 2.4 hours undertaken by men in 2015. According to the Canadian Federation of University Women, the yearly value of women's unpaid care work is estimated to be \$319 billion.

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1000 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives) and 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0850 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0950 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0845 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual); Canadian Women's Health Network, "Submission to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0845 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

¹⁸⁶ Ibid., 0850 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual).

¹⁸⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

Canadian Federation of University Women, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

1. Gender and the Division of Unpaid Work

The Committee was told that cultural norms tend to reinforce the role of women as the primary caregivers for children and the elderly. In a written brief, Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons explained that "there are deep-seated normative assumptions in the workplace and in communities that women should be the primary caregivers and men the primary breadwinners." Women are most often "the ones who end up staying home when there's a conflict between care and paid employment." A number of witnesses recognized that many mothers want to perform unpaid care, such as staying at home with their children, and it was acknowledged by witnesses that this was a valid choice. However, witnesses also stated that for a great number of mothers, particularly women who are single mothers or who live in poverty, the situation and circumstances leads to limited (or no) choices when it comes to taking on unpaid care work.

As well, the division of unpaid work itself can be gendered, with women often "providing greater quantities and performing tasks that are more time-consuming and less flexible" than the work performed by men; for instance, women tend to do more

FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0945 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0845 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual); Donna S. Lero, "A Brief Supplementing Testimony to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women on Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief.

¹⁹¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0915 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada; Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1040 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology).

¹⁹³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0920 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual).



housekeeping, meal preparation and personal/medical care, while men provide more transportation and home maintenance, such as snow shovelling. 194

Unpaid work can be influenced by culture; for instance, many immigrant and refugee families, because of traditional family values, language barriers and other factors, will not place the elderly in retirement homes, and as a result, immigrant and refugee women who perform unpaid care work may have different needs then other groups of women.¹⁹⁵

Witnesses acknowledged that while men now spend more time on housework and caregiving, equality between women and men has not yet been achieved. ¹⁹⁶ As Jennifer Howard, Executive Director at the Public Service Alliance of Canada, explained, "while women's participation in the paid labour market has increased over time, men's participation in caregiving has not increased proportionally." Witnesses told the Committee that there must be a sustained shift in social norms so that care responsibility is more evenly shared between men and women. ¹⁹⁸ Andrea Doucet, Professor and Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care at Brock University, explained that "men's increased involvement in caring can and does lead to a shift in political and cultural values and socio-economic conditions around paid and unpaid work." ¹⁹⁹ It was recommended that the federal government develop a national

194 Ibid., 0845; Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

196 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women); Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief; Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "<u>The Standing Committee on the Status of Women — A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0920 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual).</u></u>

197 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

198 Ibid., 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0945 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual).

199 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0950 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual).

¹⁹⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0845 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual).

awareness campaign to establish that equality between men and women means "sharing the care, sharing the work, sharing the decision-making, and sharing the rewards." ²⁰⁰

Dedicated parental leave for the second parent, who is generally a man, can lead to a shift in social and cultural values in society, leading to greater sharing of care responsibilities and domestic work.²⁰¹ The Committee heard that in Quebec, where there is dedicated second parent leave, "men who took that leave are more likely five years later to do more domestic work."²⁰²

2. Impact of Unpaid Care Work on Women's Economic Security

The Committee was told that women's disproportionate responsibility for unpaid work negatively affects their access to education, participation in the labour force, career advancement, access to job training, the quality of their health and personal relationships, and their current and future financial resources.²⁰³

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0955 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women).

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0900 (Willem Adema, Senior Economist, Social Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1050 (Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist, Canadian Labour Congress); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0950 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1025 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology) and 0940 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0920 (Martha Friendly, Executive Director, Childcare Resource and Research Unit).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0930 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0845 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual) and 0910 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual); Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "<u>The Standing Committee on the Status of Women — A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>; Canadian Federation of University Women, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0845 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual).



As a result, some women may experience poverty as seniors because of the caregiving responsibilities they performed during their lives. ²⁰⁴ Witnesses highlighted the impact that the responsibility for unpaid work has on women's economic security, as outlined in this section.

First, women move in and out of the workforce more often than men to care for children, the elderly and others, which can result in them often not qualifying for employment insurance and losing valuable earning potential. Upon returning to the workplace, women may find their skills are out of date and that they require additional training to qualify for jobs they previously worked in. The Committee heard that policies described as "family-friendly" are often applicable only to women, which upholds women's role as caregivers and dissuades men who seek to be equal caregivers. In a written brief, Donna S. Lero told the Committee that many caregivers felt that they could not use flexibility arrangements available to them at work "without risking their job security or future career advancement." Family-friendly workplaces are discussed in greater detail later in the report.

Furthermore, women are over-represented in certain types of occupations, such as teaching, that are more likely to accommodate their hours of unpaid work and this is a contributing factor to occupational segregation. Some witnesses recommended that the federal government invest further in the care economy and social infrastructure, as examined in an earlier section.

In addition, women are also over-represented in part-time, casual or non-standard employment, which gives them the flexibility to balance paid work with unpaid work; however, these positions often lack job security and stability, and provide low pay and few

Donna S. Lero, "A Brief Supplementing Testimony to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women on Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

²⁰⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

²⁰⁶ Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

²⁰⁷ Donna S. Lero, "A Brief Supplementing Testimony to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women on Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1000 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives).

²⁰⁹ Ibid., 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); Mariam Pirzada, "Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women in the Workforce," Submitted Brief; Alana Changoor, Submitted Brief, August 2017.

benefits.²¹⁰ The Committee heard that the federal government should increase the flexibility of employment insurance, parental leave and compassionate care leave, to increase accessibility for women who take on the majority of all types of family care.²¹¹ For instance, it was recommended that the federal government review the criteria of the Compassionate Care Benefits program as the uptake is limited, including enabling leave for care related to serious, but not necessarily life-threatening, health conditions.²¹² A number of additional recommended changes are outlined in the sections on parental leave and employment insurance.

Also, women who continue to work while managing caregiving responsibilities may forego promotions, cut back on hours worked, and have reduced levels of productivity, energy and engagement at the workplace. Women may experience negative health consequences as a result of caregiving responsibilities; for instance, they report high levels of stress and anxiety, particularly in cases where they are caring for a family member living with severe disabilities. The caregiving responsibilities and the caregiving responsibilities and the caregiving responsibilities.

Lastly, women may leave the labour market (permanently or temporarily) or retire early because of unpaid caregiving responsibilities. This situation can lead to loss of income, loss of access to employer-provided benefits and loss of pensionable years, which

See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1000 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives); Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions, "<u>Submission by the Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions (CFNU) to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0845 (Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director, Inclusion International); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children).</u>

²¹¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

Donna S. Lero, "A Brief Supplementing Testimony to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women on Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

²¹³ Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017; Parents jusqu'au bout, "Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief.

²¹⁴ Canadian Association of Retired Persons, "Comments to Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee
on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, July 2017; Canadian Women's Health Network, "Submission to the
House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

²¹⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0900 (Geneviève Dion, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout); Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "<u>Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, May 2017; Parents jusqu'au bout, "<u>Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>.</u>



impact income security and lead to both current and future (especially in retirement) financial instability. ²¹⁶ In a written brief, the Canadian Association of Retired Persons recommended that the federal government introduce a caregiver credit "of at least \$100 a week for full-time informal, unpaid caregivers."

3. Recognizing the Value of Unpaid Work

The Committee heard that change is needed both in the federal government and wider society to recognize and value unpaid work performed by both women and men.²¹⁸ For instance, Jane Stinson, Research Associate at the Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, suggested that the federal government play a role in creating an advertising campaign that reinforces the value of unpaid work.²¹⁹

Witnesses recommended that the federal government provide financial assistance programs for caregivers, for example a non-refundable tax credit or supplemental

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0845 (Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director, Inclusion International); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0905 (Marilyne Picard, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0920 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual); Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "<u>Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017; Donna S. Lero, "<u>A Brief Supplementing Testimony to the House of Commons Standing Committee</u> on the Status of Women on Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.</u>

²¹⁷ Canadian Association of Retired Persons, "Comments to Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, July 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual); Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "<u>The Standing Committee on the Status of Women — A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0925 (Marilyne Picard, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0900 (Hélène Cornellier, Coordinator of Action Plan and Communications, Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale); Women's Economic Council, "<u>Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women</u>, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.</u>

²¹⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1015 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

benefits.²²⁰ The Committee was also told about the importance for full-time caregivers of being able to contribute to a retirement plan.²²¹

Meg Gingrich of the United Steelworkers recommended that the federal government ensure there are publicly funded, accessible programs for all types of care, so that Canadian society is "not just shifting all this care into the community or into the home sphere because, again, that often means women end up taking on more." In a written brief, the Caregivers Nova Scotia Association recommended that the federal government expand the aid provided in the care sector by providing additional funding for adult day programs and by creating bursaries and non-repayable loans for students who are pursuing careers as continuing care assistants or home care workers. 223

Witnesses told the Committee that it is important to statistically measure unpaid work in order to assign value to it, and that Statistics Canada must play a role in tracking Canadians' unpaid work. ²²⁴ For instance, the Committee heard that Statistics Canada should assess and calculate the value of unpaid work in Canada, and measure its effect on the gross domestic product, as well as the effect it has on women's incomes and their entry/exit from the labour market. ²²⁵ Hélène Cornellier, Coordinator of Action Plan and Communications at the Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale,

FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1015 (Wanda Morris, Vice-President, Advocacy, Canadian Association of Retired Persons); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0905 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0905 (Hélène Cornellier, Coordinator of Action Plan and Communications, Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale); Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0935 (Geneviève Dion, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0940 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

²²³ Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1005 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0900 (Hélène Cornellier, Coordinator of Action Plan and Communications, Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0900 (Hélène Cornellier, Coordinator of Action Plan and Communications, Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual).



recommended that Statistics Canada ensure that a question regarding unpaid work and household activities be included in the 2021 long-form census.²²⁶ She also suggested that the federal government name the first Tuesday in April as "National Unpaid Work Day," to raise awareness of the burden of unpaid work.²²⁷

The Committee heard from witnesses about the challenges women face when providing care for family members, for example for elders, children and family members living with disabilities. This is discussed in greater detail in the sections that follow.

4. Caring for Family Members

a. Caring for Elders

The prevalence of caring for the elderly is increasing as "the population ages and individuals with chronic health conditions benefit from medical advances." Tamara Daly, Associate Professor at the School of Health Policy and Management, and CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education at York University, told the Committee that, according to Statistics Canada, 5.4 million Canadians provided care work to seniors "with a chronic health condition, a disability, or a problem related to aging" in 2012. In a written brief, the Caregivers Nova Scotia Association explained that the term "caregiver" refers to persons — spouses, adult children or in-laws, parents, siblings, youth, extended family members, or friends — who "either at home or in a facility, gives unpaid care to a loved one who has a physical or mental health condition, or who is chronically ill, frail, or elderly." Care of the elderly includes both health and social care; for instance, it can include "body care, dining assistance, and organizing, such as with medical

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0900 (Hélène Cornellier, Coordinator of Action Plan and Communications, Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale).

²²⁷ Ibid.

Donna S. Lero, "A Brief Supplementing Testimony to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women on Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0845 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual).

²³⁰ Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0920 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual).

appointments and finances, providing transport, and assisting with the home, such as cleaning and maintenance." ²³²

Individuals providing unpaid care for the elderly are often older adults themselves and may have children to care for as well.²³³ As the Caregivers Nova Scotia Association stated in a written brief, "[m]ost families cannot survive financially without all adults engaged in paid work, and caregivers are often faced with supporting and managing two homes – their own and that of their care recipient – while working and raising children."²³⁴

The Committee heard that care of the elderly also leads to significant financial burdens on families, as they may have to pay for additional care that is not publicly funded. ²³⁵ In a written brief, the Caregivers Nova Scotia Association said that "[o]ut-of-pocket expenses can be unexpected and burdensome, sometimes increasing imperceptibly over years of caregiving," including "subsidizing groceries, rent, medication, transportation, equipment, or privately contracted home care." ²³⁶ Linda Davis, First Vice-President of the Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women, told the Committee that "a better system for elder care" is necessary. ²³⁷ For example, some people may not be able to afford day programs, or find transportation to get to the programs. ²³⁸ In a written brief, the Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail stated that the

²³² Ibid., 0845.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0910 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1025 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1030 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association).

²³⁴ Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0850 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual).

Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0955 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0935 (Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health, Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University, As an individual).



federal government should create a subsidy program for support services in seniors' homes. ²³⁹

b. Caring for Children

A lack of access to affordable high-quality childcare leads many families to decide to have one stay-at-home parent, which, in the majority of cases, is the woman. ²⁴⁰ Information on caring for children is provided in the upcoming section on childcare.

c. Caring for Family Members and Children Living with Disabilities

The Committee heard that women caring for family members and children living with disabilities face extreme financial stress and pressure, ²⁴¹ and have trouble maintaining their attachment to the labour market. Marilyne Picard, cofounder of Parents jusqu'au bout, said: "We are women with degrees, we have a career, financial independence, plans and purchasing power, but life has thrown us a curve ball by giving us a child who is seriously ill and severely disabled." Witnesses explained that women taking care of children living with severe disabilities are often not able to go back to work as children grow up, as they require regular and ongoing care, no matter their age. ²⁴³ In addition, Geneviève Dion, cofounder of Parents jusqu'au bout, indicated that around 85% of couples with children living with severe disabilities separate, which often results in women having to take care of the children by themselves. ²⁴⁴

Women who have children with severe disabilities often face challenges at work because they must frequently take time off to go to medical appointments or, in some cases, to

239 Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail, "Economic Security of Women — Brief submitted by the Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail (CIAFT) to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0900 (Marilyne Picard, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout); Parents jusqu'au bout, "<u>Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>.
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0900 (Marilyne Picard, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout).
- 243 Ibid. (Geneviève Dion, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout); Parents jusqu'au bout, "Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief.
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0900 (Geneviève Dion, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0910 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual); Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee</u>, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief.

deal with difficult situations at the daycare or school.²⁴⁵ As well, the Committee heard that women caring for children living with disabilities often have to quit their jobs or take up lower paying or part-time positions in order to care for their children.²⁴⁶ The founders of Parents jusqu'au bout explained that care for children living with disabilities can include "tube feeding, suction, tracheotomy care, and the administration of various medications,"²⁴⁷ as well as "daily physiotherapy, occupational therapy, speech therapy, and respiratory therapy exercises" and preparing "the tube feeding bag, medications, wheelchair, papers, paperwork and prescriptions."²⁴⁸

Individuals caring for children living with disabilities are not "offered any compensation for the loss of [their] employment income" when they need to stay home to care for their children.²⁴⁹ Therefore, they are not able to contribute to retirement savings plan.²⁵⁰ For some women, caring for their children living with disabilities results in living in poverty.²⁵¹ Marilyne Picard, cofounder of Parents jusqu'au bout, explained:

[Financial assistance is] necessary to meet our children's many needs: their specialized therapy, expensive uninsured medications, ambulance fees, and fees related to hospitalization, such as parking and food. At the same time, however, we as Canadian women are not offered any compensation for the loss of our employment income. Given our financial situation, we cannot afford to contribute to any retirement savings plan or save for anything. We no longer have any purchasing power. So it is difficult if not impossible for us to purchase a house and a specially equipped vehicle, which we need for our children. We become financially depend[e]nt on our spouse, for the 15% of us who still have a spouse, or on society, which puts us back in the 1950s or even back to before women had the right to vote.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children); Parents jusqu'au bout, "<u>Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women</u>," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0845 (Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director, Inclusion International); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0900 (Geneviève Dion, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout).

²⁴⁸ Ibid. (Marilyne Picard, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout).

²⁴⁹ Ibid., 0905.

²⁵⁰ Ibid.; Parents jusqu'au bout, "Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children).

²⁵² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0905 (Marilyne Picard, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout).



Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director at Inclusion International, told the Committee that it is important for families who have been providing care to an individual living with disabilities to receive some recognition of their caregiving role through regular income support.²⁵³

The Committee was told that families with children living with disabilities often do not know or are misinformed about the resources available to them, ²⁵⁴ and that navigating the services available at different levels of government is challenging, overwhelming and time-consuming. ²⁵⁵ For instance, Anne Day, Founder and President of Company of Women, said to the Committee: "Trying to work the maze of all the different services that are available and all the different criteria involves extremely difficult navigation."

Witnesses also explained that the forms parents must complete to receive benefits are often very complicated and time-consuming and that some of them require documents that parents must pay to obtain, for example doctors' notes. ²⁵⁷ A number of witnessed stressed the fact that parents living in poverty sometimes do not have the financial means to obtain these documents, or to contribute to savings programs, such as registered disability savings plans. ²⁵⁸ Some witnesses recommended that the federal government invest in efforts to help families in need access all available resources and services, through a number of approaches: developing an initiative to coordinate services; providing training to service providers about the resources available; and/or establishing a service to help these families navigate the various systems. ²⁵⁹

²⁵³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0925 (Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director, Inclusion International).

²⁵⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0910 and 0940 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children) and 0940 (Jenny Greensmith, Executive Director, Pathways Health Centre for Children).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1025 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0905 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children).

²⁵⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1025 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0935 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children; Jenny Greensmith, Executive Director, Pathways Health Centre for Children).

²⁵⁸ Ibid., 0910 (Jenny Greensmith, Executive Director, Pathways Health Centre for Children); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0925 (Marilyne Picard, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0910 (Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor, Pathways Health Centre for Children) and 0940 (Jenny Greensmith, Executive Director, Pathways Health Centre for Children).

The Committee was told that families of children living with severe disabilities often have to resort to fundraising activities to gather the financial resources necessary to take care of their children, and that it is emotionally extremely difficult for families to do so. ²⁶⁰

Even with all the physical and financial challenges parents face when caring for children living with disabilities, Parents jusqu'au bout told the Committee, in a written brief, that it is important to keep children living with severe disabilities with their families, when possible:

The best solution is to keep children with their biological family. Parents are in the best position to know their child's needs and meet them properly with love and attention. This arrangement also results in considerable savings to society, because putting our children in care represents a significant cost to the government.²⁶¹

Some federal tax benefits to help parents caring for children living with disabilities, such as the Disability Child Benefit, end when the children reach the age of 18. However, Parents jusqu'au bout explained, in a written brief, that a "severely disabled child aged 18 or older still needs to be cared for by an experienced adult." ²⁶² It was recommended that children living with severe disabilities "continue to receive their benefits after they turn 18," and that parents who care for children living with severe disabilities receive "steady, long-term pension or benefits in [their] name." ²⁶³ In a written brief, the DisAbled Women's Network Canada stated that the Child Disability Benefit should be enhanced. ²⁶⁴ As well, in a written brief, Parents jusqu'au bout stressed the importance of these benefits being reliable and permanent. ²⁶⁵

Recommendation 21

That the Government of Canada consider changing the non-refundable Family Caregiver Tax Credit into a non-taxable Family Caregiver Benefit.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0925 (Marilyne Picard, Cofounder, Parents jusqu'au bout); Parents jusqu'au bout, "<u>Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women</u>," *Submitted Brief*.

²⁶¹ Parents jusqu'au bout, "Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief.

²⁶² Ibid.

²⁶³ Ibid.

DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "Parliamentary Brief — The Economic Security of Disabled Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare," Submitted Brief, November 2017.

²⁶⁵ Parents jusqu'au bout, "Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief.



Recommendation 22

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with provinces and territories, increase financial support to community organizations and community-based projects that provide services to adults living with disabilities and their families.

I. WOMEN AT RISK OF ECONOMIC INSECURITY

The Committee heard that certain groups of women face unique challenges that limit their ability to participate in the economy and to achieve greater economic security. For instance, an official from SWC said that "[w]hen a diversity lens is applied to the economic situation for women in Canada, it becomes [clearer] that some groups of women are more significantly disadvantaged than others." As Anuradha Dugal, Director of Violence Prevention Programs at the Canadian Women's Foundation, stated: "women in Canada continue to be economically marginalized, particularly women of colour, Aboriginal women, rural and northern women, women who identify as LGBTQ [lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and queer], older women, immigrant women, women with disabilities, and young women."

The Committee was informed that discussions of economic empowerment and leadership often exclude an examination of the systemic barriers that are especially harmful to the most marginalized women and of the possible solutions to these barriers. ²⁶⁹ Witnesses told the Committee that equality cannot be fully achieved until the inequalities faced by these groups of women are eliminated. ²⁷⁰ Vicky Smallman, National Director of Women's and Human Rights at the Canadian Labour Congress, explained:

See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0945 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1050 (Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist, Canadian Labour Congress); Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "<u>The Standing Committee on the Status of Women — A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," <u>Submitted Brief</u>; Canadian Women's Health Network, "<u>Submission to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, May 2017.</u>

²⁶⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1040 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress).

²⁷⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0855 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

Economic justice for women will never be achieved unless we lift up all women, including, and especially those who are most marginalized. We know the barriers to equality are magnified for racialized women, [I]ndigenous women, and women with disabilities, as well as lone mothers, so if we focus attention on women who already have privilege, say, by preoccupying ourselves with economic leadership positions ... then we will not make progress. ²⁷¹

Unique challenges and barriers faced by Indigenous women, women living in rural and remote communities, single mothers, immigrant and refugee women, women living with disabilities and elderly women are described in the sections that follow.

1. Indigenous Women

An official from SWC told the Committee rates of poverty for Indigenous women in Canada are three times higher than those for the general female population.²⁷² In a written brief, the National Association of Friendship Centres shared some statistics from the 2011 National Household Survey that illustrate the economic situation of Indigenous women:

- 50.4% of Indigenous women aged 15 and over were employed in 2011, which is lower than the rate for non-Indigenous women and Indigenous men;²⁷³ and
- the unemployment rate for Indigenous women was 13.3%, almost double that of non-Indigenous women (7.2%) in 2011.²⁷⁴

Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, expressed concern about the "low participation of [I]ndigenous women in the labour market, in particular in senior or decision-making positions, as well as their disproportionately high unemployment rates, and their lower pay compared with that of men and non-[I]ndigenous women." In a written brief, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women suggested that the federal government

²⁷¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1005 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

National Association of Friendship Centres, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," *Submitted Brief*, May 2017.

²⁷⁴ Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1105 (Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women).



develop an integrated plan addressing the socio-economic conditions affecting Indigenous women.²⁷⁶

When considering the economic security of Indigenous women, a number of witnesses stated that the context is different depending on where Indigenous women live, but that they still share many of the same challenges. For example, a unique challenge for First Nations women living on-reserve is that they often live near natural resource and extractive industries. While these sectors offer some of the highest paid employment near Indigenous communities and in the north, they disproportionately employ men rather than women.

Witnesses spoke of many other challenges faced by Indigenous women as they seek to participate in the economy, as described in the sections that follow.

a. Colonization and Racism

The Committee heard that colonization and racism have caused past and ongoing harm to Indigenous women, leading to "injustices such as residential schools and the 60s Scoop, which continue to have a lasting impact through intergenerational trauma." Many witnesses said that residential schools have had a serious impact on the wellbeing of families, leading to an intergenerational cycle of violence, where abuse is normalized. Witnesses stressed the importance of re-instilling value for Indigenous culture and languages and to teach families how to be healthy, as well as improving access to culturally appropriate mental health care services to overcome the trauma of colonization and intergenerational poverty.

The Committee was told that Indigenous women may also encounter racism during their job searches. In a written brief, the First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security told the Committee:

²⁷⁶ Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017.

²⁷⁷ Métis Women's Council on Economic Security, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada — Submission to</u> the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women," *Submitted Brief*, June 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0955 (Ellen Frood, Executive Director, Alberni Community and Women's Services); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1010 and 1020 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0950 (Marlene Poitras, Council Member, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security) and 1000, 1030 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

The few job opportunities on-reserve create pressure for women to leave their communities and their support network to seek employment elsewhere. Institutional racism and western interviewing practices that encourage self-promotion serve as additional barriers to economic security. ²⁸⁰

The Committee was also told that the western concept of economic success based on monetary gains does not always resonate with Indigenous women who focus more on "reciprocity, sustainability, and collective success." The First Nations and Métis Women's Economic Security Councils defined economic security as "having access to the resources and supports that contribute to physical, mental, emotional, and spiritual well-being."

To reverse the effects of colonialism and to end discrimination against Indigenous women, witnesses said it was important to implement the *United Nations Declaration* on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, ²⁸³ the Truth and Reconciliation Commission Calls to Action, ²⁸⁴ and Jordan's principle, which states that no First Nations child should be denied welfare services because of a jurisdictional dispute. ²⁸⁵

b. Violence against Indigenous Women

The Committee heard that the economic insecurity of Indigenous women makes them vulnerable to violence in their homes, their communities and society as a whole, which in turn limits their economic security. Indigenous women are more likely than non-

First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," *Submitted Brief*, 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0945 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

²⁸² Ibid., 0950 (Marlene Poitras, Council Member, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0900 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "<u>Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017.</u>

First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0900 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); National Association of Friendship Centres, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0905 (Alex Wilson, Professor, University of Saskatchewan, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0900 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0955 (Valerie Kaufman, Co-Chair, Métis Women's Council on Economic Security); Métis Women's Council on Economic Security, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada — Submission to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, June 2017.</u>



Indigenous women to experience violence: witnesses told the Committee that approximately 70% of Indigenous women experience sexual abuse or other forms of violence in their lives and Indigenous women are more than three times more likely to experience intimate partner violence than non-Indigenous women. ²⁸⁶ Intimate partner violence may force women to leave communities and support systems, which contributes to their economic insecurity. ²⁸⁷ The Committee heard that the National Inquiry into Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls must be successful in order to improve Indigenous women's well-being and security. ²⁸⁸

Witnesses also said that Indigenous women face sexism; as such, it is important to counter messages that devalue Indigenous women. As well, the United Steelworkers recommended that the federal government establish a national action plan on violence against Indigenous women.

c. Education and Childcare

The Committee heard that challenges in accessing high-quality education begin at a young age for Indigenous girls. Tracy Lee, Chair of the First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, stated that poor educational outcomes among Indigenous youth are partly a result of a "funding inequity that exists between on-reserve and off-reserve students." The Committee was informed that a central reason for Inuit women being unable to complete high school is "pregnancy and/or the need to care for children." Marlene Poitras, Council Member of the First Nations Women's Council on Economic

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0900 (Alex Wilson, Professor, University of Saskatchewan, As an individual); First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada,</u>" Submitted Brief, 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1030 (Ellen Frood, Executive Director, Alberni Community and Women's Services).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0900 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0950 (Marlene Poitras, Council Member, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security) and 0945 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security); Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "<u>Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017.</u>

²⁹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1005 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0850 (Amanda Deseure, Manager, Socio-Economic Development, Pauktuutit Inuit Women of Canada).

Security, stressed the importance of "increasing educational opportunities by working to improve high school graduation rates for [I]ndigenous girls." ²⁹²

With regards to post-secondary education, witnesses reminded the Committee that Indigenous women often enter post-secondary education as mature students, and thus require assistance with housing and childcare. Tracy Lee, Chair of the First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, stated that the living allowance provided through the "educational treaty right" for mature students is "insufficient" for those who have children. As well, witnesses stressed the need for distance education through online courses, particularly for First Nations women living on-reserve and Indigenous women living in the North. However, the development and implementation of those courses must take into account that Indigenous women in low-income situations may not have access to computers and the Internet. The Committee was told that the funding structure for post-secondary education creates an unequal dynamic around access to education for First Nations students on- and off-reserves.

In addition, the Committee heard that to support Indigenous women's entry into the workforce, there is a need for accessible, affordable, culturally appropriate, and high-quality childcare in Indigenous communities, often with extended hours²⁹⁸ and that the Indigenous Early Learning and Childcare Framework be renewed to meet these criteria.²⁹⁹

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0950 (Marlene Poitras, Council Member, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

lbid., 1000 and 1035 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security); First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1005 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

Ibid., 1020 (Phyllis Steeves, PhD, Co-Chair, Métis Women's Council on Economic Security); FEWO, Evidence,
 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1035 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

²⁹⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1020 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0920 (Alex Wilson, Professor, University of Saskatchewan, As an individual).

National Association of Friendship Centres, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief, May 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0855 (Amanda Deseure, Manager, Socio-Economic Development, Pauktuutit Inuit Women of Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1025 (Marlene Poitras, Council Member, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security) and 1035 (Tracy Lee, Chair, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security).

²⁹⁹ National Association of Friendship Centres, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," *Submitted Brief*, May 2017.



d. Employment and Training Programs for Indigenous Women

The Committee was told that employment and training programs can provide important assistance to Indigenous women. Many of these programs for Indigenous women are offered by Indigenous Friendship Centres. Sonya Howard, Policy Officer at the National Association of Friendship Centres, explained that the success of some of those services and programs comes from, for example, "the complementary services approach to employment and training and childcare housed in the same area." As well, Ms. Howard stressed the importance of stable funding for urban programming for Indigenous people. 301

An official from Indigenous and Northern Affairs Canada told the Committee the Department is "committed to strengthening [I]ndigenous women's access to business and economic opportunities and recogniz[e] the importance of positioning Indigenous women to be in leadership and decision-making roles." For instance, the Indigenous Entrepreneurship and Business Development Program provides Indigenous women access to equity capital, which fills a financing gap, as well as project-based funding to improve access to business and procurement opportunities. 303

Recommendation 23

That the Government of Canada support the continuation of the Indigenous Friendship Centre Program to facilitate Indigenous women's equitable participation in the Canadian economy.

Recommendation 24

That the Government of Canada provide funding for employment programs and services geared specifically to Indigenous women.

Recommendation 25

That the Government of Canada, in partnership with Indigenous peoples and communities, study and seek to improve the socio-economic conditions of the

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1110 (Sonya Howard, Policy Officer, National Association of Friendship Centres).

301 Ibid., 1115 and 1125.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 0955 (Sheilagh Murphy, Assistant Deputy Minister, Lands and Economic Development, Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development).

303 Ibid.

Indigenous population, with specific attention paid to: 1) improving access to quality health services, including mental health services; 2) increasing educational opportunities at both the secondary and post-secondary level; and 3) improving Indigenous women's economic participation and economic security.

Recommendation 26

That the Government of Canada, when renewing all departmental programs and funding streams focused on the economic well-being of Indigenous peoples and communities, use evidence-based policy development approaches that incorporate information on urban Indigenous populations; approaches that demonstrate success in service delivery; and ensure the equitable delivery of services for all Indigenous people.

Recommendation 27

That the Government of Canada, in partnership with Indigenous peoples and communities and in collaboration with the National Aboriginal Capital Corporations Association, fund Aboriginal Financial Institutions to provide training on financial literacy, financial management, and how to start a business, and that this training be offered to Indigenous peoples, regardless of where they live.

2. Women in Rural and Remote Communities

The Committee heard that women living in rural and remote communities face challenges accessing services to help them enter or remain in the workforce, such as childcare or health care. Jaime Smith, Executive Lead at the Centre for Employment Innovation at St. Francis Xavier University, spoke of the importance of providing innovative and accessible childcare services for women in rural and remote communities who want to work. Cindie Smith, Caregiver Support Coordinator for the Northern and Eastern Mainland Region at Caregivers Nova Scotia, said that Italiere are challenges with living in rural areas, particularly for older women who are caregivers and have reached a point in their life when they're no longer able to hop in the car and go to where the services are provided.

As well, witnesses explained that female entrepreneurs living in rural areas are more isolated, leading to greater challenges in seeking mentorship, networking opportunities

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0930 (Jaime Smith, Executive Lead, Centre for Employment Innovation, St. Francis Xavier University, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0910 (Cindie Smith, Caregiver Support Coordinator, Northern and Eastern Mainland Region, Caregivers Nova Scotia).



and other resources. For this reason, Iris Meck, President and Founder of Advancing Women In Agriculture Conference, told the Committee that funding should be provided to female entrepreneurs in rural and remote communities to allow them to attend conferences and participate in training and educational programs. ³⁰⁶ Furthermore, the Committee heard that funding should be offered to community-based organizations working with female entrepreneurs located in rural communities. ³⁰⁷ Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer at Actua, said that a specific component for rural and remote communities should be included in federal funding programs. ³⁰⁸

Recommendation 28

That the Government of Canada consider the distinctive context of rural and remote communities when implementing policies and programs, with the goal of responding to the unique challenges faced by women living in these communities.

3. Single Mothers

The Committee was informed that most single parent-led families in Canada are led by women, ³⁰⁹ who face various challenges in achieving economic security. In some socio-economic groups, such as lone parents, a higher proportion of women than men live in low-income situations or in poverty. ³¹⁰ Furthermore, the rate of poverty for single mothers is three times higher than the rate of poverty for the general female population. ³¹¹

306 Ibid., 1035 (Iris Meck, President and Founder of Advancing Women In Agriculture Conference, Iris Meck Communications Inc., As an individual).

- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); Statistics Canada, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, February 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0935 (Jaime Smith, Executive Lead, Centre for Employment Innovation, St. Francis Xavier University, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1030 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0845 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation).

As well, the Committee heard that single parent families are more likely to experience food insecurity and to use food banks than other types of users, ³¹² to enter shelters, ³¹³ and are less confident about their retirement prospects than two-parent families. ³¹⁴ Women who are lone parents, especially those with low incomes, also face significant challenges accessing childcare. ³¹⁵ With regards to childcare, Megan Hooft, Deputy Director at Canada Without Poverty, said that "what could be affordable for a single father is different from what's affordable for a single mother." ³¹⁶ This issue is discussed further, in the section entitled "Childcare."

4. Immigrant and Refugee Women

The Committee heard that women who are recent immigrants and refugees experience higher rates of low income than the general population.³¹⁷ As well, the labour market participation rate and employment rate of immigrant women is lower than those of immigrant men and Canadian-born women.³¹⁸ The Committee heard that immigrant and

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

³¹³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1010 (Megan Hooft, Deputy Director, Canada Without Poverty).

³¹⁴ Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0925 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1030 (Megan Hooft, Deputy Director, Canada Without Poverty).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1030 (Megan Hooft, Deputy Director, Canada Without Poverty).

³¹⁷ FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada); Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants, "Submission to Standing Committee on the Status of Women On the Economic Security of Women in Canada,"

Submitted Brief, May 2017; Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0845 (Corinne Prince, Director General, Settlement and Integration Policy Branch, Department of Citizenship and Immigration); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1110 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0845 (Corinne Prince, Director General, Settlement and Integration Policy Branch, Department of Citizenship and Immigration); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1110 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association).



refugee women also experience intersecting and widespread discrimination within society on the basis of both race and gender. 319

According to an official from Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada, over the past 10 years, approximately 255,000 new permanent residents settled in Canada each year, and approximately half of those residents are women.³²⁰

Many witnesses said that it is important to recognize that immigrant and refugee women are a heterogeneous group. For instance, Imogen Coe, Professor and Dean of the Faculty of Science at Ryerson University, told the Committee:

If you're a wealthy immigrant from a particular area, you're going to do well. You have a good education, and there's an expectation that as a young woman, you're going to be an engineer. But if you're from a lower socio-economic group from a particular area, you won't have had access to education. 321

Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer at the Calgary Immigrant Women's Association, explained that the Calgary Immigrant Women's Association customizes its approach to women's economic security by dividing women into two groups: professionally trained immigrant women and immigrant women with limited education. 322

a. Challenges to Economic Security of Immigrant and Refugee Women

The Committee heard about a number of barriers that may prevent certain immigrant and refugee women from achieving economic security. Firstly, a lack of available and affordable childcare may lead some immigrant and refugee women to stay home to care for their children. For instance, Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer at the Calgary Immigrant Women's Association, explained:

The availability of childcare for evenings and weekends is particularly challenging, because some of the women we surveyed cited willingness to do any job, such as

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1125 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0845 (Corinne Prince, Director General, Settlement and Integration Policy Branch, Department of Citizenship and Immigration).

³²¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1135 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1110-1115 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association).

cleaning or food services, anywhere, but many of those jobs have shifts in the evenings and at irregular hours. 323

A lack of access to childcare can also limit women's opportunities to participate in language classes.³²⁴ The Committee was told that access to childcare is crucial for some immigrants and refugees because they do not have the family support in Canada that they may have had in their countries of origin.³²⁵

Furthermore, witnesses stated that lack of fluency in French or English for some immigrant and refugee women creates challenges in accessing employment. Language proficiency was described as "the number one key to integration." Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager in Nanaimo at the Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society, said it is important to provide financial support for organizations that provide language classes focused on immigrant women, particularly mothers. ³²⁸

³²³ Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1130 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0910 (Jennifer Watts, Director, Settlement and Integration, Immigrant Services Association of Nova Scotia).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1140 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1025 (Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager, Administrative Office, Women's Economic Council); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1110 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0845 (Corinne Prince, Director General, Settlement and Integration Policy Branch, Department of Citizenship and Immigration).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1145 (Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society).



An additional challenge is a lack of recognition of some immigrant and refugee women's work experience and credentials.³²⁹ The Committee was told that it is expensive to have credentials recognized and that it is a lengthy process.³³⁰ Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager in Nanaimo at the Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society, explained that "[w]e have some women who have come here as government-assisted refugees, incredibly intelligent women with masters' degrees in mechanical engineering, Ph.D.s in [A]rabic literature, ... but they're not going to be able to move into positions like that in Canada, without recognition of their foreign credentials first."³³¹ Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer at the Calgary Immigrant Women's Association, told the Committee that:

For many professional immigrant women, there is a misconception that Canadian education will advance their careers and so they invest time and resources in retraining.... However, the true barrier is opportunities for employment within their field.... Upon completing academic courses, many professional immigrant women take entry-level jobs, survival jobs in an entirely different field than their professional experience. They are never able to transfer into their original professions because their Canadian experience on their resumé typecasts them into survival industry instead. 332

A number of witnesses spoke about the success of bridging employment programs in part because they "can be cost-effective and successful not only for professionally trained immigrant women but also for those with limited education." Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society, recommended that the federal government increase financial support for organizations that provide employment programs for immigrant women. Set leads to the successful programs for immigrant women.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1025 (Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager, Administrative Office, Women's Economic Council); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1110 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0850 (Corinne Prince, Director General, Settlement and Integration Policy Branch, Department of Citizenship and Immigration); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0910 (Jennifer Watts, Director, Settlement and Integration, Immigrant Services Association of Nova Scotia).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0940 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society).

³³¹ Ibid., 0925.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1115 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association).

³³³ Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society).

suggested that bursaries and grants be provided to low-income immigrant women who want to pursue education, particularly in economically empowering fields such as engineering.³³⁵

As well, the Committee heard that closed work permits for temporary foreign workers, which tie the employee to a specific employer, make it difficult for employees to leave abusive workplaces. For example, a written brief from the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women stated that allowing immigrant women doing domestic work to be free to change employers would reduce their risk of becoming victims of abuse and improve their working conditions. 337

In addition, immigrant and refugee families may experience "shifts in family dynamics and increased familial responsibilities upon arrival to Canada" which puts "increased pressures on [the families ... to] create a stable environment and support the integration of their children, a condition for this being parental ability to successfully integrate into the workplace." As well, some families experience role reversals between men and women, which can put "pressure for women to economically support the family due to integration challenges experienced by their spouses, in addition to raising and caring for children, even though they may not have worked back at home." The Committee heard that shifts in family dynamics increase the risk of domestic abuse in immigrant and refugee families.

b. Immigrant and Refugee Sponsorship

In a written brief, the Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants suggested that the sponsorship of family members could be made more accessible by reducing fees and revising income criteria to include low-income applicants.³⁴¹ The organization stated that

³³⁵ Ibid.

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing
Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017; Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants, "Submission to Standing Committee on the
Status of Women On the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,

October 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1110 (Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer, Calgary Immigrant Women's Association).

³³⁹ Ibid.

³⁴⁰ Ibid.

Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants, "Submission to Standing Committee on the Status of Women On the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.



"[l]ow-income families will gain the most ... from family reunification in Canada with parents and grandparents both economically and socially and in terms of well-being." 342

In a written brief, Abiola Akande and colleagues also recommended a review of the points system for sponsorship, asserting that it has "discriminated against immigrant women since it was introduced." The point system allocates points based on skills and experiences that are more likely to be gained by male heads of households, such as "acquired job skills, post-secondary education and language training in their countries of origin." In the current system, "women are over-represented in the family class of immigrants" and as such become economically dependent on their partners and "second-class citizens." 345

Recommendation 29

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, and in consultation with relevant not-for-profit organizations, increase its funding to subsidized language training, including accompanying childcare services, for immigrant and refugee women.

Recommendation 30

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, and in consultation with relevant not-for-profit organizations, examine the best practices in place in other Canadian jurisdictions, in order to implement customized programs for the integration of economic class immigrants, and that these programs respond to the needs of women in every region where resettlement services are already offered.

Recommendation 31

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, and in consultation with not-for-profit organizations, and in response to the Auditor General of Canada's Fall 2017 report on Settlement Services for Syrian Refugees, improve its planning and approval processes to ensure the timely transfer of funding to service providers to manage wait-lists for its language-learning programs, and eliminate barriers

342 Ibid.

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

344 Ibid.

345 Ibid.

that impede access to available services for newly arrived immigrant and refugee women.

Recommendation 32

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the province and territories, and in consultation with professional organizations, review the barriers to the assessment and recognition of foreign and domestic academic and occupational credentials, with the goal of increasing the rate of recognition of equivalent qualifications across Canadian jurisdictions.

Recommendation 33

That the Government of Canada reaffirm its commitment to the Pan-Canadian Framework for the Assessment and Recognition of Foreign Qualifications and strengthen the Foreign Credentials Referral Office, with the goal of improving access to high-quality employment opportunities for recent immigrants.

5. Women Living with Disabilities

The Committee heard that women living with mental, intellectual and physical disabilities experience disproportionately higher rates of poverty than individuals living without disabilities. In a written brief, the DisAbled Women's Network Canada stated that 22.5% of Canadians living under the poverty line are living with disabilities, and that women living with disabilities are more likely than men living with disabilities to have low incomes and to rely on government programs. The Committee was told that the federal government should "establish poverty-reduction mechanisms for ... women [living with disabilities]." The Committee also heard about the importance of addressing basic income security for all women living with disabilities.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada); Diana Lin, Jiale Deng, Vanessa Tang, Vivian Le, Michelle Dao, Maria Jairam and Rachel Le, "<u>Status of Women Committee — RE: Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1000 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living).

DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "Parliamentary Brief — The Economic Security of Disabled Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare," Submitted Brief, November 2017.

³⁴⁸ Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1230 (Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director, DisAbled Women's Network Canada).



a. Women Living with Disabilities in the Workplace

The Committee heard that the "intersection of disability and gender has a huge impact on employment." For instance, witnesses stated that women living with disabilities have a higher unemployment rate than men living with disabilities, and that women living with disabilities generally work in semi-skilled and unskilled jobs, or part-time and contract work and often stay in those jobs for fear of not finding better employment, which increases their risk of low earnings. 352

A number of witnesses stated that women living with disabilities often have the capacity and motivation to contribute to the workforce, but their skills are underutilized. The Committee was told that "differences in physical and mental abilities are seen as costly burdens instead of opportunities to be more inclusive." For instance, Donna Lero, Professor Emerita at the Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being at the University of Guelph, explained that "[t]here are many people who can work and use their skills if they're able to get to work and have the accommodations they need, including some reduced workload demands, so they can continue to make contributions."

The Committee heard that there are many benefits to hiring people living with disabilities. For example, Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services at the Sarnia and District Association for Community Living, stated that individuals living with disabilities often "take less sick time, the WSIB [Workplace Safety and Insurance Board]

351 DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "Parliamentary Brief — The Economic Security of Disabled Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare," Submitted Brief, November 2017.

- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1000 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living); DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "<u>Parliamentary Brief</u> <u>The Economic Security of Disabled Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, November 2017.
- Diana Lin, Jiale Deng, Vanessa Tang, Vivian Le, Michelle Dao, Maria Jairam and Rachel Le, "Status of Women Committee RE: Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0930 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

³⁵⁰ Ibid., 1155.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1230 (Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director, DisAbled Women's Network Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0845 (Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director, Inclusion International).

costs are lower, they stay in the job longer, and they are just better all-round employees." ³⁵⁶

In a written brief, the DisAbled Women's Network Canada suggested that the federal government develop job retention mechanisms for women living with disabilities.³⁵⁷ For instance, the government could assist employers in understanding "specialized technical aids, workplace modifications, and other accommodations that may be required across a broad range of disability types."³⁵⁸ Moreover, the federal government could assist with post-placement support aimed at job retention and career growth for the individuals living with disabilities.³⁵⁹

The Committee was also told that there needs to be a move away from wage subsidies³⁶⁰ because when a subsidy or incentive ends, the employee with the disability is often let go.³⁶¹ Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services at the Sarnia and District Association for Community Living, stated that "trying to pay someone to hire a person sends a terrible message about the value of people." However, Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director at the DisAbled Women's Network Canada, said that "not getting [work] opportunities unless there's a wage subsidy on the table can be a reality" for people living with disabilities. ³⁶³

³⁵⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1025 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living).

DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "Parliamentary Brief — The Economic Security of Disabled Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare," Submitted Brief, November 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1005 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1255 (Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director, DisAbled Women's Network Canada).

FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1005 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1255 (Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director, DisAbled Women's Network Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1015 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living); Kristen Skov Hirchak and Katherine Finelli Vetro, "<u>The Curbed Glass Ceiling — A Call to Action to Improve Economic Stability for Women with</u> Disabilities in Canada," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, August 2017.

³⁶¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1040 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living).

³⁶² Ibid., 1020.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1255 (Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director, DisAbled Women's Network Canada).



b. Employment Support for Women Living with Disabilities

The Committee was told that it is often necessary to offer career exploration as a first step towards employment for people living with disabilities, as they often do not have work experience and there is a need to determine their employable skills and career interests in order to match them with a suitable position. 364

The Committee heard about the importance of applying an intersectional lens – which examines how relationships among different identity factors shape individuals' experiences of inequality and discrimination – to programs and services to ensure that diverse women living with disabilities receive relevant support. Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services at Sarnia and District Association for Community Living, suggested that the federal government ensure that its employment programs and services are fully accessible to women living with disabilities, so they have equal opportunities to enter the workforce. In a written brief, the DisAbled Women's Network Canada told the Committee that a number of federal programs should be reviewed to better respond to the needs of working women living with disabilities, such as the eligibility rules of the Disability Tax Credit and the Canada Pension Plan Disability, access to the Registered Disability Savings Plan, and the Working Income Tax Benefit Disability Supplement.

A number of witnesses explained that many Canadians have episodic disabilities, which "have fluctuating periods of ability and wellness." However, the system is created around a "dichotomy of a person either being able or unable" to work, while many of these individuals with episodic disabilities could work with accommodations. The DisAbled Women's Network Canada recommended that the disability income system allow

-

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1035 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living).

³⁶⁵ DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "Parliamentary Brief — The Economic Security of Disabled Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare," Submitted Brief, November 2017.

³⁶⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1005 (Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living).

DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "Parliamentary Brief — The Economic Security of Disabled Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare," Submitted Brief, November 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0930 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

individuals to go from employment to support programs more easily and that employers be educated on providing appropriate accommodations.³⁶⁹

The Committee heard that in provincial support programs for people living with disabilities, there are limits as to how much employment income a person can earn before the disability support gets reduced, thus creating a reluctance among some individuals to seek employment.³⁷⁰ Some witnesses said that the federal government should work with the provinces and territories to design disability support programs that strengthen the relationship of a person living with a disability to the labour market.³⁷¹

Recommendation 34

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, work to design disability support programs that strengthen the relationship of a person living with a disability to the labour market.

Recommendation 35

That the Government of Canada develop and fund a program to provide small- and medium-sized enterprises with financial support to 1) install physical infrastructure to increase accessibility in the workplace for employees living with disabilities; and 2) develop and implement workplace policies and practices designed to accommodate employees living with disabilities.

Recommendation 36

That the Government of Canada provide funding to community organizations to support programs that work to increase employment rates among women living with disabilities.

Jbid.; DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "<u>Parliamentary Brief</u> — <u>The Economic Security of Disabled</u>

<u>Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, November 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>,

1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1230 (Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director, DisAbled Women's Network Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0845 (Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director, Inclusion International).

³⁷¹ Ibid., 0850; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1155 (Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director, DisAbled Women's Network Canada).



6. Elderly Women

The Committee heard that some elderly women — particularly unattached elderly women — are at significant risk of economic insecurity. According to Statistics Canada, the low-income rate among women aged 75 and over was 17%, compared to 9.4% for men of the same age. The Committee was told about various factors influencing elderly women's economic security; some of these factors are also examined in the section on retirement and pension security.

First, the Committee heard that women are, on average, poorer than men in retirement because of lower lifetime earnings.³⁷⁴ Many women who work throughout their lives often hold lower-paying jobs that provide few or no pension benefits; as such, they have little extra income in retirement.³⁷⁵ Many elderly women may have been financially dependent on a male partner, and if that partner either leaves the relationship or dies, the women are economically vulnerable.³⁷⁶ As well, the Committee was told that elderly women face barriers in the workplace because of their age. For instance, Wanda Morris, Vice-President of Advocacy at the Canadian Association of Retired Persons, stated that "if there's a downsizing, companies often look to let go older workers, perhaps to protect the wage-earning of younger workers with families or because the older workers are at the top of the pay scale, so that it's a better win financially."³⁷⁷

Furthermore, the Committee heard about financial elder abuse, which can include the use of someone's money or property without the consent of the owner. Financial abuse

use of someone's money or property without the consent of the owner. Financial abuse

³⁷² Statistics Canada, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief, February 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); Nanaimo Family Life Association, "<u>Policy Brief: Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief; Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "<u>Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women</u>," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

³⁷⁵ Nanaimo Family Life Association, "Policy Brief: Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.

³⁷⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0900 (Beatrix Dart, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1015 (Wanda Morris, Vice-President, Advocacy, Canadian Association of Retired Persons).

is the most common type of elder abuse and has a direct impact on the financial security of the retiree. ³⁷⁸

Finally, witnesses spoke about the impact of housing on elderly women's economic security. Wanda Morris, Vice-President of Advocacy at the Canadian Association of Retired Persons, told the Committee that elderly women "want to live in a more financially sustainable way, but the [housing] options they're looking for just aren't available." Ronell Bosman, Program Director of the Samaritan House at the Island Crisis Care Society, said that there are more seniors seeking access to their shelter because of financial difficulties:

Over the last two or three years I have observed that there are people from their sixties up to their eighties, women from all walks of life, some very highly educated people. We had a psychiatric nurse. We had a teacher. We had a social worker. We had an RCMP officer.... It is usually due to trauma and violence, domestic violence, but lately it's financial difficulty. In our low-barrier shelter, it used to be drug abuse and high mental health challenges that were among the reasons people were accessing the shelter.... However, financial distress and financial difficulty are now bringing people to our doors. 380

In a written brief, the Nanaimo Family Life Association recommended that the federal government develop a national action plan for ageing Canadians, in collaboration with civil society, in order to address the challenges facing seniors, including senior women and their unique challenges.³⁸¹

³⁷⁸ Ibid., 0945.

³⁷⁹ Ibid., 0950.

³⁸⁰ Ibid., 1025 (Ronell Bosman, Program Director, Samaritan House, Island Crisis Care Society).

³⁸¹ Nanaimo Family Life Association, "Policy Brief: Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.



INCREASING WOMEN'S ECONOMIC SECURITY

Women's economic security has significantly improved in recent decades as their participation in the labour force increased. Women's representation in the labour force in Canada has steadily increased: women represented 47.3% of the labour force in 2016, up from 45.7% in 1999 and 37.1% in 1976. However, women's labour force participation rate in 2016 was lower than men's in all age categories, except one; among the 15 to 24 years' age group, the women's rate was 64.0% and the men's was 63.4%, compared to the 25 to 44 years' age group, where the women's rate was 82.2%, compared to the 91.6% rate for men. ³⁸³

This section examines factors that can increase women's access to the labour force and increase their economic security, including access to childcare, access to employment insurance, access to parental leave, pay equity, access to education, initiatives to protect income security, retirement and pension security, and tools for gender inclusive policy-making and program development.

A. CHILDCARE

The Committee was told that families in Canada have long contended with an inadequate supply of high-quality, universal, accessible, flexible, affordable and inclusive childcare, particularly for infants and toddlers. Witnesses outlined the challenges that women in regions across Canada and in diverse sectors, from health care to mining, encounter when attempting to access childcare that is affordable and fits their needs.

³⁸² Statistics Canada, "Labour force characteristics by sex and age group," Summary tables, 2016.

³⁸³ Ibid.

³⁸⁴ See for example: FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0845 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual); Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0900 (Laurell Ritchie, Co-Chair, Employment Insurance Sub Committee of the Good Jobs for All Coalition, Inter-Provincial El Working Group); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0850 (Pierre Fortin, Professor, Department of Economics, Université du Québec à Montréal, As an individual) and 1020 (Morna Ballantyne, Executive Director, Child Care Advocacy Association of Canada); Coalition of Provincial and Territorial Advisory Councils on the Status of Women, "Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada: Provincial and Territorial Perspectives," Submitted Brief, March 2017; Martha Friendly, "Access to childcare is fundamental to women's economic security in Canada: What needs to happen," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1005 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

A fundamental challenge is the shortage of high-quality, regulated childcare spaces in Canada. For instance, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women stated that there are childcare spaces for only "approximately 25% of children under 12 in 2014." 385

Furthermore, childcare spaces that do exist are costly. According to Donna Lero, professor at the Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being at the University of Guelph, said that childcare costs in Canada are among the highest among OECD countries. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women said that "many working mothers spend three to four months of their gross annual salary to pay for the high costs of childcare." Jennifer Howard, executive director at the Public Service Alliance of Canada, stated: "Getting childcare in Canada is almost always a matter of luck or personal wealth."

Childcare costs also vary widely across Canada, as explained by Donna Lero: "In 2016, average monthly fees for infant care ranged from as low as \$152 per month in Montreal—a reflection of Quebec's childcare policies—to over \$1,600 a month in Toronto." 389

The Committee was told about the federal Canada Child Benefit (CCB), which was launched in July 2016³⁹⁰ and is "a tax-free monthly payment made to eligible families to help them with the cost of raising children under 18 years of age," including the cost of childcare. According to Employment and Social Development Canada, the introduction of the CCB "has resulted in "about 300,000 fewer children living in poverty,

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0845 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0855 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0845 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1215 (Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate, Strategic and Service Policy Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

³⁹¹ Government of Canada, <u>Canada child benefit — Overview</u>.



which represents a reduction of about 40% in child poverty."³⁹² In a written brief, YWCA Canada recommended that the federal government "maintain the Canada Child Benefit as a permanent transfer indexed to inflation."³⁹³ However, Martha Friendly, Executive Director of the Childcare Resource and Research Unit, said that "from a common sense point of view, [the CCB is] too little money to pay for childcare. It's not intended to pay for childcare."³⁹⁴

1. How Women Benefit from Access to Childcare

The lack of access to high-quality affordable childcare was identified as a significant barrier to women's economic security because women bear a disproportionate responsibility, compared to men, for the unpaid care of children. Witnesses spoke of societal expectations and workplace culture that assumes women are the primary caregivers for their children at home and that women be responsible for arranging childcare if they want to work. 395

The Committee heard that the provision of accessible, affordable childcare is a key element in promoting women's labour force attachment. Lack of access to childcare limits women's ability to seek education and training, limits women's opportunities to re-enter the workforce, hurts their ability to achieve professional goals, and leads many women to seek part-time and precarious employment. Witnesses spoke of the number of ways that access to childcare improves women's economic security and prosperity, as outlined in this section.

- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1215 (Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate, Strategic and Service Policy Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).
- 393 YWCA Canada, "Improving Economic Security for Women YWCA Canada Brief to the House Standing Committee on Status of Women Study on Women's Economic Security," Submitted Brief, March 2017.
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0910 (Martha Friendly, Executive Director, Childcare Resource and Research Unit).
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1210 (Zahra Jimale, Director of Law Reform, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1030 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).
- 396 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0955 (Doug Murphy, Director General, Social Development Policy, Department of Employment and Social Development); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0905 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1035 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual).
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0845 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

To begin, access to childcare creates opportunities for women to return to or to seek employment, particularly full-time opportunities. The Committee heard that without access to appropriate childcare services, women are sometimes required to accept only part-time or precarious work. The Canadian Association of University Teachers said: "Unable to afford adequate childcare [women] are forced to give up on their career, in which they have invested years of their lives, in order to support their families."

A number of witnesses provided the implementation of a childcare program in Quebec as an example of the impact of childcare on women's employment. ⁴⁰¹ Ann Decter, Director of Advocacy and Public Policy at the YWCA Canada, explained:

In Quebec, between the introduction of childcare as a social policy in 1996 and 2008, employment rates for mothers with children under the age of six increased by 22%. The number of single mothers on social assistance was reduced by more than half, from 99,000 to 45,000, and their after-tax median income rose by 81%. 402

Furthermore, access to childcare improves a woman's ability to advance her career, which can help her to obtain professional success including promotions and salary raises. Pierre Fortin, professor in the department of economics at the Université du Québec à Montréal, explained that having access to childcare makes a woman's "career less discontinuous, which accelerates her acquisition of experience and raises her wages."

Also, when women have access to affordable childcare, they are better able to face unanticipated financial hardships, which include "the risk of separation [from their spouse or partner], which is very high nowadays." Relationship breakdowns place

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1140 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).

⁴⁰⁰ Canadian Association of University Teachers, "CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1140 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).

⁴⁰² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0905 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0845 (Pierre Fortin, Professor, Department of Economics, Université du Québec à Montréal, As an individual).

⁴⁰⁴ Ibid.



financial pressures on women, and can lead women to increase work hours or return to work to cover the cost. Furthermore, women often remain the primary caregiver for their children, creating increased financial and time pressures. 405

Lastly, when a woman's salary is lower than her male partner's salary — which is often the case, in part because of the existing gender wage gap — it is considered the secondary household income. As a result, if there isn't appropriate access to childcare — either because of concerns over quality, a limited number of spaces, a prohibitively high cost or other reasons — it is often the individual with the "secondary income" who provides unpaid childcare at home. In these cases, the father will remain in or return to the workplace, while the mother either accepts part-time employment or is left entirely out of the labour force. Auth Halperin-Kaddari, vice-chair of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, said "we cannot blame the individual couples or partners who are taking the most economically efficient choice they can take when their intention is simply to survive in the most economical manner they can."

Witnesses noted that when women give up paid employment to take care of their children, they are often financially dependent on their spouses. This economic insecurity can be problematic: women are at risk of poverty if relationships end and women may be unable to leave relationships in cases of domestic violence. 408

2. Federal Leadership on Childcare

While witnesses recognized the provincial, territorial and municipal roles in providing childcare, many witnesses requested federal leadership in establishing accessible, adaptable, and affordable childcare across Canada. 409

⁴⁰⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1210 (Zahra Jimale, Director of Law Reform, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

⁴⁰⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

⁴⁰⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1140 (Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1210 (Zahra Jimale, Director of Law Reform, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund); Parents jusqu'au bout, "<u>Brief to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women,</u>" Submitted Brief.

See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0850 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation) and 0900 (Willem Adema, Senior Economist, Social Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development) and 0905 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada) and 1005 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0855 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual).

During the course of the Committee's study, the Committee learned that in Budget 2016 and Budget 2017, the federal government committed \$7.5 billion over 11 years, starting in 2017-2018 to "support and create more high-quality, affordable childcare spaces across the country." Officials from Employment and Social Development Canada provided additional details on the new childcare investments.

In June 2017, the Federal, Provincial and Territorial Ministers Responsible for Early Learning and Childcare agreed to a multilateral early learning and childcare framework, in which the guiding principles are to: "increase quality, accessibility, affordability, flexibility and inclusivity in early learning and childcare." The federal government is negotiating individual bilateral funding agreements with the provinces and territories designed to address their specific early learning and childcare needs; agreements are currently established with Ontario, Prince Edward Island, New Brunswick, and Nunavut. An official from Employment and Social Development Canada stated that the advantage of negotiating bilateral agreements with the provinces and territories is that each jurisdiction can "target the money to meet their unique circumstances. Some places lack childcare workers. Others have low pay for childcare workers. Others have physical space issues."

Funding from this commitment will also be invested in collecting data to better understand the childcare situation in Canada and to track outcomes of the new initiative. As well, a distinct Indigenous early learning and childcare framework will be developed through a separate process in order to "recognize the unique and different local community needs on [First Nations] reserves, among Inuit and Métis children and families, and among other [I]ndigenous [people]." This framework will be coordinated through special agreements established directly with Indigenous organizations. The Committee heard that the Indigenous friendship centre movement is currently working

⁴¹⁰ Government of Canada, <u>Building a Strong Middle Class: Budget 2017</u>, 22 March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1235 (Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate, Strategic and Service Policy Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

⁴¹² Government of Canada, *Early Learning and Child Care*.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1235 (Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate, Strategic and Service Policy Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

⁴¹⁴ Ibid.

⁴¹⁵ Ibid.

⁴¹⁶ Ibid, 1255.



closely with Employment and Social Development Canada on the Indigenous Early Learning and Childcare Framework. 417

3. Key Elements of a Canadian Childcare Framework

Witnesses shared key elements that they said should be part of the framework for Canada's childcare system. Firstly, there is a need for inclusive childcare with the capacity to meet the needs of children from diverse backgrounds, such as children from low-income families, children of different cultural backgrounds, and children with different abilities. 418

Furthermore, there is a need for flexible childcare services to fit a variety of parental needs, such as parents who work non-standard hours, including shift work, and the conditions of different communities, such as rural and urban. As well, there should be childcare that is culturally appropriate for Indigenous children and provided to both urban Indigenous populations and in Indigenous communities. Meg Gingrich, Research Representative at the National Office of the United Steelworkers, said that childcare must be "inclusive, regardless of ability; economic, cultural, or linguistic circumstances; location; or workforce status."

Secondly, working conditions need to be improved and wages need to be increased in order to improve both recruitment and retention of qualified childhood educators. ⁴²² The Committee heard that a living wage should be provided to childcare workers. ⁴²³

⁴¹⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1130 (Sonya Howard, Policy Officer, National Association of Friendship Centres).

FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0920 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1015 (Doug Murphy, Director General, Social Development Policy, Department of Employment and Social Development); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1100 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0905 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "<u>Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1130 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).</u>

⁴²¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

⁴²² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0855 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada) and 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

⁴²³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

Morna Ballantyne, Executive Director at the Childcare Advocacy Association of Canada, explained, "retaining staff to the [early childhood educator] profession is not possible when the predominantly female childcare workforce works for substandard wages and in impossibly difficult conditions." Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor at Oxfam Canada, asked for initiatives "to ensure living wages and pay equity for childcare workers, and supplemented with equitable family leave support and flexible work arrangements." Page 1972.

The Committee received a number of suggestions on how a Canadian childcare framework should be designed in order to be both effective and sustainable. A number of witnesses asked that the federal government develop a national strategy, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, to ensure access to affordable childcare. The Committee heard that when the federal government provides funding for childcare to the provinces and territories, it should set up standards and principles for the delivery. A27

A number of witnesses asked that a childcare framework establish a universal system, whereby childcare is "accessible and affordable for all families and inclusive." The Committee was informed that having a universal system has important social benefits; "it generates contacts between higher-income children and lower-income children.... It is

⁴²⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0955 (Morna Ballantyne, Executive Director, Childcare Advocacy Association of Canada).

⁴²⁵ FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0905 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1005 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0855 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada) and 1005 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0850 (Pierre Fortin, Professor, Department of Economics, Université du Québec à Montréal, As an individual).

⁴²⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1130 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0915 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor) et 1005 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives) and 1010 (Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist, Canadian Labour Congress); Kim Hiscott, Andrew Fleck Children's Services, "<u>Planning for Early Learning and Care in Canada: Moving from the Current Market Approach Towards a Universal System</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, June 2017.

⁴²⁹ United Steelworkers, "Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, April 2017.



an investment in equality in Canada. "430 The Committee heard that public funding for childcare should be directed to the not-for-profit sector, which is better able to evolve over time to meet a community's unique needs. 431 As well, the growth of childcare spaces should be focused on "multi-service, multi-site non-profit operators with a demonstrated ability to meet their community's needs." Multi-service centres provide a range of programs, including childcare, early learning care, and support and resources for children with special needs. The Committee also heard that federal funding could be tied to requirements for a minimum number of staff at each facility having a minimum level of child education training. 433

In addition, Kim Hiscott of Andrew Fleck Children's Services said that the provinces should be required to establish regional salary scales for staff at childcare centres. For instance, a requirement could be introduced that in order to access public funding, agencies must commit to compensate staff based on an established scale. In a written brief, Kim Hiscott suggested that a salary scale "would stabilize staff, ensuring they are appropriately compensated and limit employee movement based exclusively on salaries" and recommended examining Manitoba's salary scale model as an example. 434

In addition, witnesses emphasized the importance of collaboration between the federal government and other jurisdictions to maximize childcare results. Furthermore, some witnesses told the Committee that federal funding to the provinces should be made subject to conditions as to how it should be spent in order to prioritize important concerns. For example, Zahra Jimale, Director of Law Reform at the West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund asked that the following conditions be applied to federal funding:

⁴³⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0925 (Pierre Fortin, Professor, Department of Economics, Université du Québec à Montréal, As an individual).

Kim Hiscott, Andrew Fleck Children's Services, "Planning for Early Learning and Care in Canada: Moving from the Current Market Approach Towards a Universal System," Submitted Brief, June 2017.

⁴³² Ibid.

⁴³³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0935 (Pierre Fortin, Professor, Department of Economics, Université du Québec à Montréal, As an individual).

Kim Hiscott, Andrew Fleck Children's Services, "Planning for Early Learning and Care in Canada: Moving from the Current Market Approach Towards a Universal System," Submitted Brief, June 2017.

⁴³⁵ Ibid; Canadian Federation of University Women, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0935 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

Prioritized access to free childcare for women fleeing violence, women who need support to parent, and children awaiting kinship care placements; flexible childcare services that provide a range of childcare programs that accommodate work schedules outside of the usual Monday to Friday and 9 a.m. to 5 p.m. workweek; availability of childcare services and supports to all regardless of immigration status, particularly women who are fleeing violence; childcare services and support that are separate from the childcare protection system to ensure that women do not fear asking for assistance; availability of culturally appropriate childcare for [I]ndigenous children; and fully accessible childcare services for children with disabilities.

Recommendation 37

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, ensure that all childcare investments are accompanied by reporting mechanisms and indicators for long-term data collection that will provide all levels of government with appropriate forecasting and analysis tools to improve childcare services, with the goal of achieving high-quality, universal, accessible, flexible, affordable and inclusive childcare.

Recommendation 38

That the Government of Canada, when investing in childcare, recognize the specific and unique needs of: children in rural, remote, northern and urban communities; children from low-income families; children from single-parent families; children of different cultural backgrounds, including new immigrants; children with different abilities; and Indigenous children.

Recommendation 39

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, provide childcare options, including care in the home, for parents working irregular hours and shift work.

Recommendation 40

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, collect national data about the availability of subsidized childcare on post-secondary education institutions' campuses.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1210 (Zahra Jimale, Director of Law Reform, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund) and 1245 (Kasari Govender, Executive Director, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).



B. EMPLOYMENT INSURANCE — REGULAR BENEFITS

1. Overview of Employment Insurance in Canada

The federal government's Employment Insurance (EI) program, through its Regular Benefits component, offers temporary income support to unemployed workers while they search for employment or upgrade their skills. To qualify, they must have paid premiums in the past year and meet certain eligibility conditions. Self-employed workers may choose to register in the EI program as well.

The EI program also delivers Special Benefits to workers who take time away from the workplace for specific life events. These benefits include: 438

- Maternity and parental benefits: for Canadians who are pregnant, have recently given birth, are adopting a child and caring for a newborn.
 Maternity and parental special benefits are discussed in the later section on "Parental Leave".
- Sickness benefits: for Canadians who are unable to work due to illness or injury.
- Compassionate care benefits: for Canadians who must be away from work to provide care to a gravely ill family member who is at risk of death.
- Family Caregiver Benefit for Children: for Canadians who must be away from work to provide care or support to a critically ill or injured child. This benefit replaced the Parents of Critically Ill Children benefit in December 2017.⁴³⁹

Government of Canada, <u>Employment Insurance (EI)</u>; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0955 and 1000 (Andrew Brown, Executive Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

Government of Canada, Employment Insurance (EI); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0955 and 1000 (Andrew Brown, Executive Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1240 (Kristen Underwood, Acting Senior Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Department of Employment and Social Development).

⁴³⁹ Government of Canada, <u>Introducing a new Family Caregiver benefit for children</u>.

 Family Caregiver Benefit for Adults: for Canadians who must be away from work to provide care or support to a critically ill or injured adult. This benefit was established in December 2017.⁴⁴⁰

The Committee was informed that historically a higher proportion of men than women have held full-time and permanent employment in Canada, with women over-represented in part-time and temporary work; this led to a higher EI eligibility rate among men. However, according to the Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report 2015-2016, women's eligibility rate was 84.3% in 2015, compared to men's 82.0% rate. An official from Employment and Social Development Canada said that it is unclear whether women's higher eligibility rate is a new trend that will continue or whether rates will return to the historical norm.

2. Suggested Changes to Employment Insurance

The Committee heard from witnesses that EI Regular Benefits should reflect the reality of the evolving job market and modern work schedules. 443 To begin, a number of witnesses said that the 35-hour work week does not reflect the modern work week of many workers, and that EI Regular Benefits should be revised to address the needs of precarious and part-time workers. 444 Women are disproportionately employed in

⁴⁴⁰ Government of Canada, Introducing a new El Family Caregiver benefit.

Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report for the fiscal year beginning April 1, 2015 and ending March 31, 2016</u>, 2016; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1000 (Andrew Brown, Executive Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1000 (Andrew Brown, Executive Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

Good Jobs for All Coalition, "Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance," Submitted Brief,
February 2017; Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief.

Canadian Association of University Teachers, "CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; Good Jobs for All Coalition, "Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance," Submitted Brief, February 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1135 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers); YWCA Canada, "Improving Economic Security for Women — YWCA Canada — Brief to the House Standing Committee on Status of Women Study on Women's Economic Security," Submitted Brief, March 2017.



precarious and part-time jobs, and because of the nature of this work, they often do not qualify for EI. 445

For example, employees in the male-dominated goods-producing industries have, on average, a 38-hour work week, while those employed in the female-dominated service sectors, have, on average, a 28-hour work week. As well, millions of women work in "retail stores, restaurants, hotels, factories and health and education support services" and many of these occupations experience "periodic layoffs and job losses that require better access to EI." Therefore, the Committee heard that there is a need to "reform EI" to suit both workers in "standard work, typically full-time paid employment, and non-standard work, including part-time, casual work and other work classified as self-employment by governments."

The Committee also heard that the federal government should review and strengthen EI provisions for self-employed people and should improve awareness among self-employed workers of the benefits for contributing to the EI system. As Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager of the Administrative Office at the Women's Economic Council, predicted that there will be a steady increase of self-employed Canadians, particularly with the increase in automation, and as such, access to EI benefits is critical. She explains: If [self-employed Canadians] can't get sick leave or maternity leave and their business has to close.... People don't close their business and go bankrupt by choice. If that happens, they need the security of those social systems.

A number of witnesses also stated that EI Regular Benefits should have a lower eligibility requirement across the country which would help workers in precarious and part-time

Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —
A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief; Good Jobs for All
Coalition, "Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance," Submitted Brief, February 2017;
FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0900 (Laurell Ritchie, Co-Chair, Employment Insurance Sub Committee of the Good Jobs for All Coalition, Inter-Provincial EI Working Group); Kathleen
Lahey, "Economic Gender Equality in Canada: Market, Care, Tax, and Benefit Issues and Solutions,"
Submitted Brief, February 2017.

Good Jobs for All Coalition, "<u>Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance</u>," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

⁴⁴⁷ Ibid.

Women's Economic Council, "Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 —

Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

⁴⁴⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1030 (Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager, Administrative Office, Women's Economic Council).

⁴⁵⁰ Ibid.

employment access benefits. ⁴⁵¹ Some witnesses said that the federal government should lower entry requirements to a uniform national qualifying standard of 360 hours for a basic EI claim in all regions across Canada. ⁴⁵² In a written brief, the Good Jobs for All Coalition said: "All the flexibility in the world won't help if you can't get in the front door." ⁴⁵³ As well, it was recommended that the window of time in which to bank EI hours be extended, either doubled ⁴⁵⁴ or extended to up to five years. ⁴⁵⁵ The Committee heard that reducing the qualifying EI hours would help groups, such as Indigenous women, who face barriers in maintaining attachment to the labour market. ⁴⁵⁶

The Committee heard that the EI benefit rates should be increased. ⁴⁵⁷ According to the Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report 2015-2016, women's average weekly EI benefit was \$406 in 2015/2016 compared to \$470 for men. ⁴⁵⁸ In a written brief, the Canadian Women's Foundation said that the federal government should raise

See for example: Canadian Association of University Teachers, "CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief,
March 2017; Good Jobs for All Coalition, "Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance,"
Submitted Brief, February 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0845 (Ruth Rose-Lizée, Member, Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail); Mariam Pirzada,
"Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women in the Workforce," Submitted Brief; Alana Changoor, Submitted Brief, August 2017.

Good Jobs for All Coalition, "Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance," Submitted Brief,
February 2017; Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission
to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session,
42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0905 (Laurell Ritchie, Co-Chair, Employment Insurance Sub Committee
of the Good Jobs for All Coalition, Inter-Provincial El Working Group); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session,
42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1010 (Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist, Canadian Labour Congress).

Good Jobs for All Coalition, "<u>Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance</u>," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

National Association of Friendship Centres, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," *Submitted Brief*, May 2017.

⁴⁵⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

National Association of Friendship Centres, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," *Submitted Brief*, May 2017.

⁴⁵⁷ Good Jobs for All Coalition, "<u>Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance</u>," *Submitted Brief*, February 2017.

Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report</u> for the fiscal year beginning April 1, 2015 and ending March 31, 2016, 2016; Government of Canada, <u>Employment Insurance (EI)</u>.



benefits from the current level of 55% of insurable earnings to 60% based on the best 12 weeks of earnings. 459

Many witnesses also asked for changes to the sick leave requirements for EI Special Benefits. According to the Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report 2015-2016, women made greater use of the EI Sickness Benefit (56% of sick claims) and made up the majority of the population (at 58%) to exhaust the current 15 week maximum. As such, the Committee heard that women are more likely than men to suffer financial hardship because of the 15 week maximum for Sick Benefits; as such, Sick Benefits should be extended to 26 weeks, to match the Compassionate Care Benefits.

Furthermore, the Committee was told that sick leave Special Benefits should include provisions for episodic sick leave, because many serious health conditions, for instance mental health issues, may require short and sudden periods of leave from work. 462

Lastly, the Committee heard that EI Benefits should be reformed to include options for training and post-secondary education programs. In a written brief, the Good Jobs for All Coalition said: "Women need to know they can pay the rent or mortgage if they participate in upgrading, pre-apprentice training or skills development." 463

Recommendation 41

That the Government of Canada apply gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) to the federal Employment Insurance program and update any Employment Insurance requirements to improve access for precarious, seasonal, and low-wage workers.

⁴⁵⁹ Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report</u> for the fiscal year beginning April 1, 2015 and ending March 31, 2016, 2016; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 10135 (Andrew Brown, Executive Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

⁴⁶¹ Good Jobs for All Coalition, "<u>Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance</u>," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

⁴⁶² FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0940 (Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director, Inclusion International).

Good Jobs for All Coalition, "<u>Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance</u>," *Submitted Brief*, February 2017.

C. MATERNITY AND PARENTAL LEAVE (EMPLOYMENT INSURANCE — SPECIAL BENEFITS)

At the federal level, maternity and parental leave are considered a special benefit under the federal EI program and are provided to biological, adoptive, or legally recognized parents. Maternity benefits are provided to "eligible biological mothers who cannot work because they are pregnant or have recently given birth." Parental benefits are available to "parents who take a leave from work to care for a newborn or recently adopted child or children." Both maternity and parental leave claimants must meet the "eligibility requirements for EI special benefits in terms of insurable hours of employment or earnings."

EI Maternity and Parental leave provides the following benefits:⁴⁶⁷

- A maximum of 15 weeks of EI maternity benefits is available at a weekly benefit rate of 55% of the claimant's average weekly insurable earnings.
- Standard parental benefits: 35 weeks of leave at a weekly benefit rate of 55% of the claimant's average weekly insurable earnings up to a maximum amount of \$543/week (as of December 2017). Two parents can share these weeks.
- Extended parental benefits: 61 weeks of leave at a weekly benefit rate of 33% of the claimant's average weekly insurable earnings up to a maximum amount of \$326/week (as of December 2017). Two parents can share these weeks.

Federal EI maternity and parental benefits are delivered to individuals who reside outside of Quebec, as Quebec residents are provided with leave through the Quebec Parental Insurance Plan (QPIP). 468 Established in 2006, the QPIP provides maternity,

Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report</u> for the fiscal year beginning April 1, 2015 and ending March 31, 2016, 2016.

⁴⁶⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁶⁷ Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>El Maternity and Parental Benefits — Overview</u>; Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>El Maternity and Parental Benefits - How much could you receive</u>.

Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report</u> for the fiscal year beginning April 1, 2015 and ending March 31, 2016, 2016.



paternity, parental or adoption leave benefits to all eligible workers, including selfemployed individuals. 469

A number of witnesses asked that federal maternity and parental leave be modernized and improved by removing parental leave from the EI system — a system designed for unemployed Canadians — and recognizing it as a "care" policy, rather than an "unemployment" policy. The Committee heard that the EI restrictions limiting access to maternity and parental leave make it inequitable and difficult to access. Moreover, the Committee heard that there is a significant parental leave gap between high-income and low-income families; high-income mothers are more likely to qualify for maternity benefits and to earn significantly more in financial benefits per week, when compared to low-income mothers.

Andrea Doucet, Professor and Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care at Brock University said that federal maternity leave, parental leave and childcare should be provided through a coherent plan which acknowledges the interconnection of family caregiving. While access to childcare is important, the Committee heard that childcare for infants should not be a widespread solution to the unavailability of parental leave for many Canadians. Engineers Canada requested that following maternity and parental leave, employees should have access to other forms of leave, such as working part-time, teleworking or job-sharing.

⁴⁶⁹ Travail, Emploi et Solidarité sociale Québec, What is the Québec Parental Insurance Plan?.

⁴⁷⁰ Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail, "Economic Security of Women — Brief submitted by the Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail (CIAFT) to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, May 2017; Engineers Canada, "Engineers Canada's Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.

⁴⁷¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0920 (Martha Friendly, Executive Director, Childcare Resource and Research Unit).

Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0955 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual); Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee</u>, <u>House of Commons of Canada</u>, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," *Submitted Brief*.

⁴⁷⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0920 (Martha Friendly, Executive Director, Childcare Resource and Research Unit).

⁴⁷⁵ Engineers Canada, "Engineers Canada's Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.

A number of witnesses said that to increase women's economic security, there is a need to improve gender balance in parental leave-taking as women still take a disproportionate amount of leave. According to an official from Employment and Social Development Canada, approximately 86% of parental benefits are taken by women and only 14% are taken by men. 477

The Committee was told that maternity and parental leave is disproportionately taken by women for two central reasons: firstly, cultural and societal expectations and norms that assign childcare to mothers, rather than fathers, and secondly, women often have lower incomes than their spouses so it is a financial necessity for the higher-earning spouse — generally the man — to continue working. As a result, women's departure from the workforce results in a loss of professional opportunities, loss of career advancement and promotion to senior positions, long-term loss of income, and reduced pension contributions. Furthermore, the economic independence and security of a woman who does not return to the workforce after parental leave is negatively affected.

Balancing parental leave responsibility between both parents has a number of benefits; it serves to increase women's labour market participation rate⁴⁸¹ and it improves women's access to senior positions.⁴⁸² Moreover, some employers see parental leave as

⁴⁷⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0910 (Willem Adema, Senior Economist, Social Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development).

⁴⁷⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1010 (Andrew Brown, Executive Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0915 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0950 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual); Beatrix Dart, "<u>Gender Diversity in Canada — Briefing to the Canadian House of Commons'</u>
Standing Committee on the Status of Women Presented by Prof. Beatrix Dart," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, May 2017.

Advancement of Women Halton, "<u>Women and the Workforce</u>," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 1020 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0950 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual).

⁴⁸⁰ Beatrix Dart, "Gender Diversity in Canada — Briefing to the Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women Presented by Prof. Beatrix Dart," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

⁴⁸¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec).

Beatrix Dart, "Gender Diversity in Canada — Briefing to the Canadian House of Commons' Standing

Committee on the Status of Women Presented by Prof. Beatrix Dart," Submitted Brief, May 2017.



an expensive and troublesome risk associated with hiring young female employees. Danniele Livengood, Director of the Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology, explained that if both parents share leave time, it would transform the way that employers see young women:

[Parental leave] will be a risk that all employees carry. They all will take leave. They all will support their families. It will just be something that is inherent with having employees rather than being a risk that women carry by themselves. 484

1. Dedicated Parental Leave for a Second Parent

The Committee heard that men's increased involvement in caring for their children from the beginning of their lives — through parental leave or as stay-at-home parents — can contribute to shifting social and cultural values in society and improve awareness of the importance of care work. Furthermore, the opportunity to care for their children can transform men's lives, providing them a valuable connection with their children. In Stinson, Research Associate at the Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, explained that: "There is evidence that if men start early, they will have greater participation throughout the child's life." In a written brief, Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons explained that this could "lead to transformative changes for men's lives, gender relations, gender equality, and men's

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1025 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0925 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0915 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1025 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0950 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual); Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "<u>Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee</u>, <u>House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

⁴⁸⁶ FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0930 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor).

⁴⁸⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1000 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

understanding (as fathers and as workers) of the vital importance of care work for democratic and just societies." 488

The Committee heard that many fathers do not feel able or comfortable asking for parental leave from their employers. Many men take "invisible paternity leave," whereby they "take time off from work as vacation time, or even sick days." Andrea Doucet, Professor and Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care at Brock University, said: "There's still an expectation that this is women's work. Several fathers told us that they were sometimes treated differently and negatively at work after taking more than one period of parental leave." Andrea Doucet explained:

[Gendered] assumptions have shifted a great deal over the last quarter century, but what has changed little is the expectation that it is women and not men who will care for infants and toddlers. 492

Andrea Doucet, in her research, told the Committee that an Ottawa stay-at-home father said to her: "Even in a society where people believe that men and women are equal and can do just about everything, they don't really believe that men can do this with a baby, especially a really tiny baby." 493

A great number of witnesses recommended that the federal government establish dedicated parental leave for the second parent, who is generally a man, in the style of

Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief.

⁴⁸⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0910 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

⁴⁹⁰ Ibid

⁴⁹¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0950 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual).

⁴⁹² Ibid., 0945.

⁴⁹³ Ibid., 0950.



"use it or lose it" in order to encourage the sharing of care responsibilities and leave from the workplace. 494

Donna Lero, Professor Emerita at the Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being at the University of Guelph, explained that dedicated parental leave for fathers "has at its core the idea of gender equality and the idea that it encourages men, in most cases, to have a greater role in childcare as it enables women to get back into the labour force." 495

The Committee heard that parental leave for fathers must be designated for the second parent, which provides them an important incentive to take it.⁴⁹⁶ Moreover, increasing men's use of parental leave should not take away from maternity leave, particularly breastfeeding time in the early months of an infant's life.⁴⁹⁷ The Committee heard that at least 10 OECD countries had introduced, in some form, a period of leave reserved for fathers, "either via bonuses, financial incentives, or by giving quota within parental leave legislation that fathers can use on a 'use it or lose it' basis."

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0900 (Willem Adema, Senior Economist, Social Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1050 (Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist, Canadian Labour Congress); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0950 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1025 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology) and 0940 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0920 (Martha Friendly, Executive Director, Childcare Resource and Research Unit).

⁴⁹⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0910 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 1030 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0915 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1010 (Andrew Brown, Executive Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

⁴⁹⁷ Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief.

⁴⁹⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0900 (Willem Adema, Senior Economist, Social Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development).

Lastly, in a written brief, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women said that the federal government should create incentives so that private sector employers encourage men to use parental leave. 499

The Committee was informed that the province of Quebec has a dedicated paternity leave for fathers, and that this could serve as a model or as inspiration for a Canada-wide program. According to an official from Employment and Social Development Canada, approximately 85% of men in Quebec will use some parental benefits, compared to 12% of men in the rest of Canada. In the rest of Canada.

Carole Gingras, Director of the Status of Women Service at the Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec, explained that: "The paternity leave provisions mean that a father is entitled to take five or three weeks at home, depending on the individual's base plan. If he does not do that, those weeks are not transferable." 502

Recommendation 42

That the Government of Canada immediately establish, in the federal jurisdiction, dedicated parental leave for the second parent in the style of "use it or lose it" in order to encourage the sharing between parents of care responsibilities and leave from the workplace.

Recommendation 43

That the Government of Canada examine domestic and international parental leave best practices, with the goal of promoting the equitable sharing of child-rearing responsibilities between men and women and increasing men's participation in childcare.

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017.

⁵⁰⁰ Travail, Emploi et Solidarité sociale Québec, What is the Québec Parental Insurance Plan?.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1010 (Andrew Brown, Executive Director, Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch, Department of Employment and Social Development).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0935 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec).



2. Eligibility Requirements, Wage Replacement and Other Features of Federal Parental Leave

Several witnesses said that the eligibility requirements for maternity leave should be lowered, as many new mothers do not qualify for leave. ⁵⁰³ The Committee heard that outside Quebec, new mothers do not have access to federal maternity benefits, unless they qualify for EI, thus excluding, on average, 38% of mothers in Canada (outside Quebec). ⁵⁰⁴

Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, said recent data indicate that under the current EI system, approximately "36% of mothers do not qualify" and "mothers in lower-income families are most excluded, with 56% left out under EI." She indicated that women in Quebec are more likely to qualify — only 11% of new mothers do not qualify — because "EI requires 600 hours; QPIP only requires having earned \$2,000, which is about 186 hours at minimum wage."

The Committee heard that when women do not qualify for maternity leave, it can put them in a situation of economic insecurity and high stress. ⁵⁰⁷ Andrea Doucet, Professor and Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care at Brock University, spoke of her three daughters:

All three are in precarious work: an actor, a video editor, a project manager in the non-profit sector. They do not have benefits; they go from contract to contract. They do not accumulate 600 hours with the same employer in any given year. Two of them have partners who are in precarious employment. If and when they choose to have children,

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1025 (Tamara Franz-Odendaal, Professor and Chair for Women in Science and Engineering, Department of Biology, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual).

⁵⁰³ Ibid., 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada) and 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0920 (Martha Friendly, Executive Director, Childcare Resource and Research Unit).

⁵⁰⁴ Women's Economic Council, "Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0955 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual).

⁵⁰⁶ Ibid.; Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief.

they will likely not qualify for parental leave benefits, so I'm speaking today not only as a scholar who's written about gender equality issues for about a quarter-century, I speak as a mother of three adult children who are all in precarious work. 508

The Committee heard that the federal government should raise income replacement for parental leave, which is currently set at 55% of salary for 35 weeks or 33% of salary for 61 weeks. This would assist families with the economic challenge of raising a newborn with one parent at home, and it can motivate parents — particularly men — to take leave. Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers, suggested raising parental leave income replacement to 70% of income. The salary for 35% of salary for 35% o

The Good Jobs for All Coalition, in a written brief, said that the federal government should create an extended period of benefits, so that workers qualify for additional assistance if their maternity/parental leave falls either before or after a layoff for which regular EI benefits were paid. ⁵¹¹

The Committee was informed that the federal government recently introduced an extended parental leave benefit (with 33% of salary for 61 weeks), to accompany the standard parental leave benefit. The Committee heard that extending the duration of leave, without increasing the total wage replacement or providing dedicated second parent leave, could have two negative effects: 1) it could increase the parental leave gap between rich and poor families, allowing families with greater financial wealth to take longer leave; and 2) it could lead women to be on leave from work for longer, without

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 0955 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual).

Ibid., 0950; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada); Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, "Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy"," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

Good Jobs for All Coalition, "<u>Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance</u>," *Submitted Brief*, February 2017; FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0905 (Laurell Ritchie, Co-Chair, Employment Insurance Sub Committee of the Good Jobs for All Coalition, Inter-Provincial El Working Group).



necessarily sharing that time off with their spouse, which would have a cumulatively negative effect on their long-term earnings. 512

D. PAY EQUITY

According to witnesses, pay equity policies and legislation are essential measures to address the gender pay gap. ⁵¹³ The Committee heard that a lack of pay equity for women in Canada is a significant contributor to the gender wage gap. ⁵¹⁴ Pay equity is enshrined in the 1977 *Canadian Human Rights Act* (CHRA), which states that employers have the legal obligation to ensure their employees receive equal pay for work of equal value. ⁵¹⁵

The Canadian Human Rights Commission, established under the CHRA, oversees complaints based on 11 grounds of discrimination, including sex and gender identity or expression. An employee, group of employees or their bargaining agent can file a complaint with the Commission, at which point the Commission can investigate and then settle, dismiss or refer the matter to the Canadian Human Rights Tribunal for consideration and resolution. The Commission does not proactively initiative investigations of pay equity; consequently, the current federal approach to pay equity is primarily a complaint-driven process. ⁵¹⁶

- Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —

 A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence,

 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0935 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External
 Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament,

 9 February 2017, 1015 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As
 an individual).
- 516 Canadian Human Rights Commission, *Our Work;* Canadian Human Rights Tribunal, *About the Tribunal*.

Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief; Donna S. Lero, "A Brief Supplementing Testimony to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women on Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0935 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —

A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence,

1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1015 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law,
University of British Columbia, As an individual); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament,
21 February 2017, 0855 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual).

The federal pay equity system also involves some other legislation. The *Equal Wage Guidelines*, 1986 provide direction on the pay equity provisions of the CHRA, including the four factors used to assess the value of work: skill, effort, responsibility and working conditions. Section 249 of the *Canada Labour Code*, Part III provides the inspectors of Employment and Social Development Canada's Labour Program with the authority to examine information related to pay equity and report violations to the Commission, which can then initiate an investigation. Section 249 of the Canada Labour Program with the authority to examine information related to pay equity and report violations to the Commission,

In 2009, a new federal pay equity law, entitled the *Public Sector Equitable Compensation Act* (PSECA), received Royal Assent, but it has not yet been enacted. However, transitional provisions in PSECA have resulted in some federal public service pay equity complaints being transferred to the Public Sector Labour Relations and Employment Board.

An official from SWC told the Committee that the federal government has committed to tabling legislation on pay equity in 2018. 519

A number of witnesses indicated that the current complaints-based system is ineffective, 520 with pay equity cases that "have dragged on for 15 and 20 years." Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering at the University of Ottawa and NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering, said:

After obtaining a Ph.D. in aerospace engineering from one of the top institutions in the world, I interviewed and received a job offer from the Boeing aerospace company at 15% less pay than my almost identical classmate. I was told there was absolutely nothing I could do about it; that was just the way it was. 522

⁵¹⁷ Equal Wages Guidelines, 1986, SOR/86-1082.

⁵¹⁸ Canada Labour Code, R.S.C. 1985, c. L-2.

⁵¹⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0915 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

⁵²⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1210 (Zahra Jimale, Director of Law Reform, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

⁵²¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0915 (Ruth Rose-Lizée, Member, Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0850 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering).



Many witnesses said that the federal government should implement proactive pay equity legislation as soon as possible to address pay inequity in Canada. Proactive pay equity legislation would place the onus on employers to ensure pay equity, rather than requiring that individuals, groups of employees and unions pursue complaints. Lennifer Howard, Executive Director of the Public Service Alliance of Canada, stated, proactive pay equity legislation is a front-end solution. It's one that doesn't force women to spend years fighting each separate case of pay inequity.

Witnesses outlined key elements they hoped to see in pay equity legislation:

- that it require employers to "review their compensation practices and provide a process to ensure that women receive equal pay for work of equal value;"⁵²⁶
- that it contain enforcement mechanisms to ensure the full implementation of the legislation;⁵²⁷
- that it address the undervaluing of female-dominated sectors and occupations:⁵²⁸

527 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1135 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).

528 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0850 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

See for example: Coalition of Provincial and Territorial Advisory Councils on the Status of Women,
"Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada: Provincial and Territorial Perspectives," Submitted Brief,
March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0905 (Ann Decter, Director,
Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017,
0905 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor) and 1005 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher,
National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives; Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and
Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec);
Advancement of Women Halton, "Women and the Workforce," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO,
Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 1025 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST
Robotics Canada); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0845 (Ruth Rose-Lizée,
Member, Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail).

⁵²⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1215 (Zahra Jimale, Director of Law Reform, West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund).

FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

⁵²⁶ Ibid.

- that it include requirements related to the collection and dissemination of employment and wage data;⁵²⁹ and
- that it require organizations to "conduct internal pay equity studies, analyses and audits to eliminate and ensure no gender wage gap."

For instance, Iceland has legislation that requires large companies and government agencies to undergo audits and provide evidence that they are complying with equal pay rules. 531

The Committee heard about the 2004 report of the federal Pay Equity Task Force, which issued 113 recommendations to promote pay equity in Canada, including that the federal government establish stand-alone pay equity legislation and a proactive federal pay equity system, under which employers would be responsible for examining their own pay practices, identifying gender wage gaps, and implementing strategies to address inequities. A number of witnesses recommended that the federal government use the recommendations of the 2004 report as guiding elements in the creation of a new pay equity regime. In particular, the Committee heard that the federal government should examine the recommendations on the effect of racialization, indigeneity, sexual orientation, and disability status on earnings.

The Committee also heard about the work of the House of Commons Special Committee on Pay Equity, established through the adoption of a House of Commons motion in

⁵²⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1025 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0855 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

⁵³¹ Ibid

Pay Equity Task Force, *Pay Equity: A New Approach to a Fundamental Right*, 2004, Government of Canada Webarchive.

See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0905 (Ann Decter, Director, Advocacy and Public Policy, YWCA Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada); Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions, "<u>Submission by the Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions</u> (<u>CFNU</u>) to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1105 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers); Canadian Association of University Teachers, "<u>CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.</u>



February 2016. The Special Committee on Pay Equity tabled its report, entitled *It's Time to Act,* in June 2016, which contained 31 recommendations to advance pay equity in Canada. ⁵³⁵

A number of witnesses spoke against the 2009 PSECA, stating that it had failed to deliver results⁵³⁶ and asked the federal government to repeal the legislation.⁵³⁷

The Committee also heard that the federal government should collaborate with the provinces and territories to ensure that they all enact pay equity legislation. ⁵³⁸ A number of Canadian provinces have proactive pay equity legislation for their public sectors, while Ontario and Quebec also have proactive regimes for their private sector.

Recommendation 44

That the Government of Canada adopt all of the recommendations found in the 2016 House of Commons Special Committee on the Pay Equity report entitled *It's Time to Act*.

Recommendation 45

That the Government of Canada request that at the next meeting of Canada's Federal, Provincial and Territorial Ministers responsible for labour, the Minister of Employment, Workforce Development and Labour urge all jurisdictions to consider implementing proactive pay equity legislation.

Recommendation 46

That the Government of Canada immediately implement proactive federal pay equity legislation and that the implementation of this legislation be appropriately funded.

House of Commons Special Committee on Pay Equity, <u>It's Time to Act</u>, June 2016, 42nd Parliament, 1st Session.

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1100 (Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women).

Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,

October 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0910 (Jennifer Howard,

Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

⁵³⁸ FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

E. WOMEN'S ACCESS TO EDUCATION

1. An Overview of Women's Access to Education

The educational success of girls and young women has an important impact on their future economic prospects and on future employment. Employment opportunities increase significantly with trades, college or university training or education, particularly since post-secondary education is now a pre-prerequisite for many jobs today. ⁵³⁹ While the value of post-secondary education is clear, challenges accessing post-secondary education can be a barrier to women's economic security.

According to the 2011 National Household Survey, women made up the majority (54%) of university degree holders aged 25 to 64. The proportion of women aged 25 to 64 with a university certificate or degree increased at a faster rate than that of men, more than doubling between 1991 and 2015 from 15% to 35%. However, women remain underrepresented in some post-secondary education fields, as reported by Statistics Canada:

- While women represent 55% of bachelor's degree holders and 51% of master's degree holders, they compose only 39% of doctorate holders.⁵⁴¹
- The percentage of women with a certificate in the trades declined somewhat from 10% in 1991 to 7% in 2015, while this rate has remained relatively constant among men.⁵⁴²
- Young women are more likely to choose non-STEM programs at the postsecondary level, with only 33% of STEM degree holders being women.

See for example: Statistics Canada, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, February 2017; Canadian Association of University Teachers, "<u>CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0900 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1005 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 0845 (Jenny Greensmith, Executive Director, Pathways Health Centre for Children).</u>

⁵⁴⁰ Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

Sarah Jane Ferguson, "<u>Women and Education: Qualifications, Skills and Technology</u>," *Women in Canada: A gender-based statistical report* — *Seventh edition*, Statistics Canada, 6 July 2016, p. 17.

⁵⁴² Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

Ibid.; Sarah Jane Ferguson, "<u>Women and Education: Qualifications, Skills and Technology</u>," Women in Canada: A gender-based statistical report — Seventh edition, Statistics Canada, 6 July 2016, p. 19.



2. Barriers to Women's Access to Education

The Committee was told that there are a number of barriers that limit women's access to post-secondary education, and that it is necessary to address these barriers because "post-secondary education is one of the best ways to raise people out of poverty, but only if it is accessible." Furthermore, "any strategy that aims to strengthen women's economic security must address the inaccessibility of post-secondary education in Canada." ⁵⁴⁵

While the cost of tuition is a significant barrier to accessing post-secondary education for both men and women, it has a disproportionate effect on female students. Many students recognize the importance of a post-secondary education, and as such, accept the need to accumulate debt;⁵⁴⁶ the average student has \$28,000 in student debt following a four-year degree.⁵⁴⁷ In a written brief, the British Columbia Federation of Students explains that "compared to their male counterparts, women were more likely to graduate from college with more debt, have repaid less of their debt three years after graduation, and be earning lower average incomes."⁵⁴⁸

Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson of the Canadian Federation of Students, stated that "student debt is disproportionately a women's issue" as women make up 60% of recipients of the Canada Student Loans Program. As such, "women who must take out a \$30,000 student loan to finance their education will pay \$10,318 more over 10 years than a student who can afford the high up-front costs." ⁵⁴⁹The Committee heard that repaying these loans creates significant financial pressure on students, as they try to establish themselves in their careers. ⁵⁵⁰ Women typically earn less than their male counterparts after university, and as such, are less able to pay off their student debt quickly and thus have to pay back more in interest. ⁵⁵¹ Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia,

546 Ibid.

547 Ibid.

550 Ibid., 0905.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0900 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

⁵⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁴⁸ British Columbia Federation of Students, "A Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0900 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

⁵⁵¹ British Columbia Federation of Students, "A Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.

Canadian Federation of Students, said that the federal government should develop a comprehensive strategy, with a 50-50 cost-sharing model with the provinces and territories, to establish high-quality, accessible and tuition-free education. 552

Some witnesses stated that another barrier to women completing post-secondary education is gender-based violence on campus, which creates an unsafe and unwelcoming environment for women. ⁵⁵³ Acts of gender-based violence can often prevent female victims from successfully completing their post-secondary education, which in turn limits their economic security. The Committee heard that a significant majority of victims of sexual assault and harassment on campus are women. ⁵⁵⁴ Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association, said that to address this violence, there is a need for "proactive engagement such as standalone sexual assault policies, promotion of consent culture, and inviting all members of our campus community to participate in the dialogue."

Women's access to post-secondary education is also limited by a shortage of childcare spaces on campuses. The Committee heard that the federal government should collect national data about on-campus childcare availability. Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair of the Board of Directors of the Canadian Alliance of Student Association, asked for the establishment of initiatives designed to assist Indigenous women such as "subsidized childcare on campuses, Indigenous family housing, and improved financial aid."

3. Federal Grant and Loan Programs for Students

The Committee heard that the federal government provides federal assistance through grants and loans to Canadian students, including for instance:

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0905 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

Ibid. 0925; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1005 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1005 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0925 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1005 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association).

⁵⁵⁶ Ibid.; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0925 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

⁵⁵⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1005 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association).

⁵⁵⁸ Ibid.



- the Canada Student Grant for Full-Time Students, which offers a grant to low- and middle-income students enrolled in a full-time undergraduate program at a post-secondary institution. It is available to students in all provinces and territories (excluding the Northwest Territories, Nunavut and Quebec, which have their own student financial assistance programs);⁵⁵⁹ and
- Canada Student Loans, which provide financial loans to students who demonstrate financial need for post-secondary education (excluding, once again, the Northwest Territories, Nunavut and Quebec).

The Committee was told that there are a number of ways to restructure federal student grants and loans to make them more accessible to women. To begin, Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association said that the federal government should conduct a GBA+ of its student grant and loan programs and make it available to the public. 561

The Canada Student Grant for Full-Time Students provides up to \$375 per month of study (slightly higher if the student has dependents), which is approximately half the cost of average annual tuition fees of \$7,246 per year. The British Columbia Federation of Students, in a written brief, stated that this amount is insufficient for students who have significant additional costs, particularly housing and childcare fees. They recommended increasing the number of grants and the financial amount of the grants provided to students. ⁵⁶²

Specific to Canada Student Loans, the Committee heard that the needs assessment to determine how much financial aid a student receives factors in childcare costs, but does not reflect the wide range in childcare costs among regions and municipalities. ⁵⁶³ In a written brief, the Canadian Alliance of Student Associations recommended that the

Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>Canada Student Grant for Full-Time Students</u>.

560 Employment and Social Development Canada, <u>Canada Student Loans — Eligibility</u>.

561 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1040 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association).

British Columbia Federation of Students, "<u>A Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief.

563 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1010 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association).

program consider childcare cost statistics for the municipality in which the student resides. 564

The Committee also heard that Canada Student Loans provides a Repayment Assistance Plan (RAP), which allows graduates to hold off on repaying their student loans until their annual incomes are at least \$25,000. Women make up the majority of users of the plan because women continue to make less than their male colleagues after graduation and they are more likely than men to be precariously employed, including in part-time and temporary positions. The Canadian Alliance of Student Associations recommended that the federal government raise awareness of RAP, particularly among female students. Moreover, to ease the burden on applicants to the program, the Canadian Alliance of Student Associations, in a written brief, suggested that the enrolment span be expanded to one year, rather than requiring students to reapply every six months. The suggested that the enrolment span be expanded to one year, rather than requiring students to reapply every six months.

The Committee also heard that the federal government should provide targeted grants and loans to encourage women to enter fields of study where they are under-represented. Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager in Nanaimo of the Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society, recommended the establishment of "educational incentives, such as bursaries and grants, for low-income immigrant women wanting to pursue careers in environmental sciences, policy development, and engineering." ⁵⁶⁸

Recommendation 47

That the Government of Canada conduct a gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) of federal grant and loan programs available to post-secondary students, including the Canada Student Grant for Full-Time Students, the Canada Student Loans, and the Repayment Assistance Plan.

⁵⁶⁴ Canadian Alliance of Student Associations, "<u>CASA Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief, June 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>. 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0900 (Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson, Nova Scotia, Canadian Federation of Students).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1005 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association); Canadian Alliance of Student Associations, "<u>CASA Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief, June 2017.

⁵⁶⁷ Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 0850 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society).



F. INITIATIVES TO PROTECT INCOME SECURITY

1. Overview of Initiatives to Protect Income Security

In 2014, according to written brief from Statistics Canada, a higher proportion of women than men lived in low-income⁵⁶⁹ situations (13.5% vs. 12.5%).⁵⁷⁰ These rates were much higher for women than for men among lone-parent families, unattached seniors and women aged 75 years and older. Women and men of certain socio-economic groups, including Indigenous peoples, recent immigrants and people with disabilities, experience disproportionately high rates of low income.⁵⁷¹

2. Minimum Wage

The Committee heard that many Canadian women are employed at minimum wage, a rate which differs across Canada depending on the province or territory. According to Carole Gingras, Director of Status of Women Service at the Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec, nearly 60% of people who earn minimum wage, are women. As well, with the increase of precarious and part-time work, many women are employed in two or three minimum-wage jobs to maintain a basic level of economic security. 573

Many witnesses recommended the creation of a \$15-per-hour minimum wage for all workers in Canada, regardless of jurisdiction, ⁵⁷⁴ while other witnesses stated that the

For the purpose of this report, Statistics Canada's "low-income measure" is used to measure rates of low income. The low-income measure is measured at the family level. A family is low income "if your family after-tax income is below half of the median family after-tax income in a year, then your family is in low income for that year." Source: Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

⁵⁷⁰ Statistics Canada, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

⁵⁷¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

⁵⁷² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec).

⁵⁷³ Ibid., 0910 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0905 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec)and 0910 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); Advancement of Women Halton, "<u>Women and the Workforce</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017; Sheila Block and Grace-Edward Galabuzi, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives Ontario, "<u>Canada's Colour-coded Labour Market: the interaction of race and gender</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, June 2017.

federal minimum wage should be set at \$15 per hour. Carole Gingras, Director of Status of Women Service at the Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec, explained: "in an economic context where non-standard jobs and precarious employment are of growing importance, the federal government must set the tone by establishing a minimum wage of \$15 per hour" for employees under its jurisdiction. An increase in the minimum wage would be of particular benefit to certain groups of women, such as recent immigrants, who are more likely than other women to work in jobs that pay minimum wage.

The Committee also heard that for small business owners, an increase in the minimum wage to \$15 per hour could be "rather prohibitive" for their operations. ⁵⁷⁸

3. A Living Wage

A number of witnesses recommended the establishment of a living wage, described as a wage that is high enough for a household to meet adequate standards of living and pay for basic needs (such as housing, transportation and food). Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor at Oxfam Canada, stated that "nowhere in Canada does the minimum wage constitute a living wage" and "without a living wage, women do not stand a chance of working their way out of poverty or achieving economic equality." S80

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1050 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec); United Steelworkers, "<u>Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, April 2017; Unifor, "<u>Women's Economic Security: A Working Women's Agenda</u>," Submitted Brief, March 2017.</u>

⁵⁷⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec).

⁵⁷⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 1010 (Sheila Block, Senior Economist, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives).

⁵⁷⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1015 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women).

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0915 (Janet Currie, Co-Chair, Canadian Women's Health Network) and 1030 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1005 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society).

⁵⁸⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).



The Committee heard that the federal government should be a leader by providing a living wage to its employees, thus setting the example for both the private sector and the provinces and territories. Furthermore, Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor at Oxfam Canada said that the federal government should "ensure that federal government contracts are only given to living wage employers." Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada recommended that the federal government require, through legislation, that employers provide a living wage. S83

4. Universal Basic Income

A number of witnesses suggested establishing a national universal basic income or guaranteed livable income, a form of social security whereby all citizens received a regular form of income. ⁵⁸⁴ In a written brief, a group of students from the University of Ottawa recommended that "the Ontario pilot project to create a basic income should be funded by the Government of Canada and extended to many other Canadian communities in order to find a real solution to women's poverty in this country." ⁵⁸⁵

The Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter, in a written brief, outlined key elements of a universal basic income: that it is provided unconditionally (without conditions such as job search requirements), that it is given to all individual adults in a household, and that it covers any dependents (such as children).⁵⁸⁶

- Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017.
- Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter, "Economic Security for Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, August 2017.

Oxfam Canada, "Oxfam Canada Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of women for its Study on Women's Economic Security," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁵⁸² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0845 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0900 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada).

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0950 (Wanda Morris, Vice-President, Advocacy, Canadian Association of Retired Persons); Caregivers Nova Scotia Association, "Submission to: The Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women on the topic of the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

Recommendation 48

That the Government of Canada, in collaboration with the provinces and territories, examine the possibility of introducing a national universal basic income.

5. Working Income Tax Benefit

The Working Income Tax Benefit (WITB) is a "refundable tax credit intended to provide tax relief for eligible working low-income individuals and families who are already in the workforce and to encourage other Canadians to enter the workforce." ⁵⁸⁷

Some witnesses said that the WITB discriminates against women in a number of ways. Firstly, a married woman's eligibility for the WITB is determined by a couple's income, not an assessment of each individual's income. As explained by Kathleen Lahey, Professor in the Faculty of Law at Queen's University, "if a woman wants to use that benefit, she will be disqualified by virtue of her husband's income." Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University noted that the design of this tax benefit incorrectly assumes that all married women have equal access to the family finances, when in fact a married woman could be excluded because of a number of reasons, including being in a financially abusive relationship or being separated from her partner. 589

Secondly, in situations where both spouses are low earners, only one member of the couple can request the WITB. Therefore, a woman's eligibility for the WITB must be negotiated with her spouse. 590

In response to these two challenges, Tammy Schirle suggested that all tax benefits be awarded and income be assessed based on the individual, rather than a couple or household. Specifically, it is recommended that "section 122.7 of the *Income Tax Act* be amended to make the WITB eligibility depend on individuals', rather than couples', circumstances." As well, the Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants

⁵⁸⁷ Government of Canada, Working Income Tax Benefit.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0910 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0945 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual).

⁵⁹⁰ Ibid.

⁵⁹¹ Ibid.



recommended that data regarding recipients of the WITB be examined to determine whether there is equal participation by men and women. 592

The Committee heard that the WITB should provide additional help to marginalized groups of women in Canada. In a written brief, the DisAbled Women's Network Canada requested that the WITB's disability supplement, provided to Canadians living with a disability, be increased to provide additional financial assistance to women who are living with disabilities. See As well, the Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington recommended that the WITB be made available to students without dependents, because currently "it is not available for women seeking retraining or returning to school to complete a diploma or degree."

Recommendation 49

That the Government of Canada raise awareness among Canadians of the eligibility requirements and the benefits available with the Working Income Tax Benefit.

Recommendation 50

That the Government of Canada amend the Working Income Tax Benefit eligibility in a way that the tax benefit is awarded and income is assessed based on the individual, rather than a couple or household.

G. RETIREMENT AND PENSION SECURITY

1. An Overview of Retirement and Pension Security

The Committee heard that while women's retirement and pension security have increased over the past decades, they still encounter unique challenges when compared to men in attaining economic security in old age. As women's life expectancy is longer than men's, it is particularly important that they have a suitable long-term income

Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants, "Submission to Standing Committee on the Status of Women On the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

DisAbled Women's Network Canada, "Parliamentary Brief — The Economic Security of Disabled Women, Employability, Workforce, Healthcare," Submitted Brief, November 2017.

⁵⁹⁴ Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Woman –

A Briffing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief.

source.⁵⁹⁵ An official from Statistics Canada noted that women aged 75 years and older have a disproportionately higher rate of low-income (at 17%), compared to their male counterparts (at 9.4%).⁵⁹⁶

The Committee was also informed that women's retirement preparedness had improved; between 1977 and 2011, the proportion of employed women covered by Registered Pension Plans (RPP) increased from 36% to 40%. Statistics Canada provided some additional 2011 data on retirement:

- 40% of employed women had an RPP, a slightly higher percentage than men;
- 56% of women had a Registered Retirement Savings Plan (RRSP);
- women in low-income situations are less likely (at 21%) to have an RRSP than the general female population.⁵⁹⁸

According to an official from Statistics Canada, unattached women and lone mothers, compared to the general female population, were "less confident about their retirement prospects than other family groups were" and "were less likely to think their retirement income would be adequate." ⁵⁹⁹

The Committee was informed that the Canadian retirement income system is designed in a way that workers have to supplement their retirement income through private plans, whether that is through private savings (for instance, through RRSPs) or workplace plans. Canada's retirement income system, which was mostly designed in the 1960s and 1970s, reflects how families organized themselves at the time. Tammy

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0925 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec); Canadian Association of Retired Persons, "<u>Comments to Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women,"Submitted Brief, July 2017.</u>

⁵⁹⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

⁵⁹⁷ Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

⁵⁹⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0900 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

⁶⁰⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0920 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

⁶⁰¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0945 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual).



Schirle, Associate Professor in the Department of Economics at Wilfrid Laurier University, recommended that "it would be useful to undertake a serious review of the various policies supporting older Canadians embedded in our tax system and the retirement income system" to "better meet the needs of current and future generations of women."

The Committee heard that women face a number of challenges in saving for retirement. Women are more likely than men to take time off during their working years for unpaid care work, and they are more likely to retire before the age of 65 years because of family obligations. As a result, they have fewer years of credit for Canada Pension Plan or workplace pension plan benefits. According to a written brief by Unifor, the cumulative impact of gendered experiences throughout the life-cycle results in a less secure retirement for women across the income spectrum when compared to men. Furthermore, the gender wage gap means that women earn less over their lifetimes than men, resulting in lower pensions when they retire and putting them at greater risk of poverty. Women are also over-represented in precarious and part-time work, and thus struggle to save financially during their working lives. In a written brief, the Canadian Association of Retired Persons said:

One of the reasons many senior women struggle in retirement can be their high cost of living. In particular housing is becoming cost-prohibitive for many women, lack of adequate transit is driving higher transportation costs and for those with debt, issues with pay-day lenders and credit counsellors are exacerbating their financial problems. 609

602 Ibid. FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0925 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women 603 Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec). 604 See for example: Ibid.; Unifor, "Women's Economic Security: A Working Women's Agenda," Submitted Brief, March 2017; Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief; Women's Economic Council, "Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017. Unifor, "Women's Economic Security: A Working Women's Agenda," Submitted Brief, March 2017. 605 Ibid. 606 FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0850 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, 607 Catalyst Canada Inc.). 608 Canadian Association of Retired Persons, "Comments to Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, July 2017. 609 Ibid.

The Committee also heard about the variety of pension plans available to employees, for instance:

- A defined benefit pension plan (DB) typically involves contributions by the employer and (most of the time, but not always) by the employee. DB requires the employer to provide "[plan] members [with] a defined pension income when they retire." An employee's pension value is determined by a formula that is generally based on their salary and years of service. These plans provide "defined, reliable income in retirement that the employer is required to fund properly" with "solvency funding requirements" and are the "the gold standard of pension plans" in maintaining retirees' economic security. 613
- A defined contribution pension plan (DC) is an agreement in which both
 the employer and employee contribute a set or defined amount to the
 pension plan each year. Employee manage how their contributions to the
 plan are invested.⁶¹⁴ The value of an employee's pension plan depends
 on "the amount of contributions accumulated and the investment
 income earned," and as such, the employee's pension benefit is not
 specified and the amount is uncertain.⁶¹⁵
- A target benefit pension plan (TBP), also known as a shared-risk pension plan, is a hybrid between DB and DC plans. It combines the security of a pooled benefit plan such as DB, with the flexibility of contribution amounts that can be adjusted over time. TBP pension benefits are not fixed, and plan members employees and retirees bear the risks. A minimum level of benefits is guaranteed but contributions and benefit amounts are based on the plan's investment performance. Employees and retirees are entitled to benefit from funding surpluses and must

Office of the Superintendent of Financial Institutions, <u>Defined Benefit Plan</u>.

Raphaëlle Deraspe, Lindsay McGlashan, "<u>The Target Benefit Plan: An Emerging Pension Regime</u>," *Library of Parliament,* 11 March 2016.

⁶¹² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0920 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

⁶¹³ Ibid.

Raphaëlle Deraspe, Lindsay McGlashan, "The Target Benefit Plan: An Emerging Pension Regime," Library of Parliament, 11 March 2016.

Office of the Superintendent of Financial Institutions, *Defined Contribution Plan*.



cover any funding shortfalls in the form of increased contributions or reduced pension benefits. ⁶¹⁶

The Committee was told that the federal government should take a number of steps to protect senior women's economic security. To begin, the federal government should commit to protecting federal public sector DB pension plans⁶¹⁷ as they provide a secure retirement future for plan members.⁶¹⁸ Furthermore, the federal government should examine pension reform, including possibly "portable pension vehicles that provide employers and Canadians the ability to contribute to pensions as they move in and out of different jobs and different types of employment."⁶¹⁹ A recommendation was also made for the federal government to adopt legislation that requires all employers to create mandatory private pension plans for all employees.⁶²⁰

Specific to Bill C-27, An Act to amend the Pension Benefits Standards Act, 1985, 621 which was introduced in the House of Commons and received first reading in October 2016, Jennifer Howard, Executive Director at the Public Service Alliance of Canada, stated that the bill's proposals are harmful to seniors' economic security. She said that the bill would create the opportunity for employers — with workers' permission — to switch from DB and DC plans to TB plans (where retirees assume the risks associated with the plan's investment performance), thus lowering the number of people who have more stable DB plans. 622

Raphaëlle Deraspe, Lindsay McGlashan, "<u>The Target Benefit Plan: An Emerging Pension Regime</u>," *Library of Parliament*, 11 March 2016.

- Justice Laws Website, <u>Pension Benefits Standards Act, 1985</u>; Parliament of Canada: LegisInfo, <u>House Government Bill C-27, An Act to amend the Pension Benefits Standards Act, 1985, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament.</u>
- 622 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0925 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

⁶¹⁷ United Steelworkers, "Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, April 2017.

⁶¹⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1030 (Wanda Morris, Vice-President, Advocacy, Canadian Association of Retired Persons).

⁶¹⁹ Women's Economic Council, "Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

2. Canada Pension Plan

Witnesses spoke about the Canada Pension Plan (CPP), an element of Canada's retirement income system that "provides pensions and benefits when contributors retire, become disabled, or die." Moreover, "almost all individuals who work in Canada contribute to the CPP." In Quebec, the Quebec Pension Plan provides similar benefits. 624

Wanda Morris, Vice-President of Advocacy for the Canadian Association of Retired Persons, said that the enhancements to the CPP, starting in 2019, will benefit elderly women. However, a number of witnesses expressed concern about the loss of the child-rearing and disability dropout provisions in the renewed CPP, which will limit women's economic gains from its expansion. It was requested that the federal government include child-rearing and disability dropout provisions in the expanded CPP. In a written brief, Unifor said:

A failure to maintain the "drop-out" allowance for time spent raising children or on disability means that women will be penalized in their retirement for the years they spent performing unpaid and important work. Including the drop-out in the CPP expansion is one more step the government can take to improve economic security of women across their life-cycle. 627

A number of witnesses requested that the CPP include a drop-out option for caregiving; this option would be similar to the existing child-rearing drop-out option where an individual can exclude the child-rearing period (where earnings stopped or were lower because an individual was the primary caregiver of children under the age of seven) from the contributory period when calculating the CPP benefit amount, leading to the highest possible payment. 628 As well, in a written brief, the Canadian Association of

- 623 Library of Parliament, <u>Public Pensions: Overview</u>.
- 624 Government of Canada, <u>Canada Pension Plan Overview</u>.
- 625 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0945 (Wanda Morris, Vice-President, Advocacy, Canadian Association of Retired Persons).
- See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0905 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).
- 627 UNIFOR, "Women's Economic Security: A Working Women's Agenda," Submitted Brief, March 2017.
- Donna S. Lero, "A Brief Supplementing Testimony to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women on Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0930 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec; Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering); Government of Canada, Canada Pension Plan Eligibility.



Retired Persons recommended expanding the "CPP coverage for full-time caregivers of adults so their retirement earnings are protected." 629

Finally, Wanda Morris, Vice-President of Advocacy at the Canadian Association of Retired Persons, said: "We need to do more for our lowest income earners, and the new CPP coverage of 33% of income isn't sufficient."

Recommendation 51

That the Government of Canada immediately include or expand the caregiving and disability drop-out provisions in the Canada Pension Plan.

3. The Federal Old Age Security and Guaranteed Income Supplement

The federal government's Old Age Security (OAS) is a taxable monthly social security payment available to most Canadians over the age of 65 and the Guaranteed Income Supplement (GIS) is a monthly non-taxable benefit that can be added to the OAS pension for low-income Canadians. Witnesses spoke of the benefits of the OAS and GIS for senior women, and also areas for improvement to ensure its benefits reach all senior women.

The Committee heard that OAS and GIS have been instrumental in reducing seniors' poverty, particularly for single elderly women. According to Statistics Canada, "OAS/GIS provides enough income to lift 45% of elderly unattached women out of low income and reduces the low-income gap from \$14,600 to \$3,200. Some witnesses said there should be efforts to improve coordination between federal, provincial and territorial social assistance programs to reduce the claw-backs of OAS and GIS income.

⁶²⁹ Canadian Association of Retired Persons, "Comments to Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, July 2017.

⁶³⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 0945 (Wanda Morris, Vice-President, Advocacy, Canadian Association of Retired Persons).

⁶³¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0920 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

⁶³² Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "<u>Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women</u>," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

With respect to the OAS, while the age of eligibility was restored to 65 years of age, the Committee heard that its design contributes to poverty among senior immigrant women because recipients must have lived in Canada for at least 40 years to enjoy full OAS benefits. As well, the Committee was informed that "in cases where a spouse of a pensioner is aged 60 to 64 or a widow is aged 60 to 64, an income supplement or allowance is available," yet a similar benefit should be "available to low-income women aged 60 to 64 who are divorced or simply never married."

H. TOOLS FOR GENDER-SENSITIVE ECONOMIC POLICY-MAKING

1. National Efforts to Promote Gender Equality

The Committee heard that efforts to promote gender-sensitive policy-making should be part of larger national efforts to promote gender equality. For instance, Margot Young, Professor at the Allard School of Law at the University of British Columbia, recommended that the federal government "develop and implement" a national gender equality strategy with the goal of making policies more effective and coherent, as well as indicating that the federal government "takes seriously its obligation to gender equality." ⁶³⁶ Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor at York University, said that the federal government should develop a gender equality marker to track the exact amount of funding being allocated to the goal of achieving gender equality in Canada. ⁶³⁷

2. Collection and Dissemination of Disaggregated Data

The Committee was told that disaggregated data and in-depth research are essential to inform policy-making aimed at improving women's economic security. ⁶³⁸ As such, a number of witnesses requested that the federal government ensure the ongoing collection and dissemination of relevant data, disaggregated by gender and other

Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "<u>Economic Security — A Question</u> of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017.

⁶³⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0945 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual).

⁶³⁶ Ibid., 1000 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual).

⁶³⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0935 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual).

⁶³⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0850 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual).



identity factors.⁶³⁹ An official from SWC stated that to improve women's economic security, "creat[ing] and support[ing] interdepartmental and inter-jurisdictional networks to facilitate, among other things, the collection of shared and disaggregated data and indicators," will be imperative.⁶⁴⁰

In support of the ongoing disaggregation of data, an official from SWC told the Committee that the agency has contributed funding for *Women in Canada: A gender-based statistical report*, a "comprehensive statistical portrait of women in Canada" compiled by Statistics Canada. The seventh edition of *Women in Canada* includes chapters on women's economic well-being, education, and labour force participation. ⁶⁴¹ It was also noted that Budget 2016 allocated new funding to SWC for a "dedicated research and analysis unit," which will improve the research and data available to the public and private sectors. ⁶⁴²

Some gaps in the collection of data were brought to the attention of the Committee. For example, Statistics Canada collects employment information for individuals aged 15 years and up, yet at least two provinces have a minimum working age of 12 years old, leading to a gap in data on employment among youth. In addition, Statistics Canada does not collect employment insurance data for residents in the three territories or for First Nations people living on-reserve, leading to a significant lack of data on the use of employment insurance among Indigenous peoples. The Committee also heard there is a need for improved data on parental leave access, use, and benefit levels; for example, "which mothers and fathers qualify for and take leave, for how long, and at what level of

642 Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 1000 (Grace-Edward Galabuzi, Professor, Politics and Public Administration, Ryerson University, As an individual); Sheila Block and Grace-Edward Galabuzi, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives Ontario, "<u>Canada's Colour-coded Labour Market: the interaction of race and gender</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, June 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1030 (Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair, Board of Directors, Canadian Alliance of Student Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1000 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women); EMD Serono Canada Inc., "<u>Canada's role in Healthy Women, Healthy Economies</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017.

⁶⁴⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0850 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada).

⁶⁴¹ Ibid.

⁶⁴³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0850 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual).

⁶⁴⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 March 2017, 1025 (Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care, Brock University, As an individual).

benefits (including employer top-up data)."⁶⁴⁵ Lastly, Engineers Canada, in a written brief, said there is a need for additional data on the engineering labour market and current unemployment rates of recent post-secondary graduates in the STEM fields.⁶⁴⁶

Recommendation 52

That the Government of Canada, recognizing that unpaid work is disproportionately undertaken by women, 1) examine international best practices in the collection of data on unpaid work; and 2) include a question in the 2021 long form census on the allocation of time for household activities, with the goal of measuring unpaid work.

3. The Application of Gender-Based Analysis Plus

Witnesses encouraged the federal government to apply GBA+ to legislation, policies, programs and budgetary measures in order to determine the impact of such measures on diverse groups of women, men and gender-diverse people. Such analysis should include all government measures, whether related to addressing climate change, developing and funding infrastructure programs, reviewing tax policy, negotiating trade agreements, or labour and employment issues, etc. Danniele Livengood, Director of the Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology, explained that "ensuring that all policies are scrutinized for their short- and long-term impact on women would prevent existing policies from hindering new [gender equality] efforts."

⁶⁴⁵ Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief.

Engineers Canada, "Engineers Canada's Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1015 (Valerie Carruthers, Co-Manager, Virtual Office, Newfoundland and Labrador, Women's Economic Council) and 1005 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0900 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1015 (Michèle Biss, Legal Education and Outreach Coordinator, Canada Without Poverty); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0945 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology).

⁶⁴⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0855 and 0900 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0925 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual).

⁶⁴⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0945 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology).



Kathleen Lahey, Professor in the Faculty of Law at Queen's University, explained that SWC should maintain the role of upholding "the process of gender mainstreaming of every single policy, practice, law, and program in the country [and] ... emphasizing gender equality as a fundamental principle." In a written brief, YWCA Canada specified that such analysis should be intersectional in nature, including diverse groups of women, men and gender-diverse people. Michèle Biss, Legal Education and Outreach Coordinator at Canada Without Poverty, recommended that a review mechanism, with civil society participation, be established to assess all national laws, policies and programs through gender-based analysis to determine whether they support women's socio-economic rights. She also recommended that the federal government establish a process to review legislation, policies and programs that includes input from civil society experts and women with lived experience of poverty.

The Committee heard that gender-based analysis should be consistently applied to the federal budget. 654 Some witnesses expressed support for the gender-based analysis included in Budget 2017, in the form of a Gender Statement. 655 Michèle Biss, Legal Education and Outreach Coordinator, Canada Without Poverty, also recommended that Canada integrate human rights and gender-based analysis into its poverty reduction strategy and national housing strategy. 656 Jane Stinson, Research Associate at the Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, recommended that GBA+ be applied to federal environmental assessments by the Canadian Environmental Assessment Agency. 657

650 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0940 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual).

653 Ibid.

654 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1005 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

655 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0940 (Sandra Altner, Chief Executive Officer, Women's Enterprise Centre of Manitoba); Abiola Akande, Anne Boily, Cécile Coderre, Josiane Fleury, Julie Édeline Gallant, Morènikè Idji, Tara Mcrae, Andy Rébecca René, Noémie Rossignol and Marie-Lou Villeneuve-Hobbs, "<u>Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women</u>," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

656 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1015 (Michèle Biss, Legal Education and Outreach Coordinator, Canada Without Poverty).

657 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1005 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

YWCA Canada, "Improving Economic Security for Women — YWCA Canada — Brief to the House Standing Committee on Status of Women Study on Women's Economic Security," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁶⁵² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1015 (Michèle Biss, Legal Education and Outreach Coordinator, Canada Without Poverty).

The Committee was told that the federal government should ensure that any funding it provides be examined to determine if it promotes the groups that are protected from discrimination by the *Canadian Human Rights Act*. ⁶⁵⁸ The Newfoundland and Labrador, Women's Economic Council, in a written brief, recommended that the federal government also require federal programs and services, including those that are federally funded and delivered by community partners, to conduct GBA+ assessments and that accountability mechanisms include requirements to report on the impact of the programs or services on gender. ⁶⁵⁹Lastly, Meg Gingrich, Research Representative at the National Office of the United Steelworkers, recommended that the federal government analyze all infrastructure investments through "a gender and equity lens."

Recommendation 53

That the Government of Canada implement gender equity provisions in the terms and conditions for all projects and programs that receive federal funding; and that if the evaluation of these projects deems the equity provisions inadequate, or to include bias, discrimination, or sexism towards women, then funding may be suspended or removed until a minimum standard of gender equity is achieved.

Recommendation 54

That the Government of Canada, recognizing the importance of applying gender-based analysis plus (GBA+), maintain its commitment to conducting GBA+ assessments on all programs and policy decisions taken by federal government departments.

Recommendation 55

That the Government of Canada conduct gender-responsive budgeting to ensure that the needs of diverse groups of women, men and gender-diverse people are reflected in the government's fiscal, social and economic policies.

⁶⁵⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0855 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual).

⁶⁵⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1015 (Valerie Carruthers, Co-Manager, Virtual Office, Newfoundland and Labrador, Women's Economic Council); Women's Economic Council, "<u>Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.</u>

⁶⁶⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).



Recommendation 56

That the Government of Canada, in the development of its Poverty Reduction Strategy, apply a gender-based analysis plus (GBA+), employ a human rights-based approach, and include a focus on responding to the needs of marginalized groups.

INCREASING WOMEN'S ECONOMIC LEADERSHIP

While women's representation in economic leadership positions has risen over the past several decades, for many women, the workplace remains a "glass obstacle course." Research has shown that companies and organizations with a greater proportion of women in leadership positions outperform those with a lower proportion of women in leadership positions, yet women remain under-represented in senior positions. 662

The following section examines opportunities for women's economic empowerment and leadership: workplace policies that benefit women; women in traditionally maledominated professions; women in senior management positions; and women on corporate boards. In addition, it examines the role of men and boys in promoting women's economic security and the effect of mentoring and role models on women's economic empowerment and leadership.

A. WORKPLACE POLICIES FOR WOMEN

The Committee heard that workplaces, in the private and public sector, can adopt policies that serve to recruit, retain and advance women. Witnesses spoke of a number of corporate hiring and pay practices and policies that serve to promote equality and diversity. The Committee heard that some workplaces use defined salary grids or transparent salary scales, with the goal of paying staff — men and women — equal salaries for equal experience and qualifications. As a result, when employees are first hired, their salaries are not based on subjective factors.

As well, a number of witnesses spoke about the need to check for bias in job application processes. For example, the language and mandatory requirements listed in job postings should be examined as they may be drafted in such a way that they attract more male

⁶⁶¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 1005 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

Women in Governance, "Speaking notes for Caroline Codsi, President and Founder of Women in Governance," Submitted Brief, June 2017.

Advancement of Women Halton, "<u>Women and the Workforce</u>," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1025 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Expericence, Shopify Inc.).

⁶⁶⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1025 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Expericence, Shopify Inc.).



than female applicants. ⁶⁶⁵ For instance, Shopify said it recently launched a work-integrated learning program, but 90% of the applicants were men. Alexandra Clark, Director of Public Policy at Shopify, said:

[W]e did a case study and looked at the letter and the language used. We looked at the words we use in technology, like "hustle", and what was forcing ... those women to opt out. We went back, rewrote the letter, and sent it back out. Our first cohort in 2016 at Shopify had a majority of females.... So language matters. 666

The Committee heard that many workplaces are adopting equality and diversity policies, conducting equity audits, and monitoring employee diversity. 667 These initiatives may include:

- regularly assessing the workforce to obtain information on the number of staff by gender, other identity factors, level of seniority, and other relevant characteristics;⁶⁶⁸
- analyzing these numbers to determine if particular groups are underrepresented when compared to the eligible pool of employees in the relevant sector;⁶⁶⁹
- publishing assessments to raise awareness within the institution of under-represented groups;⁶⁷⁰

⁶⁶⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1030 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology); Barbara Annis and Richard Nesbitt, "<u>A Presentation by Richard Nesbitt to the Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women.

<u>Economic Security of Women</u>," Submitted Brief, February 2017.</u>

⁶⁶⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1015 (Alexandra Clark, Director, Public Policy, Shopify Inc.).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1240 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1135 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1200 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

⁶⁶⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1135 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers); Catalyst Canada Inc., <u>Submitted Brief</u>.

⁶⁶⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1135 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).

⁶⁷⁰ Catalyst Canada Inc., <u>Submitted Brief</u>.

- establishing a committee or identifying a senior employee who is responsible for promoting equality and diversity within the institution;⁶⁷¹ and
- assessing hiring and promotional practices for bias, as discussed further in the report.⁶⁷²

Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President of Governance and Government Relations at the Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce, provided CIBC's efforts in this field as an example:

At CIBC we have a robust gender diversity and inclusion strategy that has been in place since 2014. To support our strategy, a gender diversity and inclusion executive action Committee was established, comprised of senior leaders across the organization. We focus on improving gender balance at leadership levels and on fostering an inclusive organization. Our strategy is aimed at breaking down unconscious stereotypes and biases. ⁶⁷³

The Committee learned about the importance of training for human resources personnel and management to eliminate possible discrimination and gender bias. ⁶⁷⁴ Such training should focus on unconscious biases and stereotypes, which can skew hiring and promotions in favour of certain privileged groups. ⁶⁷⁵ In particular, interviewers often unconsciously hire individuals who are similar to themselves; in certain sectors, this practice creates a bias in favour of men, as the majority of senior management and business leaders are men. ⁶⁷⁶ Witnesses said that it is important to recognize and deal

⁶⁷¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1200 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

⁶⁷² Catalyst Canada Inc., Submitted Brief.

⁶⁷³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1200 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

⁶⁷⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 1040 (Sheila Block, Senior Economist, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives); Advancement of Women Halton, "<u>Women and the Workforce</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1025 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Experience, Shopify Inc.); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1200 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce); Catalyst Canada Inc., <u>Submitted Brief</u>.

⁶⁷⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1200 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

⁶⁷⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1010 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Expericence, Shopify Inc.).



with unconscious bias through awareness and in-depth training. ⁶⁷⁷ Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President of User Expericence at Shopify, explained that overcoming unconscious bias takes effort:

Almost every interviewer at Shopify has received some sort of training to make them aware of these unconscious biases, and every interview panel openly discusses possible biases when we get together to recap a candidate's next steps. We're highly aware of these biases, and even we are struggling to overcome them day to day.⁶⁷⁸

Many witnesses spoke of innovative family-friendly workplace policies that can increase the number of women employed in the workplace and support parents, both women and men, as they balance family and work responsibilities. ⁶⁷⁹ While both women and men benefit from the implementation of family-friendly practices, the impact is greater among women who tend to have more caregiving responsibilities. For these women, family-friendly policies are effective at helping them enter or return to the workplace, advance professionally and take on leadership positions.

Without these policies, women may not be able to equally participate in the workplace; for example, women may not be able to attend networking opportunities after work hours because they need to care for their children or elderly parents. The Committee was provided with a number of examples of valuable family-friendly workplace policies, such as:

- providing flexible work hours;⁶⁸¹
- avoiding meeting hours that conflict with family responsibilities;⁶⁸²

⁶⁷⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0925 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1140 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁶⁷⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0955 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Expericence, Shopify Inc.).

⁶⁷⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec).

⁶⁸⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1000 (Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual).

⁶⁸¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1255 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

lbid., 1140 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

- allowing employees to work from home or work remotely;⁶⁸³ and
- providing adequate access to childcare and other care services.⁶⁸⁴

The Committee heard about successful corporate initiatives to foster more family-friendly workplaces. For instance, Shopify runs a conference that features female-led speakers and also provides childcare for attendees. However, Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer of Women in Capital Markets, stated that there is a stigma attached to taking advantage of those flexibility options which could prevent women from advancing in their careers.

Witnesses cautioned against implementing family-friendly policies in the workplace that are targeted to women with family obligations, as these policies reinforce the idea that women are the primary caregivers. The Committee heard that family-friendly policies should be gender-neutral to support both men and women in their caregiving roles.⁶⁸⁷

Furthermore, some witnesses stated that management must foster a culture within their workplaces that encourages men, not just women, to make use of family-friendly initiatives. In particular, the Committee heard that while women are often expected to take parental leave, many men feel uncomfortable asking for such leave, even when gender-neutral policies are in place. A written brief by Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons stated that:

lbid., 1200 and 1255 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1040 (Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager, Administrative Office, Women's Economic Council).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1000 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Expericence, Shopify Inc.); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0845 (Donna Lero, Professor Emerita, Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph, As an individual).

⁶⁸⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1000 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Expericence, Shopify Inc.).

FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1040 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets).

⁶⁸⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1220 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Canadian economy'," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0915 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).



Employers generally did not expect or encourage fathers to take some or any [parental] leave. Managers — like many parents and others — regarded this period of infant care as reserved for mothers. What facilitates fathers' take up of leave are supportive workplaces and/or a legal right to individual entitlement leave. 689

Recommendation 57

That the Government of Canada, in partnership with civil society, the private sector and labour organizations, work to implement flexible and family-friendly work arrangements designed to recruit, retain and advance women in the workplace.

Recommendation 58

That the Government of Canada repeal changes to the Federal Contractors Program made in 2013, and examine ways to improve the Legislated Employment Equity Program.

B. WOMEN IN TRADITIONALLY MALE-DOMINATED PROFESSIONS

Canadian women remain under-represented in industries and occupations traditionally dominated by men — the skilled trades, STEM fields, entrepreneurship, and at higher levels of academia — despite the excellent economic opportunities that these professions provide. A number of witnesses said that measures are necessary to advance women in these areas because the under-representation of women in male-dominated professions is not acceptable and change will take decades or longer at its current rate. 690

The Committee heard that increasing women's representation in the skilled trades, STEM fields, entrepreneurship, and academia has a number of benefits. Firstly, employment in these sectors provides women with economic security. As well, it serves to eliminate occupational segregation and can help fill labour-supply shortages. In

Lindsey McKay, Andrea Doucet, Sophie Mathieu and Crystal Adams Coons, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee, House of Commons of Canada, 'Study of the economic security of women in Canada and equal participation of women in the Caan economy'," Submitted Brief.

⁶⁹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 0940 (Pierre Charest, Vice-President, Research Grants and Scholarships Directorate, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0955 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

⁶⁹¹ Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,
October 2017.

⁶⁹² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1220 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

addition, it promotes innovation and economic development throughout Canada. Imogen Coe, Professor and Dean of the Faculty of Science at Ryerson University, explained "we know that diversity is a driver of innovation and we know that we must have diversity in order to innovate. It's an economic imperative." She added that: "We're not talking about putting women where they don't want to go. We're talking about getting rid of the barriers."

In addition, the Committee was informed that increasing women's representation in these fields must be tied to increasing diversity in general by eliminating barriers for and empowering under-represented groups. ⁶⁹⁵

Recommendation 59

That the Government of Canada fund initiatives that raise awareness among girls and young women of the opportunities presented by all career paths, including in traditionally male-dominated professions, with the goal of ensuring that all economic opportunities are available to them.

Recommendation 60

That the Government of Canada implement gender equity provisions in future international trade agreements.

Recommendation 61

That the Government of Canada, when setting priorities for Canada Summer Job allocations, include as one priority the promotion of jobs for young women in traditionally male-dominated fields.

Recommendation 62

That the Government of Canada decline to support conferences and events both nationally and internationally that do not include women on panels and as speakers and experts.

⁶⁹³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1100 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁶⁹⁴ Ibid., 1145.

⁶⁹⁵ Ibid., 1100.



Recommendation 63

That the Government of Canada create a task force, in partnership with relevant private sector stakeholders, to develop and share best business practices and resources designed to advance women's careers in their chosen fields, with a particular focus on the advancement and retention of women in traditionally male-dominated sectors.

- 1. Women in Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields
- a. Overview of Women in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields

The Committee heard that women remain under-represented in the skilled trades and in STEM careers. Women made up approximately 5% of all trade workers and 22% of the STEM workforce in Canada in 2011. While Canadian women have made some progress in terms of their representation in industries and occupations traditionally dominated by men, there is still a gender gap in industries such as construction, mining, oil and gas, and utilities. 696

Women's under-representation in these fields starts at the post-secondary and apprenticeship level in Canada. While women make up the majority of new post-secondary graduates in college, undergraduate and master's programs, they are over-represented in traditionally female-dominated programs, and under-represented in traditionally male-dominated programs. For instance, while women represent 59% of all university graduates in Canada, women account for only 23% of engineering graduates and 30% of math and computer science graduates. According to the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada, in 2014–2015, enrolment in bachelor's level STEM programs stood at 38% for women and 62% for men, and this difference increases at the master's and doctoral levels.

The Committee received data on women's representation in various fields within skilled trades and STEM; for instance:

696 Catalyst, <u>Women in Male-Dominated Industries and Occupations</u>, Knowledge Centre, 13 March 2013.

699 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 0940 (Pierre Charest, Vice-President, Research Grants and Scholarships Directorate, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada).

⁶⁹⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 24 March 2017, 1105 (Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate, Department of Employment and Social Development).

⁶⁹⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0955 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua).

- Women accounted for 47% of the national labour force in 2015, but are under-represented in occupations common to the natural resource industries: women make up only 6% of trades, transport, and equipment operators; 24% of workers in natural and applied sciences; 16% of forestry workers; and 19% of employees in mining, oil and gas.
- Women hold 28% of jobs in manufacturing in Canada, and this number has remained relatively unchanged for about 30 years.
- According to Statistics Canada, while the percentage of men with trades' certificates has remained constant over the past two decades, the percentage of women with trades' certificates declined from 10% in 1991 to 7% in 2015.
- Women's representation is among its lowest in the skilled construction trades, where they represent merely 4% of industry tradespeople.⁷⁰³

b. Advantages of Increasing Women's Employment in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields

The Committee heard that there are advantages — not just for women, but for the private sector and the Canadian economy — of increasing women's employment in the skilled trades and in STEM fields. Dorothy Byers, Chair of Board of Directors at FIRST Robotics Canada, explained that increasing women's representation is "good for society, ... for Canada's innovation strategy, [for] the national economy, [for] our place in the world, and it's good for 50% of the population."

Witnesses told the Committee that there is a shortage of qualified employees in many skilled trades and STEM sectors, a situation that offers important employment opportunities. If the industries requiring skilled trades continue to grow, there will be a

Department of Natural Resources, "By the Numbers: Gender Diversity in Canada's Natural Resource Industries and Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM)," Submitted Brief.

⁷⁰¹ FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷⁰² Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

⁷⁰³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).

⁷⁰⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0955 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).



need to recruit and train new workers to fill the vacancies.⁷⁰⁵ Some of the skilled trades have an ageing workforce; for instance, the Canadian construction industry will lose a quarter of its skilled workers to retirement in the coming decade.⁷⁰⁶ Manufacturers are experiencing shortages in production-related jobs, where women hold "less than 5% of jobs in the skilled trades, and less than one quarter of all jobs in STEM fields."⁷⁰⁷ As well, there is an increasing demand for qualified STEM workers in Canada as the science and technology sectors expand.⁷⁰⁸

Increasing women's representation in order to fill empty positions in these fields is critical to the economic output and sustainability of these sectors. Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters, said that addressing the shortage of qualified workers is a top priority if the manufacturing industry wants to double manufacturing output and exports by the year 2030, as outlined in the industry's strategy. ⁷⁰⁹

Furthermore, the Committee heard that workplace culture must evolve to be more inclusive, which ultimately increases staff morale and improves productivity and efficiency. For instance, witnesses indicated that women make excellent tradespeople, often bringing a diversity of ideas, attention to detail, and fine motor skills. Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President of Canadian Association for Girls in Science, explained that "in order for Canada to maximize its potential, we need the best and brightest working on innovative new ideas and continuing research and development. We

⁷⁰⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷⁰⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).

⁷⁰⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0855 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President, Canadian Association for Girls in Science).

⁷⁰⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷¹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).

⁷¹¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1030 (Sarah Simpson, Manager, Value Proposition and Community Relations, Irving Shipbuilding Inc.); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1015 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women).

cannot afford to exclude any sector of our society."⁷¹² The Committee was told that a highly skilled workforce with advanced skills in STEM-based disciplines is essential if Canada is to remain competitive.⁷¹³

c. Economic Benefits of Employment in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields

The Committee was told that employment in the skilled trades and STEM sectors could provide significant economic opportunities to women. Witnesses stated that many jobs in these sectors are a source of well-paid employment, are associated with better employment conditions and they often provide job stability and permanency. Moreover, many jobs in the skilled trades require a college diploma, which is less costly than other post-secondary education options, resulting in lower amounts of student debt.

For instance, Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters, said that "compared to the national average, manufacturing jobs tend to be more secure, are more likely to be full time, and pay better." Jacqueline Andersen, Director of Industry Relations at Women Building Futures explained that women entering her organization's trade program had an average increase in income of 132%, as compared to their previous salaries, on their first day of hire.

⁷¹² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President, Canadian Association for Girls in Science).

⁷¹³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1100 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

See for example: FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0850 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President, Canadian Association for Girls in Science); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0940 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1100 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0900 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Denise Watters, Welding Intern, Women Unlimited, Irving Shipbuilding Inc.) and 1010 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures).

⁷¹⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1245 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷¹⁶ Ibid., 1200.

⁷¹⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures).



A career in the skilled trades also presents many opportunities to advance and to make important gains in income over time.⁷¹⁸ For example, the Committee heard that "in 2016, the average hourly wage for industrial, electrical, and construction trades, including carpenters, was about \$28 per hour, translating to an annual wage of roughly \$58,000" and that "a career path for a carpenter could lead to construction project manager, and an average senior-level construction project manager with between five and 10 years of experience makes over \$100,000."⁷¹⁹

Furthermore, employment in the skilled trades and STEM sectors can provide fulfilling and exciting careers for women. For example, Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters, said his association surveyed women in the manufacturing sector and "they like their jobs. … 80% would consider remaining in the sector if they could start their careers all over again. The vast majority would support their daughters' pursuing a manufacturing career..."

Lastly, the Committee heard that the skilled trades and STEM sectors are expanding while also experiencing a labour shortage, thus presenting diverse employment opportunities. As a result, an education in the skilled trades and STEM field can lead to a variety of career options and flexibility in terms of employment across the country. For example, Canada's natural resource industries are significant economic players in Canada because there are a great number of resource-intensive local economies, which lead to a large number of skilled trades and STEM jobs.

⁷¹⁸ Ibid., 0900 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0915 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Denise Watters, Welding Intern, Women Unlimited, Irving Shipbuilding Inc.) and 1010 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures).

⁷¹⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures).

⁷²⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷²¹ Ibid., 1245.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0900 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada) and 1000 (Drew Leyburne, Director General, Strategic Policy Branch, Strategic Policy and Results Sector, Department of Natural Resources); Canadian Women's Foundation, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee</u>," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

d. Challenges to the Recruitment and Retention of Women in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields

Witnesses noted that there are important challenges to the recruitment and retention of women in the skilled trades and in STEM. Many young women continue to pursue careers in traditionally female-dominated industries such as public administration, teaching and nursing, rather than exploring career options in the trades or STEM fields. The Committee heard that girls should be encouraged to develop an interest in the skilled trades and STEM fields at a young age, and hold onto that interest throughout primary, secondary and post-secondary school. The skilled trades are important challenges to the recruitment and retention of women in the skilled trades and in STEM fields at a young age, and hold onto that interest throughout primary, secondary and post-secondary school.

The Committee was told that the gender gap in skilled trades and STEM is not because of biological differences. Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer of Actua, stated that young girls have "no shortage of passion, curiosity, talent, and interest in science and technology. That is without exception across the country." For instance, evidence demonstrates that boys and girls participate in equal numbers in STEM courses throughout high school. Carolyn Van, Director of Youth Programming at Canada Learning Code, said: "There is zero evidence that there are aptitude differences in math between women and men."

The Committee heard about the "leaky pipeline," whereby girls initially express interest in male-dominated professions, but the representation of women drops off throughout their education and employment paths.⁷²⁸ For example, witnesses said the interest in pursuing

Advancement of Women Halton, "Women and the Workforce," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0945 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada) and 1010 (Marie-Claude Guérard, Chief Financial Officer, Canadian Space Agency); Engineers Canada, "<u>Engineers Canada's Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief.</u>

⁷²⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0955 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua).

⁷²⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1100 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁷²⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1100 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0850 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0950 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).



STEM subjects for young girls drops off at around 12 to 13 years of age, for a number of reasons. 729

Girls and young women's choices are shaped by gender stereotypes and socialization during formative years upholding the idea that careers in the skilled trades and STEM are not for women. This socialization includes overt and unconscious messaging from media, from peers, from parents, and from teachers and guidance counsellors on the capabilities of boys and girls. These messages "steer girls and boys, women and men toward different educational and career paths." The Committee heard that these sexist messages are communicated across society, and that efforts must focus on helping both boys and girls to counter negative stereotypes. Imogen Coe, Professor and Dean of the Faculty of Science at Ryerson University, explained:

Culture and context repeatedly, over and over again, say to girls and to women that you don't fit, girls suck at math, you don't look like a scientist, and we can't have girls in the lab because they cry. ⁷³³

Negative gender stereotypes and socialization create a lack of confidence among girls and young women in their abilities or their choice to pursue studies in these sectors. For instance, Statistics Canada reports that among women and men who had comparably high mathematics scores in grade 10, women remained less likely than men to enter STEM fields. Imogen Coe, Professor and Dean of the Faculty of Science at Ryerson University, told the Committee that young women:

... can articulate what they think girls are good at, not from their experience but because they've absorbed messages from the world around them about what girls can and can't do. These messages continue to build. They're micro-messages. They're like a death by a thousand cuts. Girls and their interest — or lack of interest — in STEM are

⁷²⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1105 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code).

Advancement of Women Halton, "<u>Women and the Workforce</u>," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1100 and 1120 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁷³¹ Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1105-1110 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁷³³ Ibid., 1105.

⁷³⁴ Ibid., 1100; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1100 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code).

⁷³⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0855 (Andrew Heisz, Assistant-Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada).

not the problem.... By the time these young women get to university ... [t]hey've experienced a couple of decades of gender stereotyping. ⁷³⁶

The Committee heard that messages from society in general and from within the STEM fields can serve to exclude women. Imogen Coe told a story illustrating this point:

When I was about 12, my father ... took me to the open house at my local university.... It included a visit to the world-famous British Antarctic Survey. This is a scientific research unit based at Cambridge, but it has a research station at the South Pole. I thought this was the most exciting, exotic thing that I could think of. I wanted to do this. I was naturally curious. I loved the outdoors. I wanted to be an explorer. I wanted to be a scientist. With great excitement, I bounced up to the British Antarctic Survey [representative] and asked, "So, how many women do you have at the base station at the South Pole?" His rather tired response was—it has since burned into my brain—that "the environment there is very stressful for the men doing research and we don't want to add to that stress by introducing women". I heard the slamming of a door to a potential pathway that I was interested in. The door closed. "737"

Another reason for the "leaky pipeline" among girls and young women is a shortage of female role models and mentors in these fields. Girls need better access to conferences and working groups where they can see a community of women in the skilled trades or STEM sectors. Carolyn Van, Director of Youth Programming at Canada Learning Code, told the Committee: "Women were a huge part of the history of computational thinking. I think women have been, again, marginalized, underserved, and kind of erased out of the history books in relation to computational thinking."

The Committee was informed that many male-dominated fields have sexist and male-centric workplace cultures which do not welcome women, instead creating negative gender bias in apprenticeships, work placements and hiring.⁷⁴¹ The continued under-

⁷³⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1105 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁷³⁷ Ibid

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1120 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1120 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁷³⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1105 and 1120 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code).

⁷⁴⁰ Ibid., 1135.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0915 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).



representation of women in skilled trades and STEM sectors leads to a number of challenges for women in these fields, such as workplace cultures that are unwelcoming or not family-friendly, discrimination and micro-aggression against women, and harmful stereotypes and assumptions about women's and men's abilities. As one witness explained, "many of us who succeed in this male-dominated field feel like we're on a treadmill. We feel that we have to be superwomen, and at the same time be ladylike and not offend sensibilities." Witnesses indicated that workplace culture may be unwelcoming to women, either because of unconscious bias or overt discrimination.

The Committee was also informed of a gender bias that exists in apprenticeships, work placements, and hiring which negatively impacts women's success in the skilled trades.⁷⁴⁵ Furthermore, women in the skilled trades and STEM sectors encounter conscious or unconscious hiring and promotion biases against women and unfair salary differences, leading many women to choose to work in other fields.⁷⁴⁶

Other witnesses told the committee that the male-centric workplaces can lead to harassment of female employees, at times leading women to seek employment

See for example: FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President, Canadian Association for Girls in Science) and 0945 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 0940 (Pierre Charest, Vice-President, Research Grants and Scholarships Directorate, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0950 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0940 and 1015 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada); Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁷⁴³ FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0850 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering).

⁷⁴⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1015 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology); Canadian Women's Foundation, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.</u>

⁷⁴⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0915 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); Canadian Women's Foundation, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 0940 (Pierre Charest, Vice-President, Research Grants and Scholarships Directorate, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0950 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

elsewhere, including outside the sector. Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code said that studies show that "women represent less than 25% of technology roles within Canada, and [among] those women who make it in the industry, 25% are exiting the industry due to sexism or the experience of unwelcome workplace environments."

The Committee was told that addressing workplace culture is especially challenging because many male colleagues "appear not to see a problem." The Committee was told that in the past, "the burden fell on women to use humour to deflect discrimination or harassment, in fear that speaking out or filing a complaint would not make a difference." The committee was told that in the past, "the burden fell on women to use humour to deflect discrimination or harassment, in fear that speaking out or filing a complaint would not make

The Committee heard that in these sectors, women may not see opportunities for promotion and advancement in their careers. This outlook is a result, in part, of the under-representation of women in senior management and executive leadership roles in skilled trades and STEM sectors. The Committee heard that when women do enter STEM fields, they do not reach leadership positions at the same rate as their male colleagues and they tend to stay in lower-paying positions. This situation is frustrating for women who want to advance their careers and receive promotions.

According to witnesses, another challenge related to the recruitment and retention of women in the skilled trades and STEM sectors is their concern over work-life balance. Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters, noted:

Women in manufacturing told us that they struggle to balance their work and family commitments. Many say that they have quit manufacturing jobs for this reason. Those

⁷⁴⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1145 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁷⁴⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1100 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code).

⁷⁴⁹ Ibid., 1220 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷⁵⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).

⁷⁵¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0900 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0950 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

⁷⁵³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0950 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).



with families fear that unavoidable commitments will hinder their career advancement. 754

The Committee heard that two elements of unwelcoming work environments for women are a lack of childcare arrangements and a lack of flexible hours. Some witnesses stated that employers within the skilled trades must be more family-friendly, by, for example, establishing accommodations for childcare and pregnancy. Few industries or companies within the skilled trades offer on-site childcare or childcare opportunities. For instance, mining operations are often located in remote communities that lack services, such as childcare, that would encourage women's increased participation.

Specific to the skilled trades, a number of witnesses said that an outdated understanding of the skilled trades hurts the recruitment of women. For instance, the general public sees work in the skilled trades as being dark, dirty, dangerous and requiring brute strength, which is no longer true in many professions. As one witness explained, increasingly for industries that were driven by brawn, the stereotypical pick axe and lumberjack, a lot of these operations will be run by an iPad 10 years from now, and they will be much more open to that balance."

Witnesses said that while women are participating in increasing numbers in skilled trades and STEM education, there are problems with recruitment and retention in the employment fields, ⁷⁶¹ and many qualified women "retreat from these fields as they

⁷⁵⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷⁵⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1045 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives).

⁷⁵⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1015 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).

⁷⁵⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0925 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association) and 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures).

⁷⁵⁸ Canadian Women's Foundation, "Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁷⁵⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1200 (Michael Holden, Chief Economist, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷⁶⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1030 (Drew Leyburne, Director General, Strategic Policy Branch, Strategic Policy and Results Sector, Department of Natural Resources).

⁷⁶¹ Ibid., 0900 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0945 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada).

pursue their careers."⁷⁶² This scenario was once again described as part of the "leaky pipeline" problem.⁷⁶³ For instance, in 2011, women aged 24 to 34 represented 39% of graduates in STEM in Canada; and yet in 2014, only 22% of workers in STEM fields were women.⁷⁶⁴

The Committee heard that it is important to ensure that women pursue employment and advancement in their chosen educational fields if that is their wish. Witnesses expressed concern that the economic security of women will be negatively affected if they have trained in the skilled trades or STEM fields and then move to employment in non-skilled trades or non-STEM fields as the women are more likely to take lower paying employment.⁷⁶⁵

Witnesses told the Committee that while there is an understanding of the many challenges to increasing women's representation in the skilled trades and STEM sectors, additional research is needed to fully comprehend the problem. At times, the under-representation of women does not seem to have a clear explanation. For instance, the Canadian Space Agency spoke of its national engagement strategy for its astronaut recruitment campaign, which included special efforts to reach out to women and Indigenous people. Compared to the 2008–2009 recruitment campaign, where 18.6% of candidates were women, 24% of the applicants to the 2016 campaign were women. However, this percentage remained below the workforce availability of the targeted sectors, which was 32%.

In a written brief, Engineers Canada recommended that the federal government conduct targeted research into why young women, particularly Indigenous women and visible

⁷⁶² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0950 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

⁷⁶³ Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0845 (Justine Akman, Director General, Policy and External Relations Directorate, Status of Women Canada); Department of Natural Resources, "<u>By the Numbers: Gender Diversity in Canada's Natural Resource Industries and Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM)," Submitted Brief.</u>

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0945 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada).

⁷⁶⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0955 (Marie-Claude Guérard, Chief Financial Officer, Canadian Space Agency).

⁷⁶⁷ Ibid.



minority women, are not pursuing an education or career in STEM fields.⁷⁶⁸ The brief said that "engineering stakeholders cannot make informed choices on how best to retain women in the engineering profession without Canadian-specific data to guide their efforts."⁷⁶⁹ For instance, research in the United States has studied women who leave science, engineering and technology careers and reviewed their career trajectories to see why they were not retained.⁷⁷⁰

e. Solutions for Addressing Women's Under-representation in the Skilled Trades and in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Fields

Witnesses shared many different approaches and strategies intended to increase women's representation in the skilled trades and STEM sectors. Firstly, profiling the success stories of diverse female role models in these sectors can encourage and inspire young women to pursue an education in relevant fields.⁷⁷¹

Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President of the Canadian Association for Girls in Science, said "Role models are important. Providing children with a non-stereotyped and diverse role model in the sciences can influence perceptions of scientists and interest in pursuing STEM fields." For instance, she said that too many kids associate "scientists with the typical Albert Einstein image, an old man with crazy white hair, a lab coat, and glasses." She spoke of the need for "visits from female scientists, reading articles about women in STEM, and teachers profiling women in STEM decrease stereotypic

Engineers Canada, "Engineers Canada's Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0945 and 1010 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada).

⁷⁶⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0945 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada).

⁷⁷⁰ Ibid., 1015.

See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1205 (Elise Maheu, Board Member, and Director, Government Affairs, 3M Canada Company, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0950 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0845 (Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President, Canadian Association for Girls in Science) and 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology); Canadian Women's Foundation, "<u>Economic Security of Women in Canada Written — Submission to the Status of Women Committee</u>," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017.

⁷⁷² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0850 (Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President, Canadian Association for Girls in Science).

⁷⁷³ Ibid., 0845.

associations and improve attitudes toward women in STEM among female and male schoolchildren."⁷⁷⁴

The Committee also heard that there should be targeted efforts to encourage girls and young women to pursue an education in the skilled trades and STEM fields. Elise Maheu, Board Member of the Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters and Director of Government Affairs at 3M Canada Company, explained that "many companies are actively trying to recruit more women to manufacturing, but these efforts will have little impact unless we first increase the number of women available."

Engineers Canada recommended that the federal government invest in programs for girls and young women that encourage the exploration of relevant fields through handson learning. The Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer of Actua, said that these programs are delivered in a safe space, where they can develop skills through play and risk-taking, taking things apart, putting them back together, learning that failure is not horrible, that it has a very good use, and ... collaboration and creativity. However, the Committee also heard that there are important benefits to programs that mix both boys and girls, exposing all kids to an environment of working with a community of all genders.

The Committee was told that businesses, with the support of the federal government, need to change workplace policies in order to increase women's representation and retention in the skilled trades and STEM sectors. As discussed in an earlier section on Workplace Policies, witnesses said that workplace culture in these fields must develop

⁷⁷⁴ Ibid., 0850.

⁷⁷⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1205 (Elise Maheu, Board Member, and Director, Government Affairs, 3M Canada Company, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷⁷⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0940 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada).

⁷⁷⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1010 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua).

⁷⁷⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1125 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁷⁷⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1120 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code).



family-friendly policies, gender equality and diversity strategies and childcare opportunities. ⁷⁸⁰

Witnesses stated that all levels of leadership within workplaces must be champions and advocates for respectful workplaces. The Committee heard that it is critical to collaborate with male employees in male-dominated workplaces in order to create positive change. For example, the Committee heard that there has been significant progress in increasing women's representation in the mining sector, because the industry has invested effort and energy through the Mining Association of Canada, the Prospectors and Developers Association of Canada, the Mining Industry Human Resources Council, and Women in Mining Canada. Another example is Engineers Canada, which has "proposed a 30 by 30 initiative in which 30% of newly licensed engineers would be women by 2030."

According to Natural Resources Canada, in 2015, the natural resource industries generated "nearly 900,000 indirect jobs, 872,000 primary and upstream jobs and accounted for 17% of nominal GDP." As such, the Committee heard it was important for the federal government to examine employment in the natural resource sector through a gender and diversity assessment. ⁷⁸⁶

Witnesses provided a number of solutions to help improve women's representation specifically in the skilled trades. The Committee heard that women must receive support throughout their "multi-year journey" towards a career in skilled trades "from recruitment to career exploration, through college level trades and technology training, to

783 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1010 (Drew Leyburne, Director General, Strategic Policy Branch, Strategic Policy and Results Sector, Department of Natural Resources).

784 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0850 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering).

785 Department of Natural Resources, "By the Numbers: Gender Diversity in Canada's Natural Resource Industries and Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM)," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1000 (Drew Leyburne, Director General, Strategic Policy Branch, Strategic Policy and Results Sector, Department of Natural Resources).

⁷⁸⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0925 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1205 (Elise Maheu, Board Member, and Director, Government Affairs, 3M Canada Company, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷⁸¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).

⁷⁸² Ibid., 1005.

employment, and along the apprenticeship pathway to certification." ⁷⁸⁷ Employers must commit to hiring a more diverse workforce, support diversity in the apprenticeship journey to certification, and address workplace culture so it is more inclusive. ⁷⁸⁸

Also specific to the skilled trades, the Committee was informed that outreach initiatives need to counter the negative stigma attached to the skilled trades⁷⁸⁹ and build the positive narrative of "middle-class opportunities in the trades as well as the empowerment and equalization of women."⁷⁹⁰ For instance, Elise Maheu, Board Member of the Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters and Director of Government Affairs at 3M Canada Company, said that "young women need more exposure to modern manufacturing facilities to gain a more accurate perspective on career opportunities" and to clear up misconceptions.⁷⁹¹

As well, the Committee heard that there need to be federal government efforts to promote women pursuing a career in the skilled trades. Elise Maheu, Board Member of the Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters and Director of Government Affairs at 3M Canada Company recommended that federal/provincial collaboration occur to improve access to apprenticeship placements aimed at under-represented groups. As well, Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association, recommended that the federal government establish a five-year national funding strategy with the goal of supporting the increased participation of diverse women in apprenticeships in the skilled trades. Page 1931

⁷⁸⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0900 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association).

⁷⁸⁸ Ibid.; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0930 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1030 (Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher, National Office, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0950 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures).

⁷⁸⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1010 (Sarah Simpson, Manager, Value Proposition and Community Relations, Irving Shipbuilding Inc.).

⁷⁹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0945 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).

⁷⁹¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1205 (Elise Maheu, Board Member, and Director, Government Affairs, 3M Canada Company, Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters).

⁷⁹² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers).

⁷⁹³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0905 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association).



The Committee was told that with recent commitments by the federal government to make investments in infrastructure, employment in skilled trades will be a growing opportunity. The Committee heard that if the funding focuses on physical infrastructure, such as roads, bridges, transportation systems, water systems and social housing, men will benefit most from the investments as men dominate the workforce in these areas. A number of witnesses recommended that when the federal government awards contracts through these infrastructure investments, they require employers to implement employment equity standards when hiring. An example was given of the construction of the Vancouver Island Highway, in which private sector companies were required by the provincial government to establish employment equity initiatives. As a result, women went from being "2% of the labour force at the beginning to being 20% at a particular point in time."

Witnesses also spoke of a number of solutions to increase women's representation specifically in STEM fields. Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada, recommended that the federal government commit to promoting and supporting the entry of women in STEM fields⁷⁹⁸ and that it develop "national strategies" to increase women's participation.⁷⁹⁹ In addition, the Committee heard that the federal government could work with industry leaders and universities to educate them on the benefits of increasing women's representation and on providing training programs and opportunities for qualified women.⁸⁰⁰ A number of witnesses spoke of the importance of increasing women's representation specifically in computer science fields,

⁷⁹⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0850 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual).

⁷⁹⁵ Ibid.; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0855 (Kathleen Lahey, Professor, Faculty of Law, Queen's University, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0850 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 21 February 2017, 0900 (Laurell Ritchie, Co-Chair, Employment Insurance Sub Committee of the Good Jobs for All Coalition, Inter-Provincial El Working Group); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0905 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association).

⁷⁹⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0850 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual).

⁷⁹⁸ Canadian Federation of University Women, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁷⁹⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0955 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

⁸⁰⁰ Ibid., 1025.

particularly as technology and digital literacy are critical skills in the economy. 801 According to one witness, the proportion of women in computer science occupations in Canada declined from 30% to 25% between 1991 and 2011. 802

The Committee heard that a promising approach to addressing women's under-representation in STEM fields is the Athena SWAN charter in the United Kingdom — launched by the charity Equality Challenge Unit — which recognizes and celebrates promising practices for the advancement of women in STEM sectors. Select nationally funded research institutes require, or strongly recommend, that an institution meet the key Athena SWAN benchmarks. 803

The Committee also heard that digital literacy programs were critical to advancing women's participation in skilled trades and STEM. For instance, Canada Learning Code is a not-for-profit organization that designs and delivers technology and digital literacy programs for Canadians, including programs for specific groups, such as women and girls.⁸⁰⁴

Recommendation 64

That the Government of Canada conduct research on the reasons and possible solutions for women's under-representation in the skilled trades and in science, technology, engineering and mathematics fields.

Recommendation 65

That the Government of Canada fund and support projects that provide education and immersive experiences for women and girls in traditionally male-dominated fields, such as the skilled trades and science, technology, engineering and mathematics fields.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0955 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1135 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0955 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0955 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada); IRST Robotics Canada, "<u>The Economic Security of Women in Canada: A focus on STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics)," Submitted Brief, May 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1110 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).</u>

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 November 2017, 1100-1105 (Carolyn Van, Director, Youth Programming, Canada Learning Code).



2. Women as Entrepreneurs

a. Overview of the Women as Entrepreneurs

Given the economic value of Canada's small- and medium-sized businesses (SMEs), encouraging greater participation in entrepreneurship among women would benefit both women and the overall Canadian economy. Businesses owned by women contribute approximately \$148 billion to the Canadian economy, according to the Royal Bank of Canada.⁸⁰⁵

While witnesses told the Committee that an increasing number of women are involved in entrepreneurship, they emphasized that women remain significantly under-represented as entrepreneurs. SMEs make major contributions to the Canadian economy, accounting for 45% of GDP and 60% of all jobs in the economy in 2014. According to an official from Innovation, Science and Economic Development Canada (ISED), 15.7% of SMEs are owned majoritarily by women, compared to 64.7% majoritarily owned by men. Studies show that female business-owners make greater contributions to their communities than their male counterparts.

A recent Royal Bank of Canada study predicted that even a 10% increase in the number of enterprises owned by women over the next 10 years would inject \$50 billion into the Canadian economy. An official from the Department of Industry, told the Committee that "women entrepreneurs represent a significant source of untapped talent and potential in Canada" and stated that "we really need to focus on entrepreneurship as a viable option for young women and encourage them to succeed in that area."

810 Ibid., 1030.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0845 (Lesley Lawrence, Senior Vice President, Ontario, Business Development Bank of Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0945 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0850 (Sandra Altner, Chief Executive Officer, Women's Enterprise Centre of Manitoba).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 1000 (John Gartke, Director, Trade Missions, Consultations and Outreach, Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0945 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

Moreover, a significant number of business owners are expected to retire in the next decade, which will have a negative effect on economies, and could present a great opportunity for young women who want to become entrepreneurs.⁸¹¹

The Committee was told that women in entrepreneurship should be understood on a continuum, with specific needs and challenges at each step; new entrepreneurs who are starting businesses need "financing, business supports, and mentoring," while experienced business owners need "procurement and export opportunities, leadership advancement, and access to corporate boards." Furthermore, female entrepreneurs are diverse, including women living in "rural areas, women with disabilities, [I] ndigenous women, or visible minority women."

b. Challenges for Women as Entrepreneurs

The Committee was told that there are a number of barriers that can prevent women from succeeding in entrepreneurship. The Committee heard that some obstacles are the same for SMEs run by both men and women. However, witnesses outlined specific challenges for female entrepreneurs.

The Committee heard that it is a challenge for women to access capital to launch or expand their businesses. As well, many female entrepreneurs face financing constraints, which limits their growth and leads to financial difficulties. For instance, according to Statistics Canada data, in 2014, only 78% of majoritarily female-owned businesses that requested debt financing were approved, compared to 91% of male-owned businesses that requested such financing. S15

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0925 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1205 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

⁸¹³ Ibid., 1225.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0945 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); Women's Economic Council, "<u>Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0855 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering).</u>

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0945 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).



Witnesses said that some of these financial challenges are because women's credit histories may not be as well established as their male colleagues. Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer of British Columbia Women's Enterprise Centre, said:

[Women are] listed second on the mortgage quite frequently. I am with my own home, even though I'm the one who pays. Women are often using supplementary credit cards, so they haven't established their own credit. They may not understand the importance of establishing their own credit when they're organizing their families' finances. 816

The Committee was told that another reason that women have trouble accessing financing is because of gender biases in the banking industry and business world. The Committee heard that women are more likely than their male counterparts to be asked for co-signers, even if their businesses can support the loans they are requesting. Another witness said that only 4% of venture capital goes to female entrepreneurs, and is, in part, because the partners in venture capital firms are men with unconscious bias. Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer of the British Columbia Women's Enterprise Centre, also explained that:

Women are much more likely to be asked to provide more detailed financial information to support their applications for credit. They're asked to provide cash-flow projections more often, appraisals of assets more often. Their personal financial statements are being asked for more often. Those are the kinds of unconscious, gender-biased behaviours that we believe lenders are engaging in, which they don't even realize they're doing. 819

Gender bias within the business industry also limits women's entrepreneurship success because women's ideas may not be taken as seriously as those of their male

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1035 (Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer, British Columbia, Women's Enterprise Centre).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1020 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1040 (Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer, British Columbia, Women's Enterprise Centre).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 1020 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1010 (Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer, British Columbia, Women's Enterprise Centre).

colleagues. 820 In the male-dominated business world, women's innovative ideas may not resonate with male leaders and investors. 821

Another significant barrier to following the path to entrepreneurship for women is achieving work-life balance, which is compounded by a lack of access to affordable childcare and women's disproportionate responsibility for unpaid care work. The Committee heard that some women would prefer to be self-employed in order to have flexible work hours and manage their work-life balance. However, being self-employed can lead to unique stress on female entrepreneurs. Anne Day, Founder and President of Company of Women, said:

We had a woman the other week who is expecting her first baby. She was in tears, because she's worried about her business and what is going to happen. She wants to spend some quality time with her baby, but she can't also afford the time off with her business. 825

Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer of Futurpreneur Canada, said that employment benefits should be extended to self-employed women in order to encourage young women to pursue this career path. 826

The Committee was told that some women are socialized in such a way that they do not have the same confidence and assertiveness as men, despite having equally valid business

Women's Economic Council, "<u>Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada,</u>" Submitted Brief, February 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1015 (Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager, Administrative Office, Women's Economic Council).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1220 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0935 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

Company of Women, "Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women — Women's Economic Security," Submitted Brief; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1225 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1040 (Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager, Administrative Office, Women's Economic Council).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1040 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1020 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0935 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).



ideas.⁸²⁷ Moreover, many women approach entrepreneurship differently than male colleagues, which may limit business growth; for instance, the Committee was told that women tend to be more risk adverse than men.⁸²⁸

Women, when compared to men, often have less experience in financial management, business planning, financial resources and financial literacy. ⁸²⁹ In addition, women often have business networks that are less extensive than those of male colleagues. ⁸³⁰ The Committee heard that in order for women to become entrepreneurs, they often need role models within that field, which can be challenging in a male-dominated environment. ⁸³¹

There are additional barriers for some groups of women, such as Indigenous women or women who are recent immigrants. For instance, the Committee heard that there are few culturally relevant examples of entrepreneurship for Indigenous women to use as a

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1015 (Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager, Administrative Office, Women's Economic Council); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0845 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1005 (Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer, British Columbia, Women's Enterprise Centre); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1005 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women).

Women's Economic Council, "<u>Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada,</u>" Submitted Brief, February 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1220 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1005 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0845 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0945 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1000 (Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer, British Columbia, Women's Enterprise Centre); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1220 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0945 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0905 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0945 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0845 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

model. 832 Women who have recently arrived in Canada often have limited networks within the business community, which limits their ability to start a business. 833

c. Solutions to Increase Women's Representation as Entrepreneurs

Witnesses said that targeted and tailored services and programs for female entrepreneurs are an effective method to provide support. In a written brief, the Women's Economic Council said that the federal government should provide support and funding to women's enterprise centres, which have experience "moving diverse women from start-up to growth to develop innovation and incubator programs." The Committee heard that marginalized women, such as Indigenous women and women who have recently immigrated to Canada, should have access to programs that are targeted to them, while at the same time, they should be welcomed into mainstream programming. Sa6

The Committee heard that efforts to raise awareness among women of entrepreneurship as a valid career option should be accompanied by peer circles, coaching and mentorship opportunities. For instance, Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director of the Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec, said that "women who are already entrepreneurs should act as ambassadors to stir the entrepreneurial spirit and cultivate it." Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer at Futurpreneur Canada, spoke of the importance of mentorship in their program:

[Participants of the program] have that mentor for up to two years. ... they spend four to five hours a month together by phone or in person. The mentor can have no financial interest at all in their business. They're completely about the entrepreneur and helping them through rough times, and keeping them true to their plans and ideas. We find that

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0855 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0855 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 8 June 2017, 1025 (Grace-Edward Galabuzi, Professor, Politics and Public Administration, Ryerson University, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0850 (Sandra Altner, Chief Executive Officer, Women's Enterprise Centre of Manitoba); 0855 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

Women's Economic Council, "<u>Presentation to the Standing Committee to the Status of Women, 2/7/2017 — Strengthening Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.</u>

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0910 (Sandra Altner, Chief Executive Officer, Women's Enterprise Centre of Manitoba); 0915 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

⁸³⁷ Ibid., 0845-0855 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0920 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec).



it's particularly in the second year where they need help. Often something has gone wrong. They've back-end loaded a lease ... and they need that person there to say, "How are you going to change your direction to get things back on track?" ... our entrepreneurs are still in business at the rate of 50% to 60% after five years, which is much higher than the normal average, and we're pretty sure it's because of this mentoring. 839

The Committee was told that efforts to increase women in entrepreneurship should focus on building business skills and raising awareness of existing support services. The Committee heard about the work of Futurpreneur, which provides young entrepreneurs with "skill-building and ideation workshops, business-plan coaching, webinars, and online resources." Furthermore, Futurpreneur partnered with the Business Development Bank of Canada in 2017 on a campaign to promote female entrepreneurs and raise awareness of the support services available to them. The campaign, called "Be the Boss of You," reached over a million people through social media. 841

Many organizations indicated that their efforts to increase women in entrepreneurship focused on setting objectives and targets to build and maintain momentum. An official from ISED said that the Department has "set a target to double the number of SMEs that are majoritarily owned by women to arrive at approximately 340,000 by 2025 from a baseline that we had in 2014 of 174,000." The Committee also heard that the BDC had committed to investing \$700 million by 2018 in businesses owned by women, and had exceeded this amount, reaching \$809 million, in September 2017. Furthermore, the BDC's portfolio of majoritarily female-owned businesses is now at 4,744 clients, a 41% increase from the start of the initiative. September 2017.

The Committee heard that efforts to help female entrepreneurs should take into consideration regional disparities and differences and collaborate with local communities and women's organizations. ⁸⁴⁴ The Committee heard that the federal government's six regional development agencies, which are part of the ISED portfolio, provide funding for entrepreneurship development and female-led business training. ⁸⁴⁵

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0905 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).
 Ibid., 0845.

^{040 1510., 0043}

⁸⁴¹ Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1220 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

⁸⁴³ Ibid., 1205.

⁸⁴⁴ Ibid., 1245.

⁸⁴⁵ Ibid., 1205.

For example, FedDev Ontario provided funding in June 2016 for a specialized program for female entrepreneurs in technology industries, called Fierce Founders Accelerator program.⁸⁴⁶

Many of the regional development agencies provide financial support and work closely with organizations working in this field, including the Women's Enterprise Organizations of Canada, a national association of professional business support organizations dedicated to the success of female entrepreneurs. ⁸⁴⁷ The BDC also collaborates with entrepreneur organizations that assist female entrepreneurs. For instance, the Women's Enterprise Centre of Manitoba provides initial loans of up to \$150,000 to female entrepreneurs, and with a newly established co-lending agreement with BDC, signed in June 2017, the BDC can now provide an additional \$100,000 to businesses that require more capital. ⁸⁴⁸ Futurpreneur has provided up to \$45,000 in non-collateral loans with its co-funder BDC. ⁸⁴⁹

A number of witnesses recommended that the federal government establish a national capital and loan fund for female entrepreneurs. There are some funds centred on women that provide financial support to female entrepreneurs. For instance, the Committee heard about the BDC's Capital Women in Technology Fund, which will invest \$70 million over five years in early stage technology companies led by women in Canada. 851

Recommendation 66

That the Government of Canada establish a coordinated national approach to support female entrepreneurs through dedicated funds to local organizations that fill gaps of

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0950 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

⁸⁴⁷ Ibid.; Women's Enterprise Organizations of Canada, Who We Are.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1205-1210 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0845 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).

⁸⁵⁰ Ibid., 0920 (Sandra Altner, Chief Executive Officer, Women's Enterprise Centre of Manitoba); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1005 (Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer, British Columbia, Women's Enterprise Centre); Women's Enterprise Organizations of Canada, "<u>Recommendations on a National Women's Enterprise Development Strategy to Drive Economic Growth," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, August 2016.</u>

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1210 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); Business Development Bank of Canada, <u>Women in Technology Fund</u>.



economic and entrepreneurial development and increase access to centralized knowledge hubs.

Recommendation 67

That the Government of Canada work with the Business Development Bank of Canada to highlight to private venture capital firms the benefits of investing in female entrepreneurship.

Recommendation 68

That the Government of Canada apply a gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) to the recipients of federal grants and loans for entrepreneurs to ensure that all genders benefit equally from this financial support.

Recommendation 69

That the Government of Canada fund and promote initiatives that deliver networking and mentorship opportunities to female entrepreneurs.

Recommendation 70

The Government of Canada, in consultation with the provinces and territories, ensure that infrastructure projects funded by the federal government include provisions that require companies working on projects to seek to achieve and maintain a workforce that is representative of the Canadian workforce, including members of the four designated groups – women, Aboriginal peoples, persons with disabilities and members of visible minorities – under the *Employment Equity Act*.

Recommendation 71

That the Government of Canada collaborate with Crown corporations to invest in women's entrepreneurship, including in programs for female entrepreneurs living in rural and remote communities.

Recommendation 72

That the Government of Canada ensure that Crown corporations apply gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) to any procurement policies and contracts.

Recommendation 73

That the Government of Canada encourage the provinces and territories, as well as municipalities and local governments, to apply gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) to all infrastructure projects.

d. Access to Procurement Contracts

Witnesses spoke of the need to examine federal government — as well as provincial and territorial — procurement practices to ensure they equally benefit women and men, and include marginalized groups such as Indigenous women. The Committee heard that the federal government should make an effort to seek female-led companies for its procurement contracts. Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer of the British Columbia Women's Enterprise Centre, stated that "procurement from large corporations and government agencies is a major part of the economy, and it's an area in which women have typically been left out because of a lack of networks and lack of experience in that area."

The Committee heard about ISED's Innovative Solutions Canada program, which will provide \$50 million, starting in 2017-2018, to support research and development by Canadian innovators and entrepreneurs. An official from ISED said of the program that "[t]o maximize inclusiveness, particular effort is going to be made to encourage procurement from under-represented groups, including women." 854

The Committee was informed that the federal government can also promote supplier diversity initiatives among private corporations. For instance, Global Affairs Canada and ISED collaborated to create a "specialized women-owned sub-directory in the department's Canadian Companies Capabilities;" this searchable database provides

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 1015 (Marlene Poitras, Council Member, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security; Valerie Kaufman, Co-Chair, Métis Women's Council on Economic Security); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0855 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0915 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0945 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology); Good Jobs for All Coalition, "<u>Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, February 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1005 (Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer, British Columbia, Women's Enterprise Centre).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1210 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).



corporations with supplier diversity initiatives with "access to a dedicated listing of women-owned businesses across Canada." 855

The Canadian Trade Commissioner Service, through its Business Women in International Trade program, provides female-focused trade missions designed to promote female entrepreneurs to private companies in international markets. In a recent trade mission to Las Vegas, Nevada, representatives of businesses owned by women attended a supplier diversity conference and business development fair.⁸⁵⁶

Recommendation 74

That the Government of Canada ensure that gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) is applied to each Request for Proposal developed by federal government departments.

Recommendation 75

That the Government of Canada eliminate the barriers facing female-owned small- and medium-sized enterprises when bidding on federally issued procurement projects, including altering the design and criteria of contracts to increase bidding access for small- and medium-sized enterprises.

3. Women in Academia

In academia, women are under-represented in senior academic positions and post-secondary leadership. The Committee heard that approximately 20% of the 97 Canadian university presidents are women, a situation that has remained unchanged over the last two decades. Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor at Mount Saint Vincent University, explained that in higher education, where "over half of the undergraduates now are women," one would expect a greater representation of women in senior leadership positions. Senior leadership positions.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 1000 (John Gartke, Director, Trade Missions, Consultations and Outreach, Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade).

⁸⁵⁶ Ibid., 1005.

⁸⁵⁷ Ibid., 0950 (Dominique Bérubé, Vice-President, Research Programs, Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1015 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual).

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0955 (Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual).

⁸⁵⁹ Ibid.

a. Challenges to the Retention and Advancement of Women in Academia

Women's under-representation in senior academic positions can be traced, in part, to the high number of women who leave academia at the post-doctoral level, where researchers typically look for a tenure-track position at university institutions. From 1999 to 2009, despite an increase in number of students, there was a 25% decrease in the number of tenure-track professors across Canada, with universities instead hiring sessional professors who face little opportunity to obtain tenure. The Committee was informed that female academic staff are over-represented among the ranks of university professors who have temporary or part-time contracts. Margot Young, Professor at the Allard School of Law at the University of British Columbia said:

As you look at the numbers of women at the assistant professor level, you'll see they drop off as you get up to full professor. Women are less likely to become full professors in the academy, and when they do, they do so more slowly. 862

In a written brief, the Canadian Association of University Teachers said that "a recent study into precariously employed academic workers at 12 Ontario universities suggests a typical ratio is two women for every man." ⁸⁶³ Janet Currie, Co-Chair of the Canadian Women's Health Network, told the Committee:

I'm a Ph.D. student now. I'm working in the faculty of medicine, and I certainly have observed among my fellow Ph.D. students real questioning and a sense of despair around what their future will be. Many Ph.D.s are working as sessional instructors ... these are dead-end jobs and they're very poorly paid. I think some kind of policy and pressures need to be put on the university to support women going into tenure-track positions. ⁸⁶⁴

Furthermore, a representative from the Canadian Association of University Teachers stated that this disparity is likely more pronounced among "racialized women academic staff, women with disabilities and Aboriginal women," although they said "there is a

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0915 (Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President, Canadian Association for Girls in Science).

Canadian Association of University Teachers, "<u>CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of</u>
Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1015 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual).

Canadian Association of University Teachers, "CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0935 (Janet Currie, Co-Chair, Canadian Women's Health Network).



paucity of employment and diversity data" to confirm this observation. 865 The Committee also heard that economic security, within academia, is not just about job security or income security; it is also about career advancement and leadership opportunities including "administrative positions, chair appointments, and research opportunities."866

The Committee heard that workplace policies and culture in academia are not familyfriendly, which disadvantages women who are still the primary caregivers for children. The Canadian Association of University Teachers cited evidence that a lack of access to childcare is one of the biggest challenges to women's advancement in academia. 867

Tamara Franz-Odendaal, Professor and Chair for Women in Science and Engineering at the Department of Biology at Mount Saint Vincent University, said that women in post-doctoral studies are "afraid to tell their supervisors that they are pregnant" and are "afraid to reveal during the hiring process that they have a family. 868 Furthermore, in the academic realm, it is very difficult to get a research grant after a year or two without productivity, whether because of an absence due to parental leave or childcare responsibilities. 869 The Committee heard that without appropriate supports, women will "get trapped" in contract work. 870

Moreover, the Committee was told that there needs to be "an openness to diversity of voices in research"871 as women's research is often not valued. As an example, Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor at York University said that "research that's feminist — for example, I do feminist economics — is disparaged by the economists; they don't see it as research."

867 Ibid.

FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1000 (Tamara Franz-Odendaal, Professor and 868 Chair for Women in Science and Engineering, Department of Biology, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual).

Ibid., 1040. 869

FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1130 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity 870 Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers).

871 FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0935 (Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor, York University, As an individual).

Canadian Association of University Teachers, "CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of 865 Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017. Ibid. 866

b. Solutions to Increase Women in Academia

A number of witnesses spoke of efforts that post-secondary administrations could take to improve women's representation in academia. Tamara Franz-Odendaal, Professor and Chair for Women in Science and Engineering, Department of Biology, Mount Saint Vincent University recommended that universities be required to publicly report on the diversity of their faculty in order to raise awareness among university leadership, students and the public. Another option would be to require universities to establish equity policies to promote under-represented groups within the institution. The Committee also heard that a university faculty award program that would help women who are launching their research career could be established.

Witnesses said that the federal government has a role to play in increasing women's representation and leadership within academia. Some witnesses recommended that the federal government play an indirect role in increasing the number of stable tenure-track positions in university institutions, which would likely assist in the retention of young women in academia. This increase in tenure-track positions could be achieved by increasing federal funding for post-secondary institutions. The funding would have restrictions in that it would be tied to increasing the number of full-time faculty numbers.⁸⁷⁵

Recommendation 76

That the Government of Canada support female researchers and academics by increasing funding opportunities in traditionally female-dominated disciplines.

Recommendation 77

That the Government of Canada recognize the importance of empowering female researchers and academics, and increase access to research funding for emerging and

lbid., 1010 (Tamara Franz-Odendaal, Professor and Chair for Women in Science and Engineering, Department of Biology, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual).

⁸⁷³ Louise H. Forsyth, "Brief submitted to the Committee on the Status of Women as part of its study on the economic security of women in Canada — Subject: Canada Research Chairs Program," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1040 (Tamara Franz-Odendaal, Professor and Chair for Women in Science and Engineering, Department of Biology, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual).

⁸⁷⁵ Ibid., 0930 (Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President, Canadian Association for Girls in Science);
Canadian Association of University Teachers, "CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of
Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.



established female researchers and academics in traditionally male-dominated disciplines.

c. Federal Government Research Programs

The federal government provides a number of research grants and awards via the federal granting agencies (the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC), the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC), and the Canadian Institutes of Health Research (CIHR)) and other programs, although witnesses focused their testimony on the Canada Research Chairs Program and the Canada Excellence Research Chairs Program. Both of these programs have committed to addressing the under-representation among chairholders of four designated groups: women, persons with disabilities, Indigenous peoples and members of visible minorities. The Committee was informed that female researchers obtain fewer federal research dollars than their male counterparts. The Committee was also told that there are biases in awarding research funding, and that these have led to discrimination against women and other groups, "depriving the research community and Canadians as a whole of valuable perspectives, experiences, and knowledge."

Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University, asserted that more research funding is needed but it "needs to be done in a way that's equitable and that promotes and embraces diversity explicitly and intentionally." ⁸⁷⁹

(i) Canada Research Chairs Program

The Canada Research Chairs Program (CRC), which aims to attract and retain outstanding research professors, is a tri-agency initiative of SSHRC, NSERC, and CIHR. The CRC, established in 2000, falls under ISED's purview and invests approximately \$265 million per year in around 2,000 research professorships — Canada Research Chairs — in eligible degree-granting institutions. 881

⁸⁷⁶ Canada Research Chairs, <u>Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Practices</u>.

Canadian Association of University Teachers, "CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁸⁷⁸ Ibid.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1145 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).

⁸⁸⁰ Canada Research Chairs, About Us.

⁸⁸¹ Ibid.; Louise H. Forsyth, "Brief submitted to the Committee on the Status of Women as part of its study on the economic security of women in Canada — Subject: Canada Research Chairs Program," Submitted Brief.

Some witnesses said that the CRC has long discriminated against women, visible minorities, people living with disabilities and Indigenous peoples, ⁸⁸² and has shown a longstanding "preference for white male researchers without disabilities." ⁸⁸³ The Committee heard that in 2003, a formal complaint was submitted to the Canadian Human Rights Commission against the Department of Industry. The complaint claimed that there was "discrimination inherent in how the Canada Research Chairs Program was developed and implemented."

In 2006, a settlement agreement was reached whereby the Department agreed to implement measures and actions to address the equity issues that had been raised. 885 Canada's Fundamental Science Review, released in 2017, indicated that equity issues had not been solved: "Data do not suggest any gender bias in the selection of chairholders from the pool of nominees put forward by universities," rather "the nomination process itself is the critical step, and available evidence suggests continued biases."

According to October 2017 data provided by CRC, 30% of Canada Research Chair positions were held by women, compared to 24% of Canada Research Chairs in 2009. In May 2017, according to a CRC news release, "in response to the continuing lack of equity and diversity among Canada Research Chairs," a new equity, diversity and inclusion plan was announced. 889

The Committee heard the under-representation of women in the CRC program, has a negative effect on academia in Canada. Firstly, with fewer women holding important

⁸⁸² Louise H. Forsyth, "Brief submitted to the Committee on the Status of Women as part of its study on the economic security of women in Canada — Subject: Canada Research Chairs Program," Submitted Brief; FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0850 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual). Louise H. Forsyth, "Brief submitted to the Committee on the Status of Women as part of its study on the 883 economic security of women in Canada — Subject: Canada Research Chairs Program," Submitted Brief. Ibid. 884 Ibid.; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0850 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, 885 Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual). Government of Canada, <u>Canada's Fundamental Science Review: Investing in Canada's Future</u> 886 Strengthening the Foundations of Canadian Research, 2017, p. 94. 887 Canada Research Chairs, Program Statistics. 888 Canada Research Chairs, Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Practices. 889 Canada Research Chairs, "New measures to recruit more women, under-represented groups to Canada Research Chairs," News Release, 4 May 2017.



research roles, there are fewer female role models for young people. ⁸⁹⁰ As well, researchers who receive financial support tend to study topics that are important to them; as such, witnesses said that there may be an under-funding of research subjects that are more likely to be studied by female researchers. Without equal funding for subjects studied by female researchers, the academic world and students will not have access to potential significant research and a diversity of thought. ⁸⁹¹

The Committee was informed that key elements of the program may discriminate against women. According to the CRC program, Tier 2 chairs are intended for "exceptional emerging scholars" who have less than 10 years of experience as an active researcher. Marjorie Griffin Cohen, professor at Simon Fraser University, said that the 10 year requirement is problematic as "many young women at that particular stage are having their children and thus need to apply later." The CRC program states that applicants who are "more than 10 years from having earned their highest degree (and where career breaks exist, such as maternity, parental or extended sick leave, clinical training, etc.) may have their eligibility for a Tier 2 Chair assessed through the program's Tier 2 justification process."

(ii) Canada Excellence Research Chairs Program

The Committee was informed that the Canada Excellence Research Chairs Program (CERC), launched in 2008, awards "world-renowned researchers and their teams up to \$10 million over seven years to establish ambitious research programs at Canadian universities." 895 It is a tri-agency initiative of SSHRC, NSERC, and CIHR.

According to the CERC webpage, "the previous two competitions resulted in the underrepresentation of these four designated groups, notably women." For instance, in its

⁸⁹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0915 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual).

B91 Ibid.; Canadian Association of University Teachers, "<u>CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 1010 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

⁸⁹² Canada Research Chairs, *Chair Position Advertisements for Tier 2 Chairs*.

^{893 &}lt;u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0855 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual).

⁸⁹⁴ Canada Research Chairs, <u>Chair Position Advertisements for Tier 2 Chairs</u>.

⁸⁹⁵ Canada Excellence Research Chairs, <u>About Us</u>.

⁸⁹⁶ Ibid.

⁸⁹⁷ Canada Excellence Research Chairs, *Equity and Diversity Practices*.

first competition to allocate 20 chairs, no women were nominated for a CERC award. 898 Currently, only 1 of the 27 Canada Excellence Research Chairs is a woman.

A new CERC competition has been launched, and to address the under-representation of women, the competition will "require institutions to include detailed equity plans and recruitment strategies that promote the participation of women and other under-represented groups in the CERC program."

(iii) The Three Federal Research Granting Agencies

The Committee heard about the work, particularly in the field of supporting gender equality, of the three federal research funding agencies — NSERC, SSHRC and the CIHR. The three agencies developed a collaborative response to the 2012 Council of Canadian Academies' report, "Strengthening Canada's Research Capacity: The Gender Dimension," with the goal of improving women's participation in their respective funding fields. 900

In particular, the Committee heard that diversity and gender equity are key priorities in NSERC's current strategic plan and are highlighted in its strategic goal: "Building a diversified and competitive research base." NSERC also delivers several programs to promote women in STEM:

- The PromoScience program, which provides financial support for organizations working with young Canadians to promote an understanding of STEM, with a focus on encouraging girls, young women and other under-represented groups to participate;⁹⁰²
- The Chairs for Women in Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada is designed to increase women's participation in science and engineering and to provide career role models for women in those disciplines.⁹⁰³

```
    Canada Excellence Research Chairs, <u>About Us</u>.
    Canada Excellence Research Chairs, "<u>Government of Canada announces new competition for 11 Canada Excellence Research Chairs</u>," <u>News Release</u>, 12 October 2017.
    FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1<sup>st</sup> Session, 42<sup>nd</sup> Parliament, 20 June 2017, 0940 (Pierre Charest, Vice-President, Research Grants and Scholarships Directorate, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada).
    Ibid.
    Ibid.
```

⁹⁰³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 2 February 2017, 0950 (Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).



Officials from NSERC said that the agency "strongly suggest[s] to reviewers [of funding decisions] that they get training before they look at proposals to make sure we don't have biases in the way decisions are taken." 904

The Committee was informed that SSHRC provides funding in fields where women's leadership is already strong; an official provided examples of recent funding, such as "the gender aspects of poverty alleviation, employment standards protections for precarious job workers, childcare policies, [and] gender income inequalities." ⁹⁰⁵

The Committee heard that other aspects of diversity are also important to the three funding agencies. For instance, Indigenous research is "a strategic priority for SSHRC." 906

Recommendation 78

That the Government of Canada conduct a gender-based analysis plus (GBA+) of all federal government research programs, including the Canada Research Chairs Program and the Canada Excellence Research Chairs Program, and implement solutions to address any under-representation among chairholders of four designated groups: women, persons living with disabilities, Indigenous peoples, and members of visible minorities.

C. WOMEN IN SENIOR MANAGEMENT POSITIONS

In Canada, women are under-represented in senior management positions. In a written brief, Statistics Canada stated that, in the public sector, men and women are equally as likely to be in leadership positions, but only 26% of senior managers in the private sector are women.⁹⁰⁷

1. Factors Contributing to Women's Under-representation in Senior Management Positions

The Committee heard that stereotypes about women's lack of leadership skills or lack of interest in leadership positions are still present in the workplace, which contribute to

904 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 20 June 2017, 1005 (Pierre Charest, Vice-President, Research Grants and Scholarships Directorate, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada).

905 Ibid., 0950 (Dominique Bérubé, Vice-President, Research Programs, Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada).

906 Ibid.

907 Statistics Canada, "Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, February 2017.

women's under-representation in senior management positions. ⁹⁰⁸ As Ramona Benson, Chief Commercial Officer at Globacon Inc., said, "[a] lot of employers do worry that if they promote a woman, is she going to have a child and pay less attention to her work."

Women also face some workplace organizational barriers that prevent them from advancing to senior management positions. According to Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director at the Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec, "[w]e have heard about the glass ceiling and the sticky floor, but there is also an organizational maze in which a number of women seem to get lost." She explained that "women often begin their careers at lower levels than men do, have fewer advancement opportunities in key sectors, and that men have access to more seasoned mentors, which greatly accelerates the advancement of men." She explained that "women often begin their careers at lower levels than men do, have fewer advancement opportunities in key sectors, and that men have access to more seasoned mentors, which greatly accelerates the advancement of men."

Witnesses explained that women's disproportionate responsibility for caregiving is also a major barrier for women looking to advance to senior management positions; many roles in senior management are demanding, for example they involve travelling or working long hours, and do not balance well with family obligations. ⁹¹³

Recommendation 79

That the Government of Canada examine the reasons and possible solutions to women's under-representation in senior management positions.

2. The Importance of Gender-Diverse Management Teams

The Committee heard that there are benefits to having gender-diverse management teams. For instance, it can lead to "stronger financial performance," as well as "higher

⁹⁰⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0845 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec).

⁹⁰⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0910 (Ramona Benson, Chief Commercial Officer, Globacon Inc., as an individual).

⁹¹⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0845 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec).

⁹¹¹ Ibid

⁹¹² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1035 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0910 (Ramona Benson, Chief Commercial Officer, Globacon Inc., as an individual).

⁹¹³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0910 (Ramona Benson, Chief Commercial Officer, Globacon Inc., as an individual).



returns, increased innovation, and higher employee satisfaction."⁹¹⁴ Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President of Governance and Government Relations for the Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce, explained that:

Gender diversity more accurately reflects the world in which we live. When you embrace gender diversity, you gain insight into your clients' thinking, you build better relationships, you have the best team, and you build a better company. When our team members realize their full potential, we benefit from increased innovation, productivity, and engagement, resulting in better economic outcomes. 915

Gender-diverse management teams are also important as the more women there are in management positions; the more women acquire experience to sit on boards of directors. For this reason, Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director at Catalyst Canada Inc., stressed the importance of focusing on advancing women working at all levels in companies and not only to corporate board positions. 917

3. The Retention and Promotion of Women in Senior Management Positions

The Committee heard that there are various ways of increasing women's representation in senior management positions in federally regulated workplaces and the private sector. First, a number of witnesses said that it is important to support initiatives that aim to include more women in leadership positions and celebrate the companies that are invested in fighting the status quo. ⁹¹⁸ An example of such a program is the "parity certification" initiative created by Women in Governance, which measures efforts companies make to achieve parity at all levels within their organizations. One of the goals of the initiative is to create a talent pool that can be used when a senior position needs to be filled. ⁹¹⁹ In a brief submitted to the Committee, the Canadian Federation of

916 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0845 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, as an individual).

917 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0905 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

918 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1000 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua).

919 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0950 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance).

⁹¹⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1205 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

⁹¹⁵ Ibid.

University Women Burlington said the federal government should initiate programs to encourage women to become board members, managers and work supervisors. 920

Finally, witnesses recommended that the federal government "model through [its] own behaviour" and set targets for women in management positions within the federal government. ⁹²¹ In a written brief, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women stated that the federal government should "adopt quotas to enhance the representation of women in managerial positions in companies." ⁹²²

D. WOMEN ON CORPORATE BOARDS

The Committee heard that women can be held back by structural barriers that prevent them from advancing in the corporate world. ⁹²³ In a written brief, Barbara Annis and Richard Nesbitt explained that "[m]en still dominate senior management and boards, with women sometimes representing little more than a token presence" and that "women feel 'left out' and frustrated."

The Committee was told that the relatively low representation of women on corporate boards is not because of a lack of "board-ready" female candidates; ⁹²⁵ instead it is an issue of demand. ⁹²⁶ Women earn a high percentage of master's degrees in business

⁹²⁰ Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —
A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief.

⁹²¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0905 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

⁹²² Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017.

⁹²³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0955 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets); Barbara Annis and Richard Nesbitt, "<u>A Presentation by Richard Nesbitt to the Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women.

<u>Economic Security of Women</u>," *Submitted Brief*, February 2017.</u>

⁹²⁴ Barbara Annis and Richard Nesbitt, "A Presentation by Richard Nesbitt to the Canadian House of Commons'

Standing Committee on the Status of Women. Economic Security of Women," Submitted Brief,
February 2017.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0955 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0925 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0920 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec).

⁹²⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0955 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets).



administration (around 30%),⁹²⁷ but composed only 12% of the board seats of Toronto Stock Exchange's publicly listed non-venture companies as of 2016.⁹²⁸ An official from ISED noted that 73% of Canadian technology firms do not have women on their boards.⁹²⁹

At the international level, Catalyst data from 2014 show that the representation of women on corporate boards varies widely, from a high of 35.5% in Norway to a low of 3.1% in Japan. ⁹³⁰ As well, OECD data shows that Canada's female share of seats on boards of the largest publicly listed companies, which is 19.4%, is below the OECD average of 20%. ⁹³¹

1. Benefits of Gender-Diverse Corporate Boards

The Committee heard that having more women on corporate boards supports the principle of gender diversity and equal opportunity, but it also makes good economic sense. First, research shows that companies with a higher proportion of women on their boards of directors outperform companies with lower proportions of female directors. Studies suggest that a minimum of three women on boards, or 30% of members, is

⁹²⁷ Barbara Annis and Richard Nesbitt, "A Presentation by Richard Nesbitt to the Canadian House of Commons'
Standing Committee on the Status of Women. Economic Security of Women," Submitted Brief,
February 2017.

⁹²⁸ Women in Capital Markets, "Gender Diversity in the Economic — Gender Diversity in Canada's Corporate Leadership," Submitted Brief.

⁹²⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1205 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

⁹³⁰ Catalyst, <u>2014 Catalyst Census: Women Board Directors</u>, 13 January 2015.

⁹³¹ Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing

Committee on the Status of Women — Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief,

October 2017

See for example: FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0955 and 1010 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1010 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology); PEI Coalition for Women in Government, "Equity in Governance: Increasing Women's Economic Leadership in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0930 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.); Burnaby Board of Trade, "Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, August 2017.

necessary to enjoy the benefits of gender-diverse boards. ⁹³³ In a written brief, Women in Governance explained that:

Given that diversity on corporate boards and in executive positions is linked to business performance, the shortfall caused by the under-representation of women in these positions is detrimental to the Canadian economy as a whole. It is essential for women to be able to contribute to our economy through their talents, perspectives and vision. Nothing is more conducive to robust and informed decision-making than the complementarity of male-female talent. ⁹³⁴

Furthermore, the gender composition of boards can also affect the gender composition of senior management teams in a company as boards are responsible for overseeing the hiring process of the top management team. ⁹³⁵ Richard Nesbitt, Professor at the Rotman School of Management of the University of Toronto, indicated that having more women on boards results in more women in senior management positions. ⁹³⁶

Finally, witnesses stated that other advantages of gender diversity on boards are that the quality of decision-making and discussion improves, ⁹³⁷ and that "women and men tend to work more collaboratively, generate more creative ideas, draw from multiple perspectives and devise robust solutions to problems." Furthermore, Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board of the Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology, explained that gender-diverse boards tend to have "a stronger philanthropic commitment to our society."

⁹³³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0855 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

⁹³⁴ Women in Governance, "Speaking notes for Caroline Codsi, President and Founder of Women in Governance," Submitted Brief, June 2017.

⁹³⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0845 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

⁹³⁶ Ibid.

⁹³⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0935 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

⁹³⁸ PEI Coalition for Women in Government, "Equity in Governance: Increasing Women's Economic Leadership in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁹³⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology).



Recommendation 80

That the Government of Canada gather data and evidence of the financial benefits of having a gender-diverse board of directors, and disseminate this data and evidence to private sector companies.

2. Strategies to Increase Women's Representation on Corporate Boards

Over the past decade, corporate leaders and shareholders have started to acknowledge that company leadership should reflect the composition of the workforce and society more broadly. As a result, many corporations are taking steps to improve diversity on corporate boards, in particular the representative participation of women, although progress has been slow. In a written brief, the PEI Coalition for Women in Government stated that "[i]ncreasing the number of women on public and private boards is critical to creating innovative and inclusive environments that promote women's leadership and economic success."

The Committee heard about various strategies and approaches that could be used to increase the representation of women on boards, such as the "comply or explain model" and gender quotas, as described in the next sections.

a. The Comply-or-Explain Model

The Committee heard about various approaches used to increase the representation of women on boards, such as the "comply or explain model". Under the "comply or explain" model, companies are encouraged to adopt targets and policies to increase women's representation. ⁹⁴³ This model generally allows companies to set their own targets and schedule to meet them, ⁹⁴⁴ but they have to report on their progress and

⁹⁴⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0845 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

⁹⁴¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0845 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec).

⁹⁴² PEI Coalition for Women in Government, "Equity in Governance: Increasing Women's Economic Leadership in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

⁹⁴³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1030 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets).

⁹⁴⁴ Ibid.

provide explanations if they do not meet their targets. 945 Some witnesses stated that the "comply or explain model" is a good starting point to promote gender-diverse boards. 946

The Committee learned that the "comply or explain" model used in the United Kingdom (U.K.) produced positive results and that the representation of women on boards in the U.K. went from 12% in 2012 before the model was introduced to 26% today. Hichard Nesbitt, Professor at the Rotman School of Management at the University of Toronto, said that Ontario's "comply or explain model" sets a target of 30% for women on boards and requires "TSX-listed companies to provide annual reports to the Ontario Securities Commission." In a written brief, Women in Governance stated that the proportion of women on boards in Australia rose from 19.4% in 2012 to 23.4% in 2016 mainly because 82% of the ASX 200 companies "have adopted an internal policy setting a numerical target for female representation in decision-making positions."

The Committee heard from federal government officials that Bill C-25, An Act to amend the Canada Business Corporations Act, the Canada Cooperatives Act, the Canada Notfor-profit Corporations Act, and the Competition Act "would require publicly traded companies under the *Canada Business Corporations Act* to disclose information on the gender diversity of their boards and senior management." An official from ISED said

⁹⁴⁵ Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —

A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief.

FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1030 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0930 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0910 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0900 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

⁹⁴⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0955 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets).

⁹⁴⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0920 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, as an individual).

⁹⁴⁹ Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —
A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief.

⁹⁵⁰ Women in Governance, "Speaking notes for Caroline Codsi, President and Founder of Women in Governance," Submitted Brief, June 2017.

⁹⁵¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1210 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).



that Bill C-25 places the responsibility on Canada's corporations to advance the issue of gender diversity on corporate boards. 952

However, some witnesses told the Committee that the effectiveness of the "comply or explain model" is limited. For instance, when companies do not meet targets, their explanations for not doing so, provided to shareholders, often do not include relevant or useful information. In a written brief, the Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington stated that "regulatory or voluntary approaches are less likely to increase progress on their own."

In a written brief, the Burnaby Board of Trade said that the federal government should ensure that "comply-or-explain" requirements are included in the Cooperative Capital Markets Regulatory System, a new regulatory authority that bring together the federal government and governments of various provinces and territories. 956

b. Gender Quotas

Several witnesses stated that the implementation of quotas might be necessary to increase the representation of women on corporate boards. 957 For instance, Beatrix Dart,

- Pepartment of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, as an individual); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1040 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, as an individual); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0915 (Beatrix Dart, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, as an individual); Burnaby Board of Trade, "Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, August 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0950 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance).
- FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0930 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, as an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0915 (Beatrix Dart, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, as an individual).
- 955 Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —
 A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief.
- 956 Burnaby Board of Trade, "Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, August 2017.
- PEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1040 (Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics, Wilfrid Laurier University, As an individual) and 1035 (Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor, Mount Saint Vincent University, As an individual) and 1040 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual); Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "<u>The Standing Committee on the Status of Women A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief; PEI Coalition for Women in Government, "<u>Equity in Governance: Increasing Women's Economic Leadership in Canada,</u>" Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0850 and 0900 (Beatrix Dart, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0950 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance).</u>

⁹⁵² Ibid., 1245.

Professor at the Rotman School of Management at the University of Toronto, told the Committee that there is a need for a "shock to the system" and that this shock might be the implementation of quotas. ⁹⁵⁸

The Committee was told that quotas "have proven to work ... [in] countries that have adopted them." Witnesses provided the Committee with some examples of the use of quotas by governments:

- The Government of Quebec introduced regulations that required boards of public sector organizations to achieve gender parity over a period of five years, 960 which resulted in an increase in "the percentage of women on the boards of 22 state-owned enterprises ... from 27.5% to 52.4%, over five years."961
- The proportion of women on boards in Norway has increased from 5% to 40.5% after the introduction of quotas mandating 40% female representation on the boards of public companies. However, one witness stated that many companies delisted themselves from the stock exchange to avoid having to comply, as the quotas were applicable only to publicly listed companies.

Several witnesses told the Committee that the federal government should examine best practices for the implementation of quotas for women on corporate boards. ⁹⁶⁴ In a written brief, the Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington stated that

⁹⁵⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0850 (Beatrix Dart, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

⁹⁵⁹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1135 (Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women).

⁹⁶⁰ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0915 (Nathalie Goulet, Director, Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail).

⁹⁶¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1035 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance).

⁹⁶² PEI Coalition for Women in Government, "Equity in Governance: Increasing Women's Economic Leadership in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0930 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).

⁹⁶³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0920 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

Beatrix Dart, "Gender Diversity in Canada — Briefing to the Canadian House of Commons' Standing

Committee on the Status of Women Presented by Prof. Beatrix Dart," Submitted Brief, May 2017; Coalition of Provincial and Territorial Advisory Councils on the Status of Women, "Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada: Provincial and Territorial Perspectives," Submitted Brief, March 2017.



"setting quotas for crown corporations and publicly listed companies would ensure women [gained] employment in careers of their choice." The Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail recommended that "federal government enact legislation stipulating that at least 40% of the members of the board of directors of any federal agency be women, with equitable representation of minority groups, and that it consider similar requirements for private companies that sign public contracts."

The Committee was also informed of the possible negative impact of implementing quotas for women's representation on boards. ⁹⁶⁷ Witnesses stated that quotas can sometimes reinforce the idea that women got where they are because of a numerical requirement, not because of their qualifications, and that can reinforce feelings of unfairness among other groups. ⁹⁶⁸ Iris Meck, President and Founder of Advancing Women In Agriculture Conference, Iris Meck Communications Inc., said:

I think it is changing from the days when I started in the [agricultural] industry in 1978, when there were token women brought into organizations to meet the balance of equity in the workforce. I'm totally against that. I think it is an area where women have to strive to achieve, and men have to recognize that the position is available to either gender. ⁹⁶⁹

Ramona Benson, Chief Commercial Officer at Globacon Inc., said she was against affirmative action because "[y]ou need to have people who are right for certain jobs, for the sake of performance. You cannot simply place them in certain jobs because they fit a quota." ⁹⁷⁰

- 969 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 1030 (Iris Meck, President and Founder of Advancing Women In Agriculture Conference, Iris Meck Communications Inc., As an individual).
- 970 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0000 (Ramona Benson, Chief Commercial Officer, Globacon Inc., As an individual).

Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women — A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief.

⁹⁶⁶ Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail, "Economic Security of Women — Brief submitted by the Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail (CIAFT) to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, May 2017.

⁹⁶⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 1030 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0920 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

⁹⁶⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 1025 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada); Beatrix Dart, "<u>Gender Diversity in Canada — Briefing to the Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women Presented by Prof. Beatrix <u>Dart</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, May 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0920 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).</u>

A number of witnesses told the Committee about possible ways to avoid the negative impact of quotas. For instance, Beatrix Dart, Professor at the Rotman School of Management at the University of Toronto, stressed the importance of setting a high enough number for the quota in order to eliminate unintended consequences that could arise, such as women being ostracized or being identified as the "quota woman." As well, Dorothy Byers, Chair of the Board of Directors of FIRST Robotics Canada, stated that having a "list of criteria that a candidate must meet" can help eliminate the idea that women are there because of a quota, and not because they are the best candidates. 972

c. Other Strategies

Witnesses presented various strategies that could be used to increase women's representation on boards, without implementing the "comply or explain model" or gender quotas. First, witnesses told the Committee that companies could develop and implement recruitment strategies that would result in more women being chosen to sit on boards. Indeed, witnesses stated that boards should have formal policies and targets on gender and diversity goals, establish term limits to generate renewal, ensure that selection committees include women and review recruitment processes to eliminate unconscious biases. For example, Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer at Actua, said that companies should look at their recruitment practices to see how they could reach and recruit more women. In a written brief, the Burnaby Board of Trade stated that "[r]equiring goals for women's inclusion at the consideration and interview stage of board nominations would ensure that women are being considered fairly while still requiring they demonstrate the skill and merit necessary to receive a directorship."

⁹⁷¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 0920 (Beatrix Dart, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

⁹⁷² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 1035 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

⁹⁷³ Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women —

<u>A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada</u>," Submitted Brief; Catalyst Canada
Inc., Submitted Brief.

⁹⁷⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1010 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua); Canadian Dance Assembly, Playwrights Guild of Canada, Professional Association of Canadian Theatres, Opera.ca, Pat the Dog Theatre Creation, Theatre Ontario, Cultural Pluralism in the Arts Movement Ontario, and Canadian Artists' Representation/Le Front des artistes canadiens, "<u>Economic security of women within the arts and culture sector</u>," <u>Submitted Brief</u>, August 2017.

⁹⁷⁵ Burnaby Board of Trade, "Brief on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, August 2017.



As well, the Committee was told that the recruitment processes may have a negative impact on women's representation on corporate boards. In a written brief, Burnaby Board of Trade stated that "[o]ne major reason for the lack of women on boards is the recruitment process; male board members and male executives search their often male-dominated networks for potential candidates, perpetuating the gender gap."

Many witnesses said that companies should look for professions outside business to fill board seats; for example, companies could look at health care, the arts or the not-for-profit sector where women may have developed board experience. To increase the number of women on boards, Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director of the Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec told the Committee about the idea that recruitment firms should "make a commitment to put forward at least one woman in the final list of potential candidates."

Furthermore, witnesses said that there were leadership measures that the federal government could take to increase women's representation on corporate boards. For example, witnesses recommended that the federal government introduce tax breaks for companies that put an emphasis on gender diversity. Moreover, the federal government could lead by example by setting targets for public boards and appointing women on boards and commissions. Witnesses also suggested that the Prime Minister send a letter in support of women's increased representation to corporate boards that do not have women on their boards. As well, Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director at

976 Ibid.

- 978 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0850 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec).
- 979 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1025 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance).
- 980 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0935 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 June 2017, 0905 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.).
- 981 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0900 (Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus, Simon Fraser University, As an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 1010 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women).
- 982 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1025 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0935 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec).

⁹⁷⁷ Barbara Annis and Richard Nesbitt, "A Presentation by Richard Nesbitt to the Canadian House of Commons'

Standing Committee on the Status of Women. Economic Security of Women," Submitted Brief,
February 2017; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1240 (Andrea Nalyzyty,
Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

the Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec, said that the federal government could "ensure that ministers who have the authority to suggest candidates for boards of directors are invited to suggest one man and one woman for each position." ⁹⁸³

Recommendation 81

That the Government of Canada take the following actions: 1) measure on an annual basis the effectiveness of the comply or explain model outlined in the *Act to amend the Canada Business Corporations Act, the Canada Cooperatives Act, the Canada Not-for-profit Corporations Act and the Competition Act* in increasing women's representation on corporate boards in Canada; 2) make any data collected through this process publicly available; 3) conduct a review three years after the passage of the *Act* to determine whether the comply or explain model has been successful; and 4) consider implementing, if the model is deemed to be unsuccessful, alternative measures to increase women's representation on corporate boards based on international best practices, including both quotas and targets.

E. ROLE MODELS, MENTORING AND SPONSORSHIP

Throughout its study, the Committee heard that there is significant value to female role models, mentorship and sponsorship as it can help inspire and guide women and girls towards economic prosperity and leadership. 984

1. The Importance of Role Models

Having female role models in leadership positions and celebrating their successes can inspire other women and encourage them to pursue similar career paths, including careers in STEM, the skilled trades, entrepreneurship, and other fields traditionally

⁹⁸³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0845 and 0850 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec).

¹bid., 0910 and 0920 (Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer, Women Unlimited Association); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1010 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 0920 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1010 (Sarah Simpson, Manager, Value Proposition and Community Relations, Irving Shipbuilding Inc.).



dominated by men. ⁹⁸⁵ Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer of Women in Capital Markets, told the Committee that:

If you're sitting there at the mid-level in a corporation and you see no women ahead of you, you don't think it can be done. All you see are role models that are not as relatable. It's a bit of chicken and egg. We've got to get women into those positions so that they can see those role models. 986

The Committee heard that girls and young women need mentors, coaches and champions in the workforce⁹⁸⁷ and that "if you can't see it, you can't be it."⁹⁸⁸ Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board of the Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology, said that "if we don't have women in these leadership roles, we're sending a subtle message to our young women that they don't belong in these fields, and we certainly don't want to do that."⁹⁸⁹

The Committee heard that having female role models in senior positions is also important for men, so they can adjust their views on leadership and become accustomed to female leaders. Danniele Livengood, Director at the Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology, said that "we need to just make that thing the norm, so that every day

See for example: FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1005 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0920 (Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1000 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Experience, Shopify Inc.).

986 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1005 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief

FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 February 2017, 1005 (Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer, Women in Capital Markets).

Ibid., 0915 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation);
 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1010 (Sarah Simpson, Manager, Value Proposition and Community Relations, Irving Shipbuilding Inc.);
 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology).

988 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 1010 (Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer, British Columbia, Women's Enterprise Centre).

989 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0955 (Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board, Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology).

990 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0905 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, as an individual).

when you turn on a television, you don't see a woman CEO, you see a CEO who happens to be a woman, and people aren't making a big deal about it." ⁹⁹¹

2. Mentorship and Sponsorship Programs

The Committee heard that mentorship and sponsorship are key elements to attract and retain women in leadership positions. Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President Governance and Government Relations at the Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce, explained that the difference between a mentor and a sponsor is that a mentor "is somebody that primarily guides you from the sidelines and provides advice" and that a sponsor has to "put skin in the game in helping you advance your career." For example, a mentor can help an employee "to know how to deal with specific situations they encounter in the workplace" or an employee "looking for a sounding board as to how to handle a difficult situation, how to have a difficult conversation, and how to make a presentation better." As well, a mentor or a sponsor can help provide support and encouragement for an employee to apply to a new position. Ms. Nalyzyty stressed the importance of showing successful examples of sponsorships so that more sponsorship relationships are developed.

The Committee learned about a few mentorship and sponsorship programs:

 Futurpreneur Canada is a mentorship program for entrepreneurs, both men and women, in which entrepreneurs who are starting their career are matched with an experienced mentor who guides the mentee for two years. Typically, the mentor and mentee spend four to five hours per month on the phone or in person to discuss the business and its challenges.

⁹⁹¹ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 1010 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology).

⁹⁹² FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 1005 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada).

⁹⁹³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1245 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

⁹⁹⁴ Ibid., 1225.

⁹⁹⁵ Ibid., 1250.

⁹⁹⁶ Ibid., 1220.

⁹⁹⁷ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 0905 (Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer, Futurpreneur Canada).



- The Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology's Make Possible ("makepossible.ca") is an online platform that provides an informal mentorship space for women, from "high school students all the way up to CEOs." According to one witness, the online platform provided "a good way to connect people based on skills and take out some of those other biases, like age or level of education, so people could connect and support each other." Make Possible was funded in part by SWC.
- The Women in Governance mentoring program is for women over 35 years old who are in a leadership position but are close to the "glass ceiling." Each woman is paired with a mentor, either a man or woman, who provides one-on-one advice and networking opportunities, such as bringing the woman to functions and galas that the mentor is attending. 1000
- The Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce women's network offers several professional development programs across Canada "including networking events, speed-networking lunches, and career panels featuring various female executives and senior leaders across the organization." As well, the network "organizes speakers' series featuring topics relevant to professional development and facilitates peer-mentoring circles." 1002

Furthermore, witnesses stated that it is important that men — not just women — be actively engaged in coaching, championing, sponsoring, and mentoring women in the workplace. The Committee heard that sponsorship of women with high potential in corporations is critical to their professional advancement and that both male and female

1000 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1020 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance).

1001 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1205 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

1002 Ibid.

1003 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 1020 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1220 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0905 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

⁹⁹⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 16 May 2017, 0950 and 1015 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology).

⁹⁹⁹ Ibid., 0950.

corporate leaders should make a conscious choice to sponsor more female employees. According to witnesses, the likelihood of obtaining a sponsor is 46% higher for men than for women, a significant benefit to men in the business world. 1005

Recommendation 82

That the Government of Canada increase investments in organizations and programs that champion the advancement of women in all workplaces through greater access to networking, mentorship and training.

Recommendation 83

That the Government of Canada, in consultation with the private sector, develop initiatives designed to increase the mentoring, sponsoring and championing of women in the workplace.

F. THE ROLE OF MEN AND BOYS

The Committee was informed that men and boys have an important role in promoting women's economic prosperity in Canada. Richard Nesbitt, Professor at the Rotman School of Management at the University of Toronto, explained that "[f]or decades the burden of women achieving parity in leadership, whether in business, education, or government, has been placed squarely and wrongly on the shoulders of women alone." The responsibility of supporting, championing and advancing women in the workplace and into positions of leadership should also be placed on men, in great part because they are often the ones who already hold positions of power. 1007

¹⁰⁰⁴ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 1020 (Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor, Mount Saint Vincent University, as an individual); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0950 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 18 May 2017, 1005 (Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President, Strategy and Partnerships, Engineers Canada).

¹⁰⁰⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 1 June 2017, 0950 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1205 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

¹⁰⁰⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0845 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, as an individual).

¹⁰⁰⁷ Ibid.; FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 May 2017, 0850 (Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering, University of Ottawa, NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1250 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry); FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1135 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University).



Men need to be engaged in the conversation surrounding women's economic prosperity and they should be called upon as allies and advocates ¹⁰⁰⁸ to acknowledge that "equity, diversity, and inclusion aren't just good for women, but they're good for society and the economy as well." Richard Nesbitt, Professor at the Rotman School of Management at the University of Toronto, told the Committee:

It's up to men in positions of power to ensure the addition of more women on boards and, ultimately, on the management of their organizations. It's up to men to share leadership with women in their organization, and we need to do that now. 1010

Some witnesses acknowledged that there are both historical and present-day examples of men who have taken steps to support women in the realization of their full potential. However, Ellen Frood, Executive Director at the Alberni Community and Women's Services, expressed frustration that many men, including some in leadership positions, are not acknowledging the barriers and challenges facing women:

The men aren't listening. They're still letting it happen. We are letting this glass ceiling, this difference, this gender inequality, continue to happen. We talk about it a lot, we spend a lot of money trying to figure out what to do, and nothing happens. ¹⁰¹²

The Committee heard that not all men are actively engaged in promoting women's economic security. According to Richard Nesbitt, Professor at the Rotman School of Management at the University of Toronto:

You can split men into three different groups: the 20% who are very active in sponsoring women, who believe in this, and are doing it; the 20% who don't believe it, aren't going

1009 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0955 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada).

1010 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0845 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual).

1011 Ibid.; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1005 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).

1012 FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 15 June 2017, 1040 (Ellen Frood, Executive Director, Alberni Community and Women's Services).

¹⁰⁰⁸ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 0950 and 0955 (Dorothy Byers, Chair, Board of Directors, FIRST Robotics Canada); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1000 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer, Actua) and 1005 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 30 May 2017, 1020 (Iris Meck, President and Founder of Advancing Women In Agriculture Conference, Iris Meck Communications Inc., As an individual).

to do anything about it, and who today often occupy positions of power; and the 60% in the middle. 1013

The Committee was told that gender equality in the workplace and at home benefits both men and women, and that the burden of shifting societal expectations and stereotypes falls to both men and women. Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer at Actua, stressed the importance of creating initiatives that celebrate companies and leaders, including male leaders, who are supporting women in the workplace and advancing them in leadership. ¹⁰¹⁴ Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce, told the Committee about Men Advocating Real Change, an initiative whereby "[I]eaders and clients participated in a one and a half day workshop on how to better champion inclusion and achieve better gender balance at leadership levels in [an] organization." ¹⁰¹⁵

Furthermore, the Committee heard that gender stereotypes are also damaging for men. Imogen Coe, Professor and Dean of the Faculty of Science at Ryerson University, told the Committee:

We want men to be caring. We want men to be compassionate.... We need to have more men in nursing, and it's the opposite problem. It's not because we need to fix them. We need to change a culture that says, "This is not what boys do." Again, by six, boys start to stop playing with dolls because they get messages. 1016

The Committee heard that both male employers and employees must be champions and advocates for respectful and diverse workplaces. Women and men, acting as allies, can improve women's representation in the workforce and advance women's economic security and prosperity. 1017

FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0935 (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman 1013 School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual); Barbara Annis and Richard Nesbitt, "A Presentation by Richard Nesbitt to the Canadian House of Commons' Standing Committee on the Status of Women. Economic Security of Women," Submitted Brief, February 2017. FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1000 (Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief 1014 Executive Officer, Actua). FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 31 October 2017, 1200 (Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President, 1015 Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce). 1016 Ibid., 1125 (Imogen Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science, Ryerson University). 1017 FEWO, Evidence, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 4 May 2017, 1005 (Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development, Canada's Building Trades Unions).



Recommendation 84

That the Government of Canada work with the provinces and territories as well as private sector stakeholders to encourage male leaders to sponsor and mentor women in the workplace.

Recommendation 85

That the Government of Canada continue to support and fund community organizations that are leading public education campaigns that address "toxic masculinity," that counter the negative myths associated with gender norms, that refute gender stereotypes within the post-secondary education sector and labour force, and that promote gender equality, and that the Government of Canada issue a call for proposals for projects that seek to engage men and boys as allies in the fight for gender equality.

Recommendation 86

That the Government of Canada study international best practices to engage male civil society leaders to advocate on behalf of gender equality.

APPENDIX A LIST OF WITNESSES

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Status of Women Canada	2017/02/02	41
Justine Akman, Director General Policy and External Relations Directorate		
Lucie Desforges, Director General Women's Program and Regional Operations Directorate		
Department of Employment and Social Development		
Andrew Brown, Executive Director Employment Insurance Policy, Skills and Employment Branch		
Catherine Demers, Director General Strategy and Partnerships, Skills and Employment Branch		
Doug Murphy, Director General Social Development Policy		
Department of Industry		
Shereen Benzvy Miller, Assistant Deputy Minister Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services		
Department of Natural Resources		
Drew Leyburne, Director General Strategic Policy Branch, Strategic Policy and Results Sector		
Statistics Canada		
Andrew Heisz, Assistant Director Income Statistics Division		
Anne Milan, Chief Labour Statistics Division		
Women's Economic Council	2017/02/07	42
Valerie Carruthers, Co-Manager Virtual Office, Newfoundland and Labrador		
Rosalind Lockyer, Co-Manager Administrative Office		

Canadian Women's Foundation

Anuradha Dugal, Director Violence Prevention Programs

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women	2017/02/07	42
Jacqueline Neapole, Manager		
Jane Stinson, Research Associate		
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development		
Willem Adema, Senior Economist Social Policy Division		
Women in Capital Markets		
Jennifer Reynolds, President and Chief Executive Officer		
YWCA Canada		
Ann Decter, Director Advocacy and Public Policy		
As individuals	2017/02/09	43
Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus Simon Fraser University		
Ramona Lumpkin, President and Vice-Chancellor Mount Saint Vincent University		
Richard Nesbitt, Professor Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto		
Tammy Schirle, Associate Professor, Department of Economics Wilfrid Laurier University		
Margot Young, Professor Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia		
As individuals	2017/02/21	46
Kathleen Lahey, Professor Faculty of Law, Queen's University		
Donna S. Lero, Professor Emerita Centre for Families, Work & Well-Being, University of Guelph		
Inter-Provincial El Working Group		
Laurell Ritchie, Co-Chair Employment Insurance Sub Committee of the Good Jobs for All Coalition		

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Public Service Alliance of Canada	2017/03/07	49
Heather Finn, Special Projects Officer		
Jennifer Howard, Executive Director		
Canada Without Poverty		
Michèle Biss, Legal Education and Outreach Coordinator		
Megan Hooft, Deputy Director		
Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives		
Kate McInturff, Senior Researcher National Office		
Canadian Labour Congress		
Angella MacEwen, Senior Economist		
Vicky Smallman, National Director Women's and Human Rights		
Oxfam Canada		
Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor		
Unifor		
Lisa Kelly, Director Women's Department		
As individuals	2017/03/21	52
Andrea Doucet, Professor, Canada Research Chair in Gender, Work and Care Brock University		
Pierre Fortin, Professor Department of Economics, Université du Québec à Montréal		
Child Care Advocacy Association of Canada		
Morna Ballantyne, Executive Director		
Childcare Resource and Research Unit (CRRU)		
Martha Friendly, Executive Director		
Company of Women	2017/04/06	55
Anne Day, Founder and President		

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women	2017/04/06	55
Linda Davis, First Vice-President		
Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec		
Carole Gingras, Director Status of Women Service		
United Steelworkers		
Meg Gingrich, Research Representative National Office		
United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada		
Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario		
Actua	2017/05/04	59
Jennifer Flanagan, President and Chief Executive Officer		
Futurpreneur Canada		
Julia Deans, Chief Executive Officer		
Canada's Building Trades Unions		
Lindsay Amundsen, Workforce Development		
Women's Enterprise Centre of Manitoba		
Sandra H. Altner, Chief Executive Officer		
NSERC Chair for Women in Science and Engineering	2017/05/09	60
Catherine Mavriplis, Chairholder and Professor of Mechanical Engineering University of Ottawa		
Irving Shipbuilding Inc.		
Sarah Simpson, Manager Value Proposition and Community Relations		
Denise Watters, Welding Intern Women Unlimited		
Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec		
Louise Champoux-Paillé, Corporate Director		
Women Building Futures		
Jacqueline Andersen, Director		

Industry Relations

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Women Unlimited Association	2017/05/09	60
Doreen Parsons, Chief Executive Officer		
Women's Enterprise Centre		
Laurel Douglas, Chief Executive Officer British Columbia		
As individuals	2017/05/16	62
Isabella Bakker, Distinguished Research Professor York University		
Tamara Franz-Odendaal, Professor and Chair for Women in Science and Engineering, Department of Biology Mount Saint Vincent University		
Canadian Association for Girls in Science		
Larissa Vingilis-Jaremko, Founder and President		
Canadian Centre for Women in Science, Engineering, Trades and Technology		
Margaret-Ann Armour, President of the Board		
Canadian Women's Health Network		
Janet Currie, Co-Chair		
Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology		
Danniele Livengood, Director		
As an individual	2017/05/18	63
Beatrix Dart, Professor, Rotman School of Management University of Toronto		
Canadian Space Agency		
Dominique Breden, Chief Audit and Evaluation Executive and Senior Officer Responsible for Disclosure of Wrongdoing Audit and Evaluation Branch		
Marie-Claude Guérard, Chief Financial Officer		
Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail		
Nathalie Goulet, Director		

Ruth Rose-Lizée, Member

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Engineers Canada	2017/05/18	63
Jeanette Southwood, Vice-President Strategy and Partnerships		
As individuals	2017/05/30	64
Tamara Daly, Associate Professor, School of Health Policy and Management, CIHR Research Chair in Gender, Work and Health Director, York University Centre for Aging Research and Education, York University		
Iris Meck, President and Founder of Advancing Women In Agriculture Conference Iris Meck Communications Inc.		
Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale		
Hélène Cornellier, Coordinator of Action Plan and Communications		
Caregivers Nova Scotia		
Angus Campbell, Executive Director		
Cindie Smith, Caregiver Support Coordinator Northern and Eastern Mainland Region		
FIRST Robotics Canada		
Dorothy Byers, Chair Board of Directors		
As an individual	2017/06/01	65
Ramona Benson, Chief Commercial Officer Globacon Inc.		
Canadian Alliance of Student Associations		
Shifrah Gadamsetti, Chair Board of Directors		
Business Development Bank of Canada		
Lesley Lawrence, Senior Vice President Ontario		

Business Development Bank of CanadaMichelle Scarborough, Managing Director
Strategic Investments and Women in Tech

Caroline Codsi, President and Founder

Women in Governance

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Parents jusqu'au bout	2017/06/01	65
Geneviève Dion, Cofounder		
Marilyne Picard, Cofounder		
Marie-Ève Tétrault, Member		
Shopify Inc.		
Alexandra Clark, Director Public Policy		
Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President User Experience		
Catalyst Canada Inc.	2017/06/06	66
Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director		
First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security		
Tracy J. Lee, Chair		
Marlene Poitras, Council Member		
Immigrant Services Association of Nova Scotia		
Jennifer Watts, Director Settlement and Integration		
Métis Women's Council on Economic Security		
Valerie Kaufman, Co-Chair		
Phyllis Grace Steeves, PhD, Co-Chair		
As individuals	2017/06/08	67
Grace-Edward Galabuzi, Professor, Politics and Public Administration Ryerson University		
Alex Wilson, Professor University of Saskatchewan		
Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives		
Sheila Block, Senior Economist		
Pathways Health Centre for Children		
Jenny Greensmith, Executive Director		

Jennifer Howell, Parent Advisor

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Canadian Association for Retired Persons	2017/06/13	68
Wanda Morris, Vice-President Advocacy		
Canadian Federation of Students		
Charlotte Kiddell, Deputy Chairperson Nova Scotia		
Island Crisis Care Society		
Ronell Bosman, Programme Director Samaritan House		
Violet Hayes, Executive Director		
Department of Citizenship and Immigration		
David Cashaback, Director Temporary Resident Policy and Programs		
Stephanie Kirkland, Director General Settlement Network		
Corinne Prince, Director General Settlement and Integration Policy Branch		
Pauktuutit Inuit Women of Canada		
Amanda Deseure, Manager Socio-Economic Development		
Sarnia and District Association for Community Living		
Bob Vansickle, Manager of Employment Services		
As an individual	2017/06/15	69
Jaime Smith, Executive Lead, Centre for Employment Innovation St. Francis Xavier University		
Alberni Community and Women's Services		
Ellen Frood, Executive Director		
Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society		
Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager Nanaimo		
Comox Valley Transition Society		

Anne Davis, Program Coordinator

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Haven Society	2017/06/15	69
Anne Taylor, Executive Director		
Inclusion International		
Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director		
Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada	2017/06/20	70
Dominique Bérubé, Vice-President, Research Programs Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council		
Danika Goosney, Executive Director Tri-agency Institutional Programs Secretariat		
Claudie Gosselin, Senior Policy Advisor, Office of the Vice- President Research Programs		
Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada		
Pierre J. Charest, Vice-President Research Grants and Scholarships Directorate		
Serge Villemure, Director Scholarships and Fellowships Division		

Scholarships and Fellowships Division

Anne Webb, Policy and Planning Analyst Research Grants and Scholarships

Department of Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development

John Gartke, Director

Trade Missions, Consultations and Outreach

Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development

Kevin Murchie, Associate Regional Director Alberta Region

Sheilagh Murphy, Assistant Deputy Minister Lands and Economic Development

Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development

Melanie Reid, Acting Program Manager, Business Development Lands and Economic Development

Canadian Association of University Teachers

Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair **Equity Committee**

2017/10/26

74

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
National Association of Friendship Centres	2017/10/26	74
Sonya Howard, Policy Officer		
As an individual	2017/10/31	75
Imogen R. Coe, Professor, Dean, Faculty of Science Ryerson University		
Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce		
Andrea Nalyzyty, Vice-President Governance and Government Relations		
West Coast Women's Legal Education and Action Fund		
Kasari Govender, Executive Director		
Zahra Jimale, Director of Law Reform		
Office of the Co-ordinator, Status of Women	2017/11/07	77
Justine Akman, Director General Policy and External Relations		
Nancy Gardiner, Senior Director General Women's Program and Regional Operations Directorate		
Canada Learning Code		
Carolyn Van, Director Youth Programming		
Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters		
Michael Holden, Chief Economist		
Elise Maheu, Board Member and Director, Government Affairs, 3M Canada Company		
DisAbled Women's Network Canada		
Bonnie Brayton, National Executive Director DAWN Canada		
Calgary Immigrant Women's Association	2017/11/09	78
Beba Svigir, Chief Executive Officer		
Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women		

Ruth Halperin-Kaddari, Vice-Chair

Organizations and Individuals	Date	Meeting
Department of Employment and Social Development	2017/11/09	78
Lori Straznicky, Executive Director, Pay Equity Task Team Strategic Policy, Analysis and Workplace Information, Labour Program		
Kristen Underwood, Acting Senior Director Employment Insurance Policy		
Jonathan Will, Director General, Economic Policy Directorate Strategic and Service Policy Branch		
Douglas Wolfe, Director, Strategic Policy, Analysis and Workplace Information Labour Program		
Department of Industry		
Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services		
Nathalie Poirier-Mizon, Director Small Business Financing Directorate		

APPENDIX B LIST OF BRIEFS

Organizations and Individuals

Adams Coons, Crystal

Advancement of Women Halton

Akande, Abiola

Andrew Fleck Children's Services

Annis, Barbara

Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale

Banach, Annette

Boily, Anne

British Columbia Federation of Students

Burnaby Board of Trade

Canadian Alliance of Student Associations

Canadian Artists' Representation

Canadian Association for Retired Persons

Canadian Association of University Teachers

Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives

Canadian Dance Assembly

Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions

Canadian Federation of University Women

Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington

Canadian Institutes of Health Research Canadian Women's Foundation Canadian Women's Health Network Caregivers Nova Scotia Association Catalyst Canada Inc. Changoor, Alana Coalition of Provincial and Territorial Advisory Councils on the Status of Women Coderre, Cécile **Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women Company of Women** Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail **Cultural Pluralism in the Arts Movement Ontario** Dart, Beatrix **Department of Natural Resources Department of Western Economic Diversification DisAbled Women's Network Canada Doucet, Andrea EMD Serono Canada Inc. Engineers Canada** Finelli-Vetro, Katherine

First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security

FIRST Robotics Canada
Fleury, Josiane
Forsyth, Louise
Fortin, Pierre
Friendly, Martha
Galabuzi, Grace-Edward
Gallant, Julie
Good Jobs for All Coalition
Idji, Morènikè
Interval House
Lahey, Kathleen
Lero, Donna
Mathieu, Sophie
McKay, Lindsey
Mcrae, Tara
Meck, Iris
Métis Women's Council on Economic Security
Nanaimo Family Life Association
National Association of Friendship Centres
Nesbitt, Richard
Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants

Ontario English Catholic Teachers' Association

Opera.ca

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

Oxfam Canada

Parents jusqu'au bout

Pat the Dog Theatre Creation

Peel Poverty Action Group (PPAG)

PEI Coalition for Women in Government

Pirzada, Mariam

Playwrights Guild of Canada

Professional Association of Canadian Theatres

René, Andy

Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec

Rossignol, Noémie

Sarnia and District Association for Community Living

Skov-Hirchak, Kristen

Statistics Canada

Theatre Ontario

Unifor

United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada

United Steelworkers

Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter

Village Bloggurls

Villeneuve-Hobbs, Marie-Lou

Women Against Violence Against Women Rape Crisis Centre

Women in Capital Markets

Women in Governance

Women's Economic Council

Women's Enterprise Organizations of Canada

YWCA Canada

REQUEST FOR GOVERNMENT RESPONSE

Pursuant to Standing Order 109, the Committee requests that the government table a comprehensive response to this Report.

A copy of the relevant *Minutes of Proceedings* (Meetings Nos. 41, 42, 43, 46, 49, 52, 55, 59, 60, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 74, 75, 77, 78, 79, 90, 91, 92, 93, 94, 95, 102, 104) is tabled.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen Vecchio Chair

Dissenting Report from the Conservative Party of Canada

Championing the Economic Security of Women in Canada While Respecting Their Autonomy

Introduction

The economic security and advancement of women in Canada is of great importance to the Conservative members of the Standing Committee on the Status of Women. During the study, the committee had the opportunity to hear from more than one hundred witnesses who each offered a perspective worthy of careful consideration. The Conservative members are submitting this dissenting report in order to draw attention to a number of points that were not presented in the main committee report, and to challenge the government-knows-best attitude apparent in several sections of the report.

Although more can be done to advance the economic wellbeing of women in Canada, many noteworthy gains have been made since the start of the new millennium. The former Conservative government demonstrated its commitment to advancing the economic security and prosperity of all women by supporting them in whatever field of work they chose—be it the office, the family farm, the home, the lab, or the classroom.

Recognizing that some career choices present more barriers to women than others, the former Conservative government sought to advance women's economic security and prosperity by supporting women in leadership positions, women entrepreneurs, women in the skilled trades, and women in sciences, technology, engineering, and mathematics.

Under the previous Conservative government, significant wage gains were made by women across Canada and the wage gap between men and women was reduced to its smallest margin since 1976, the first year for which we have access to statistics. ¹ Particularly, the household incomes of elderly women and single mothers increased significantly.

Strong leadership on behalf of the Conservatives also created opportunities for women in the workplace. During their mandate, the number of women in senior management positions and on public boards increased to levels not previously observed.

These results are not surprising. The previous government, under Prime Minister Stephen Harper, worked tirelessly to remove barriers to women participating in the economy by addressing systemic barriers, providing access to capital and international markets for female entrepreneurs, facilitating greater access to mentorship for those seeking it, and by providing choice in childcare through the creation of the Universal Child Care Benefit. The previous government also provided \$37 million in annual funding to extend Employment Insurance Compassionate Care Benefits from six weeks to six months, thus allowing caregivers, who are often women, to care for an ill family member while receiving financial support.

¹ "This gender wage gap has narrowed substantially over time, with the increasing education level of women playing an important role." FEWO, *Evidence*, February 2 2017,0910,Mr. Andrew Heisz, (Assistant Director, Income Statistics Division, Statistics Canada)

Protecting Economic Choice

Women deserve the freedom to choose whatever field of work they desire without feeling pressure to enter one field over another just because the government tells them to. ² This could mean choosing a career in the STEM field, working on a farm, being an entrepreneur, a professional, a corporate executive or working in the home. This could be part-time or full-time work, or somewhere in-between. Governments should refrain from pushing women to work full-time over part-time; the choice should be left with them.

Furthermore, women should receive equal pay for equal work. It is essential for the government to work with public and private sector employers to eliminate gender-based wage discrimination.

Quotas Are Not the Solution

Conservatives believe that women deserve recognition as strong leaders within their workplaces. While this leadership can be recognized through a variety of appropriate promotions or awards, in its chapter entitled "Increasing Women's Economic Leadership" the Committee's report highlighted specific testimony regarding the implementation of gender quotas in order to get more women at the corporate boardroom table.

Though quotas may be well-meaning, they often suggest that women are not at the table because of their education, experience, or abilities, but rather, that they have been assigned a special position, based solely on their biological gender. The unintended consequence of quotas is that they may leave women wondering, "Was I given my seat at the table because of my qualifications and hard work, or did I get here because the organization needed to fill a seat with a woman in order to meet an artificial measure?" 3

Meanwhile, the men at the table don't face this same question. They enjoy the security of knowing they received their seat because of their merit and contribution to their organization. As a result, quotas often perpetuate harmful attitudes toward the women at the table, thus setting back the progress women have made to date.

Instead of using quotas, there is a different approach to helping women succeed in their careers.

This approach relies on increased mentorship, networking and the championing of strong female leaders. ⁴⁵⁶The vast majority of Canadians believe in equal opportunity for men and

_

² "In terms of representation in the universities, I think we do see a lot of women. Across the country today, you'll see that women are graduating from universities in agriculture in greater numbers than men. In looking at the university studies, we don't have that problem. It's in what happens after that." FEWO, *Evidence*, May 30th 2017, 1040 Ms. Iris Meck (President and Founder of Advancing Women In Agriculture Conference, Iris Meck Communications Inc., As an Individual)

³ "The last thing you want is a woman eventually ending up wherever it might be, whether on the board or in senior roles, and she's the token quota woman. That is almost the worst outcome." FEWO, *Evidence*, May 18, 2017, 0920 Dr. Beatrix Dart (Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual)

⁴ "Futurpreneur pairs each entrepreneur with a mentor, which we all know to be crucial to their success. We also recently worked with Futurpreneur on an awareness campaign through social media, which promoted

women and it's clear that women are just as capable as men. By increasing the social network that women can call upon to provide advice, opportunities and experience, the final barriers to economic empowerment for women in the workplace can be overcome.

Creating Choice for Parents

Parents understand what works best for their children and their families. This is why the previous Conservative government created the Universal Child Care Benefit, to help hardworking parents to provide for their kids.

The nature of work has changed dramatically. Not many jobs fit a traditional 9am to 5pm work schedule. The ability to access child care is quite different in rural Canada compared to urban Canada. For these reasons, a universal, one-size-fits-all childcare system is not realistic.⁷⁸⁹ When parents are given the appropriate tools, we know that they will make decisions that are in the absolute best interest of their kids. Parents can be trusted to find the type of care that is flexible to their specific needs, and that provides the highest quality care for their children.

Conservatives have always sought to empower parents by lowering household tax burdens. Through child care programs that are designed with a high degree of flexibility, and by cutting taxes for families, Conservatives' support for parents has been efficient and effective. The Conservative members of the Committee recommended that the government add to this positive record by removing the taxation from all income earned through EI special maternity and parental benefits, and that the government reduce financial disparities felt by families that have a single source of income by examining family taxation policies. These policies operate with an understanding of the reality of the family budget, and can be capped in order to ensure that they primarily benefit middle-class families.

entrepreneurship as a viable career option and shone a spotlight on successful positive women entrepreneur role models." FEWO, *Evidence*, June 1st 2017,0850, Ms. Lesley Lawrence (Senior Vice President, Ontario, Business Development Bank of Canada).

⁵ "I think the more women can network, the more women can experience relationships with other women who have succeeded. Learning from real-life stories is of the utmost importance. Again, any way to get women off the farm, off the chair at the office, and pooled up into a formalized group is nothing but beneficial." FEWO, *Evidence*, May 30th 2017, 1040 Ms. Iris Meck (President and Founder of Advancing Women In Agriculture Conference, Iris Meck Communications Inc., As an Individual)

⁶ "Research shows that sponsorship is critical to professional advancement and that women are 46% less likely to have a sponsor than men." FEWO, *Evidence*, October 31st 2017, 1205 ((Vice-President, Governance and Government Relations, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce).

⁷ "To keep this really concise, flexibility is important, but flexibility needs to go along with the money that will pay for the parent, the mother, to make the choice to stay at home. I would recommend that, yes, we need to make [parental leave] more flexible, and not necessarily longer." FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session 42nd Parliament, (Childcare Resource and Research Unit)

⁸ [The federal government should] Play a leadership role in creating more affordable, quality, non-profit child care spaces across the country. FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session 42nd Parliament, (Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women)

⁹ "We need a federal policy on child care and family leave to ensure the full participation of women in the economy." FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session 42nd Parliament, (Danniele Livengood, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology)

Furthermore, to increase our support for young families, if a Conservative Government is elected in 2019, parents who take parental leave will no longer pay income tax on their parental benefits. This will significantly improve the economic empowerment of women and young families.

To Empower Women, We Must Work Together

Men and boys need to be involved in achieving equal opportunities for women and girls. Research consistently shows that the majority of men believe in equal opportunities for women, which is why we need to build allies not enemies. Painting all men as anti-women, or defining feminism in such narrow terms that men cannot find common cause with women, ultimately pits one gender against the other and undermines the progress Canada has made in advancing gender-equality.

By engaging in important conversations like the ones that the #MeToo movement has prompted, we can collaboratively educate male allies on the challenges women face, have an open discussion about the solutions, and thus, begin to change our culture as a nation. A grassroots cultural change will do far more to permanently advance the equality of women than a series of heavy-handed, top-down government initiatives.

Conclusion

There are many ways to be a successful woman and it's up to each woman to choose her path, which is why economic *choice* is the greatest measure of equality. Do women have the same freedom as men to pursue the career of their dreams? Do women have the same freedom to prioritize caring for a child or loved one as men do if that is what they choose? Do women have the same freedom as men do to start their own business? Does Canada's cultural framework afford women the freedom to choose part-time work over full-time work without feeling of lesser value? Do women feel free to choose a job that pays less but is more fulfilling without being pushed by the government to pursue a career where women are under-represented?

Autonomy must be granted. Freedom must be protected. Choice must be respected.

Recommendations

In response to the report that was tabled by the committee, the Conservative members of the Standing Committee on the Status of Women put forward the following recommendations. These recommendations were left out of the final report by the Liberals, but they embody a number of important recommendations made by witnesses who testified before the committee.

10

[&]quot;It's up to men in positions of power to ensure the addition of more women on boards and, ultimately, on the management of their organizations. It's up to men to share leadership with women in their organizations, and we need to do that now. "FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session 42nd Parliament, 9 February 2017, 0845, (Richard Nesbitt, Professor, Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto, As an individual)

¹¹ "We have to engage men in the conversation… We have to actively invite them. WE have to find allies who will speak to them." FEWO, *Evidence*, 15 June 2017, 1040 (Anne Taylor, Executive Director, Haven Society)

Quotas

1. That the Government of Canada recognize that quotas undermine the power of women, because of the implication that women cannot achieve these positions based on merit.

Make Life More Affordable for Canadian Women and Their Families

- 2. That the Government of Canada support new parents by amending the Income Tax Act by introducing a tax credit in the amount equal to all tax paid on income earned through E.I parental and maternity benefits, thus making the E.I Parental Benefit tax-free.
- 3. That the Government of Canada reduce financial disparities between dual-income and single-income families by examining a tax model that provides the option of evaluating household income, as opposed to individual incomes for families.

Flexible Childcare Options for Parents

4. That the Government of Canada support parents in their search for suitable, high-quality, flexible child care that best fits their needs by working with the provinces to improve taxation processes that reflect the vast diversity of families and significant regional differences.

Entrepreneurship

5. That the Government of Canada repeal its damaging changes to how the small business tax provisions apply to privately controlled corporations in order to reverse the damage the Federal Government has caused to female entrepreneurs and their ability to save for maternity leave and family leave.

Women with Disabilities

6. That the Government of Canada ensure that persons with disabilities never lose more in benefits and taxation than they gain as a result of earning increased employment income.

ACTIONS TO IMPROVE WOMEN'S ECONOMIC SECURITY AND REMOVE BARRIERS TO ECONOMIC JUSTICE FOR WOMEN IN CANADA

A Supplementary Report submitted by the New Democratic Party of Canada

To the Government of Canada

June 8, 2018

We must act now to address the economic barriers holding women back. As the Progressive Opposition, the NDP has always fought against discrimination against women in all its forms. New Democrats have played a leadership role in promoting women's rights, including: equal opportunity, income security, equal pay for work of equal value, full political participation, supports for caregivers, and many more.

However, despite Canada's ratification of the *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, discrimination against women continues to exist in Canada.

WHY IS GENDER EQUALITY SO IMPORTANT FOR CANADA'S ECONOMIC SECURITY?

The International Monetary Fund says that "greater inclusion of women in the economy has been an important source of growth in Canada," and that "without women, Canada's economy would have been much smaller." The McKinsey Global Institute also say that "Narrowing the gender gap in Canada can potentially add \$150 billion to GDP in 2026 [...] If Canada were to go even further and close the gender gap completely [...] Canada could add \$420 billion in 2026."

THE HUMAN COST OF INEQUALITY:

Canada's childcare costs remain some of the highest in the world, but Canada continues to invest only a fraction of what is needed to solve the childcare crisis. Over 40 years ago, and again in 2016, the Liberals promised pay equity, but still no legislation has been tabled in Parliament, and there is zero funding for the implementation of pay equity in Budget 2018. Other services and programs, including employment insurance and parental leave, do not reflect the modern work experience for women, who generally do not work a 35-hour work week and therefore cannot access EI or even the "use it or lose it" parental leave benefits introduced in the budget. Recognizing that many of these challenges are faced even more prominently by racialized and Indigenous women, it is clear that Budget 2018 fails to address some of the most systemic issues that contribute to gender inequality, as well as inequalities between women in Canada.

These leadership failures have had long-standing effects on women's economic insecurity. Because of the lack of pay equity legislation, women earned less than their spouses, so when they couldn't find affordable child care it was the woman who dropped out of the workplace. Then there is the unpaid care associated with that, and lost earnings. When she moves back into the workplace, the work tends to be part-time and precarious, without the social safety net

¹ Bengt Petersson, Rodrigo Mariscal, and Kotaro Ishi, "Women Are Key for Future Growth: Evidence from Canada", International Monetary Fund, July 2017, URL: https://www.imf.org/~/media/Files/Publications/WP/2017/wp17166.ashx (sample period is from 1990 to 2015)

² McKinsey Global Institute, "The Power Of Parity: Advancing Women's Equality In Canada", June 2017, URL:

 $[\]frac{\text{https://www.mckinsey.com/}^{\text{media/McKinsey/Global}\%20Themes/Women\%20matter/The\%20power\%20of\%20parity\%20Advancing\%20women ens%20equality\%20in%20Canada/MGI-The-power-of-parity-Advancing-womens-equality-in-Canada-Full-report.ashx.}$

and unemployment insurance and pension associated with it. Then, if there is domestic violence, divorce, or separation, she is that much more vulnerable.

FEDERAL GOVERNMENT'S FAILURE TO ACT:

Successive Liberal and Conservative governments have consistently failed to act, ignored recommendations and cut social programs. These cuts have further exacerbated inequality for women. The current Liberal government was elected with high hopes of real change, but women are now facing the disappointing reality of a government that fails to back up feminist rhetoric with actual policies to improve women's equality. While Justin Trudeau has said time and time again that he is a feminist Prime Minister, his government has failed to act on some of the most critical challenges facing women in Canada today.

CHILDCARE CRISIS

A universal childcare program is the #1 action needed for women's access to the workforce and true gender equality. But it's missing from Budget 2018. Trudeau's Budget 2018 says the lack of childcare is a major challenge for most Canadians families, but failed to act. The current system barely serves 1 in 4 children and childcare costs in Canada are among highest in the world.

- Families need universal, accessible, affordable publically-funded childcare to get women into the workforce
- Universal childcare would generate jobs, and the fiscal surplus generated would mean no net cost to taxpayers and Early Childhood Educators(ECE) need to be paid better wages.

Committee evidence:

- Why a publically-funded, national universal childcare program is needed
 - Childcare is needed to ensure that women can go back to work if they choose
 - In 2008, due to the Quebec universal childcare program there were 70,000 more Quebec mothers in employment³
 - A lack of access to childcare endangers the economic security of women; when they don't have access to childcare, they cannot take employment opportunities⁴
 - Parents can't afford to pay higher fees, so government investment is needed to ensure that ECE are making a living wage
 - Early childhood educators are "subsidizing the cost of childcare" with their low wages⁵ and do not usually have pensions.
- The benefits of universal childcare
 - Universal childcare is the necessary model as it's less costly and more effective than targeted childcare⁶
 - Universal childcare generates jobs, and could have no net cost to taxpayers: the Quebec model created a surplus of \$900 million for the provincial and federal government⁷
 - Fee subsidy systems for childcare are ineffective⁸ and do not address the issues of shortages of spaces, high fees and quality.⁹

³ Evidence, Professor Pierre Fortin, Université du Québec à Montréal, March 21, 2017

⁴ Evidence, Louise Champoux-Paillé, Réseau des Femmes d'affaires du Québec, May 9, 2017.

⁵ Evidence, Dr. Donna Lero, Professor Emerita University of Guelph, February 21, 2017.

⁶ Evidence, Professor Pierre Fortin, Université du Québec à Montréal, March 21, 2017

⁷ Evidence, Professor Pierre Fortin, Université du Québec à Montréal, March 21, 2017

⁸ Evidence, Professor Pierre Fortin, Université du Québec à Montréal, March 21, 2017

⁹ Evidence, Martha Friendly, Childcare Resource and Research Unit, March 21, 2017

- Women across Canada need access to universal childcare
 - Immigrant women need it so they can access language training needed to enter the workforce¹⁰
 - o Women with disabilities need it, as they often work entry-level jobs with non-standard
 - o Women with children with disabilities are more likely to take time off work and even leave the labour market. Inclusive childcare would help them continue to work while caring for their child. 12
 - o Childcare is the "number 1 demand" from Inuit women to access employment and the labour force¹³
 - Women in post-secondary education need it to continue to go to school¹⁴
- Why the federal government should take leadership
 - o Although childcare is a provincial jurisdiction, the federal government has the legal responsibility and international commitment to use its spending power to create a universal childcare system across the country¹⁵
 - Canada should meet the international standard of 1% of GDP spent on childcare¹⁶
 - Oxfam has called on the government to "sustain and increase funding for childcare so that quality care is accessible to all by 2020"¹⁷

We believe the Committee's final recommendations don't reflect that the majority of expert witnesses¹⁸ urging the federal government to immediately take leadership to create a national, universal childcare system that provides affordable, quality childcare to all families in Canada.

¹⁰ Evidence, Samantha Letourneau, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society, June 15, 2017

¹¹ Evidence, Bob Vansickle, Sarnia and District Association for Community Living, June 13, 2017

¹² Evidence, Connie Laurin-Bowie, Inclusion International, June 15, 2017

¹³ Evidence, Amanda Desure, Pauktuutit Inuit Women of Canada, June 13, 2017

¹⁴ Evidence, Shifrah Gadamsetti, Canadian Alliance of Student Associations, June 1st, 2017

¹⁵ Evidence, Morna Ballantyne, Child Care Advocacy Association of Canada, March 21, 2017.

¹⁶ Evidence, Morna Ballantyne, Child Care Advocacy Association of Canada, March 21, 2017.

¹⁷ Evidence, Diana Sarosi, Oxfam Canada, March 7, 2017.

¹⁸ FEWO, Evidence, 7 March 2017, 1015 (Michèle Biss, Legal Education and Outreach Coordinator, Canada Without Poverty), FEWO, Evidence, 7 February 2017, 1005 (Jane Stinson, Research Associate, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women), FEWO, Evidence, 7 February 2017, 0850 (Anuradha Dugal, Director, Violence Prevention Programs, Canadian Women's Foundation), Canadian Federation of University Women Burlington, "The Standing Committee on the Status of Women – A Briefing Paper on Improving Women's Economic Security in Canada," Submitted Brief, Ontario English Catholic Teachers' Association, "OECTA Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women - Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, May 2017, Unifor, "Women's Economic Security: A Working Women's Agenda," Submitted Brief, March 2017, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada, "UFCW Canada submission to The House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women regarding The Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017, FEWO, Evidence, 15 June 2017, 0850 (Samantha Letourneau, Settlement Manager, Nanaimo, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society), Canadian Association of University Teachers, "CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women - Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017, FEWO, Evidence, 6 June 2017, 0925 (Tanya van Biesen, Executive Director, Catalyst Canada Inc.), FEWO, Evidence, 21 March 2017, 0900 (Martha Friendly, Executive Director, Childcare Resource and Research Unit), FEWO, Evidence, 6 April 2017, 0950 (Anne Day, Founder and President, Company of Women), FEWO, Evidence, 6 April 2017, 0955 (Linda Davis, First Vice-President, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women), FEWO, Evidence, 9 May 2017, 1020 (Jacqueline Andersen, Director, Industry Relations, Women Building Futures), FEWO, Evidence, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers), FEWO, Evidence, 16 May 2017, 0945 (Danniele Livengood, Director, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology), FEWO, Evidence, 21 March 2017, 1000 (Morna Ballantyne, Executive Director, Child Care Advocacy Association of Canada), FEWO, Evidence, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Diana Sarosi, Senior Policy Advisor, Oxfam Canada); Oxfam Canada, "Oxfam Canada Submission to the Standing Committee on Status of Women for Its Study on Women's Economic Security," Submitted Brief, March 2017; Mariam Pirzada, "Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women in the Workforce," Submitted Brief; and Alana Changoor, Submitted Brief, August 2017, FEWO, Evidence, 6 April 2017, 0905 (Debora De Angelis, Regional Director, Ontario, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada), FEWO, Evidence, 9 February 2017, 1005 (Margot Young, Professor, Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia, As an individual), FEWO, Evidence, 7 March 2017, 1005 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress), FEWO, Evidence, 7 March 2017, 0855 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada), Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women - Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017, FEWO, Evidence, 1 June 2017, 0955 (Lynsey Thornton, Vice-President, User Experience, Shopify Inc.), FEWO, Evidence, 30 May 2017, 0905 (Hélène Cornellier, Coordinator of Action Plan and Communications, Association féminine d'éducation et

Recommendations:

- -That the Government of Canada in Budget 2019 take leadership on creating a national, universal childcare system that provides affordable, quality childcare to all families in Canada.
- -That Canada in Budget 2019 reach the international standard of 1% of GDP spent on childcare.
- -That in the universal childcare system in Budget 2019, Early Childhood Educators be paid a living wage so that they are retained in the field and so that women working as ECEs have economic security

INFRASTRUCTURE SPENDING

- Proactive policies are needed to hire women into physical infrastructure projects
- More focus should be placed on social infrastructure spending rather than just physical infrastructure spending

Committee evidence:

- What's wrong with the current infrastructure spending model
 - Infrastructure spending that benefits traditionally male jobs led Canada to ranki 25th for gender equality, compared to 1^{st19}
 - Gender-based analysis (GBA) should be used for all infrastructure spending so that investment does not just create jobs for men²⁰ and spending should be balanced with provisions for women²¹
 - Natural resource projects are some of the highest paid employment in the North, but disproportionately employ Inuit men rather than Inuit women²²
- How infrastructure spending can benefit women
 - The construction of the Vancouver Island Highway used equity hiring, and shows how the government could use infrastructure spending benefits women and Indigenous individuals²³
 - The Vancouver Island Highway project had the impact of going from 2% of women at the beginning to 20% in the labour force²⁴
- Investing in social infrastructure
 - Infrastructure spending is generally on physical infrastructure, not on social infrastructure like childcare²⁵

d'action sociale), Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions, "Submission by the Canadian Federation of Nurses Unions (CFNU) to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017, Interval House, "Brief for Status of Women Committee's Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, Canadian Federation of University Women, "Brief submitted to the Status of Women Committee for their Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017, FEWO, Evidence, 15 June 2017, 0935 (Connie Laurin-Bowie, Executive Director, Inclusion International), Abiola Akande et al., "Economic Security — A Question of Rights, Social Justice and Fairness for Canadian Women," Submitted Brief, March 2017.

¹⁹ Evidence, Professor Kathleen Lahey, Queen's University. February 21, 2017

²⁰ Evidence, Meg Gingrich, United Steelworkers, April 6, 2017

²¹ Evidence, Linda Davis, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women, April 6, 2017

²² Evidence, Amanda Desure, Pauktuutit Inuit Women of Canada, June 13, 2017

²³ Evidence, Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus Simon Fraser University, February 9, 2017

²⁴ Evidence, Marjorie Griffin Cohen, Professor Emeritus Simon Fraser University, February 9, 2017

²⁵ Evidence, Professor Kathleen Lahey, Queen's University. February 21, 2017

 Investment in social infrastructure including education and health provides better returns than investment in physical infrastructure²⁶ Social infrastructure is more labour intensive, and more likely to employ women.²⁷

We agree with the Committee's recommendations on infrastructure spending; the NDP's report reinforces why proactive hiring policies and investing in social infrastructure are so important for women's economic security.

PENSIONS

- Defined-Benefits pensions must be protected to ensure that senior women do not fall into poverty
- Drop-out provisions in CPP for childrearing and eldercare must be added Committee evidence:
 - Why women need secure pensions
 - Women rely disproportionately on defined-benefits for economic security as seniors because of lower lifetime earnings and therefore less private savings.²⁸The elimination of defined-benefits will put senior women in danger of living in poverty²⁹
 - Defined benefits pension plans are the gold-standard of pensions, and ensure a secure retirement³⁰
 - The gap in CPP coverage for caregiving
 - There needs to be CPP coverage for primary caregivers for the elderly 31
 - There is no reason why a dropout provision for childrearing should not be included in CPP. The lack of a childrearing dropout provision is "penny-pinching."

The Committee's report failed to reflect recommendations from the labour movement urging the government to protect Defined-Benefits pensions³³ as they provide a secure retirement future for plan members.³⁴ Furthermore, many witnesses asked the government to withdraw Bill C-27 as the "bill's proposals are harmful to seniors' economic security".³⁵ But we agree with the Committee's recommendations on drop-out provisions in Canada Pension Plan for childrearing and eldercare and are adding extra context on why it is important for women's economic security.

<u>Recommendation:</u> That the Government of Canada immediately withdraw changes made to Defined Benefits pension plans in Bill C-27.

²⁶ Evidence, Professor Isabella Bakker, York University, May 16th, 2017

²⁷ Evidence, Professor Isabella Bakker, York University, May 16th, 2017

²⁸ Evidence, Meg Gingrich, United Steelworkers, April 6, 2017

²⁹ Evidence, Meg Gingrich, United Steelworkers, April 6, 2017

³⁰ Evidence, Wanda Morris, Canadian Association of Retired Persons, June 13, 2017

³¹ Evidence, Wanda Morris, Canadian Association of Retired Persons, June 13, 2017

³² Evidence, Professor Kathleen Lahey, Queen's University. February 21, 2017

³³United Steelworkers, "Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, April 2017.

³⁴FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 13 June 2017, 1030 (Wanda Morris, Vice-President, Advocacy, Canadian Association of Retired Persons).

³⁵ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0925 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada), FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0850 (Jennifer Howard, Executive Director, Public Service Alliance of Canada).

DOMESTIC VIOLENCE LEAVE

- We need federal leadership to create paid legislation for domestic violence leave Committee evidence:
 - The government's response to help women experiencing domestic violence should be to follow the lead of provinces like Manitoba who have passed legislation to provide domestic violence leave³⁶
 - Some unions in Canada have already passed domestic violence leave provisions, but all women should have it regardless of belonging to a union or not.³⁷

Last year, the Trudeau government strongly defended their new "three unpaid days" measure, but thanks to the pressure of labour unions and NDP MP Sheri Benson, five days paid leave was funded in Budget2018. Paid leave provisions are a welcome change for this government.

<u>Recommendation:</u> That the Government of Canada immediately introduce legislation to guarantee paid leave for individuals experiencing domestic violence

FUNDING FOR WOMEN'S ORGANIZATIONS AND GROUPS SERVING WOMEN

• Organizations that support women need access to reliable operational funding and direct investment to deliver vital programs and services

Committee evidence:

- A growing demand without growing government support
 - Shelter and support services for women are seeing an increase in the number of women coming to them for help³⁸
 - Women's organizations are facing stagnant funding, and a trend towards program funding rather than money to run basic programs
 - Front-line community organizations that provide support services need stable, core, ongoing funding that is adequate to address the actual needs³⁹
- The situation for immigrant women
 - Funding for immigrant centres must be increased to match growing demand

We agree with the Committee's recommendation for secure, multi-year operational funding to women's organizations and front-line community group. However, the Committee report failed to reflect the recommendation we heard from witnesses asking for that federal spending be delivered to service providers, not spending within government.

<u>Recommendation:</u> That Budget 2019 invest in strategies to address violence against women that direct federal spending to service providers, not spending within government.

PAY EQUITY

 Pay equity legislation is required to address the gender wage gap, where women make approximately 82 cents to every 1 dollar earned by men.

³⁶ Evidence, Meg Gingrich, United Steelworkers, April 6, 2017

³⁷ Evidence, Meg Gingrich, United Steelworkers, April 6, 2017

³⁸ Evidence, Anne Taylor, Haven Society, June 15, 2017

³⁹ Evidence, Anne Davis, Comox Valley Transition Society, June 15, 2017

• The Liberals promised pay equity over 40 years ago, and again in 2016, but still no legislation has been tabled and zero funding in Budget 2018 for the implementation.

Committee evidence:

- Pay equity legislation is needed immediately
 - There are no barriers to the government implementing proactive pay equity legislation immediately⁴⁰
 - o The 2004 Federal Pay Equity Task Force recommendations should be implemented⁴¹
- Why pay equity is needed
 - Traditionally low wages for women mean that many senior women are vulnerable to poverty because they have not been able to save enough over their lifetime⁴²
 - Indigenous women earn 36% less than non-indigenous men. Women with disabilities earn 48% less than men without disabilities. Racialized women earn 34% less than non-racialized men.⁴³

<u>Recommendation:</u> That the Government of Canada immediately introduce pay equity legislation, following the recommendations of the 2004 Federal Pay Equity Task Force, and that the implementation of this legislation be appropriately funded.

MINIMUM WAGE

- Women disproportionately work in precarious minimum wage jobs that threaten their immediate economic security, and make them more likely to fall into poverty
- Indigenous women, immigrant women, racialized women, young women, LGBTQ women and women with disabilities are more likely to work minimum wage

Committee evidence

- Precarious work continues to be gendered, with women disproportionately taking on precarious work and unpaid internships⁴⁴
- An increase in the minimum wage would help immigrant women out of poverty, especially women who are providing for large families⁴⁵
- Many witnesses called for the creation of a \$15-per-hour⁴⁶ federal minimum wage⁴⁷.

Recommendation: That the federal government immediately create a federal minimum wage of \$15/hour.

⁴⁰ Evidence, Diana Sarosi, Oxfam Canada, March 7, 2017

⁴¹ Evidence, Debora De Angelis, United Food and Commercial Workers Union Canada, April 6, 2017

⁴² Evidence, Wanda Morris, Canadian Association of Retired Persons, June 13, 2017

⁴³ Evidence, Tanya van Biesen, Catalyst Canada, Status of Women Committee meeting, June 6, 2017

⁴⁴ Evidence, Charlotte Kiddell, Canadian Federation of Students, June 13, 2017

⁴⁵ Evidence, Samantha Letourneau, Central Vancouver Island Multicultural Society, June 15 2017

⁴⁶ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 0905 (Lisa Kelly, Director, Women's Department, Unifor); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleurs et unifor); FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0910 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); Advancement of Women Halton, "<u>Women and the Workforce</u>," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017; Sheila Block and Grace-Edward Galabuzi, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives Ontario, "<u>Canada's Colour-coded Labour Market: the interaction of race and gender</u>," *Submitted Brief*, June 2017.

⁴⁷ FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0850 (Meg Gingrich, Research Representative, National Office, United Steelworkers); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 7 March 2017, 1050 (Vicky Smallman, National Director, Women's and Human Rights, Canadian Labour Congress); FEWO, *Evidence*, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 6 April 2017, 0845 (Carole Gingras, Director, Status of Women Service, Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec); United Steelworkers, "<u>Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women — Economic Security of Women in Canada," *Submitted Brief*, April 2017; Unifor, "<u>Women's Economic Security: A Working Women's Agenda," *Submitted Brief*, March 2017.</u></u>

TRANSPORTATION

The Trudeau government should immediately fund rural public transit, as bus companies are withdrawing services and dropping routes. The federal government should follow the example of the BC government who recently launched a new bus service for northern B.C. to replace service cancelled by Greyhound Canada. 48

- Women rely disproportionately on public transport because they generally have lower incomes.
- Transportation affects women's economic security and their physical safety, when they can't get to jobs or are placed in dangerous situations.
- Lack of access to transportation puts Indigenous women at economic disadvantage and risks their safety.

Committee evidence:

- Women experience issues of affordability, accessibility, and schedules in urban centres, and safety issues in rural and Northern areas when they are getting to iobs.⁴⁹
- o Immigrant women rely on public transportation to access the labour market⁵⁰
- For Indigenous women, "Transportation is the number one barrier to accessing health care, accessing educational opportunities, and accessing employment."
- The Highway of Tears is an example of the safety risks of women not having access to safe transportation.⁵²

We agree with the Committee's recommendation to increase investment in public transportation that will guarantee full access to affordable, frequent and safe transit services for all women.

HOUSING

- The shortage of affordable housing disproportionately forces women to live in poverty and violence
- A lack of affordable housing forces many immigrant women into poverty
- The housing crisis in the North threatens the safety of Inuit women

Committee evidence:

- A shortage of affordable housing leads to a shortage of shelter spaces because women can't afford to leave the shelter. And some women become homeless when they leave domestic violence
- Without affordable housing, women leaving violence are forced to choose between staying with their abuser or moving themselves and their children into poverty⁵³

238

⁴⁸ Justin McElroy, "B.C. government launches new bus service for northern half of the province", *CBC News*, May 29, 2018, URL: http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/bc-northern-bus-transit-may-2018-1.4683199

⁴⁹ *Evidence*, Jane Stinson, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, February 7, 2017

⁵⁰ Evidence, Jennifer Watts, Immigrant Services Association of Nova Scotia, June 6, 2017

⁵¹ Evidence, Tracy Lee, First Nations Women's Council on Economic Security, June 6, 2017

⁵² Evidence, Jane Stinson, Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, February 7, 2017

⁵³ Evidence, Anne Taylor, Haven Society, June 15, 2017

- The housing crisis in the North causes Inuit women to be forced to stay with abusers and constrains them from having the space to start their own businesses.⁵⁴
- Immigrant women who are working at minimum wage jobs can't afford housing, so they are forced to live in poverty.

We feel that the Committee report doesn't convey the urgency to act to address Canada's housing crisis.

<u>Recommendation:</u> That the Government of Canada immediately introduces legislation that recognizes housing as a basic human right and that the National Housing Strategy invests, without delay, in affordable housing to address the housing affordability crisis.

CHANGES TO EMPLOYMENT INSURANCE (EI)

- Many women in precarious or low-paid work do not make enough money or work enough hours to qualify for the EI requirements
- "Use it or lose it" parental leave for second parent, where the non-birthing parent can take non-transferable parental leave, helps to encourage fathers to share the work of childrearing

Committee evidence:

- o El requirements based on number of hours worked is discriminatory to women⁵⁵
- The EI system needs to be reformed to reflect modern work experience because many women are not working the 35-hour standard work week, especially in precarious jobs. A woman working full-time as a cashier for 25hrs/week, a standard, for 6 months will not qualify for EI⁵⁶
- "Use it or lose it" parental leave for the second parent will help men take on more childrearing responsibilities⁵⁷, and will also decrease discrimination against women based on pregnancy because men are more likely to go on leave as well.⁵⁸

The Committee report doesn't reflect recommendations that we heard from a number of witnesses who request immediate reforms to EI in order to prevent further harm to women's economic security. ⁵⁹ The Liberals need to reform the employment insurance system to reflect modern work experience, as many women are not working standard 35-hour work weeks, especially for precarious workers. EI requirements based on number of hours worked can be discriminatory towards women. But, we agree with the Committee's recommendation of "use it or lose it" parental leave for second parent. The NDP has been urging the Liberal government to introduce this measure.

⁵⁵ Evidence, Ruth Rose-Lizée, Conseil d'intervention pour l'accès des femmes au travail, May 18th, 2017

⁵⁸ Evidence, Danniele Livengood, Society for Canadian Women in Science and Technology, May 16th, 2017

⁵⁴ Evidence, Amanda Desure, Pauktuutit Inuit Women of Canada, June 13, 2017

⁵⁶ Evidence, Laurell Ritchie, El Sub Committee of the Good Jobs for All Coalition, Inter-Provincial El Working Group, February 21st, 2017

⁵⁷ Evidence, Jeanette Southwood, Engineers Canada, May 18th, 2017

⁵⁹ Canadian Association of University Teachers, "<u>CAUT Submission to the Standing Committee on the Status of Women Study on the Economic Security of Women in Canada," Submitted Brief, March 2017; Good Jobs for All Coalition, "<u>Women's Economic Security and Employment Insurance</u>," Submitted Brief, February 2017; FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 26 October 2017, 1135 (Pat Armstrong, Co-Chair, Equity Committee, Canadian Association of University Teachers); YWCA Canada, "<u>Improving Economic Security for Women — YWCA Canada — Brief to the House Standing Committee on Status of Women Study on Women's Economic Security," Submitted Brief, March 2017.</u></u>

<u>Recommendation:</u> That the Government of Canada immediately reform EI requirements to reflect the new reality of precarious, low-wage work done disproportionately by women.

MANDATORY GENDER-DIVERSE BOARDS OF DIRECTORS

- In 2016, women represent only 12% of the board seats of Toronto Stock Exchange's publicly listed non-venture companies.
- Only 27% of boards of directors of crown corporations, agencies, and commissions members are women.
- 73% of Canadian technology firms do not have women on their boards. 61
- Under-representation of women in these positions is detrimental to the Canadian economy as a whole.⁶²

The Committee recommendation to use the discredited "comply or explain" model doesn't reflect the recommendations we heard from expert witnesses.

Caroline Codsi, the President and Founder, Women in Governance explained that the
"comply or explain" principle has been in effect for two or three years, and the results
are, at minimum, lukewarm." On the other hand, she said that "quotas' effectiveness is
glaring [...] When we legislate, we have women. When we don't legislate, we have
excuses. It's that clear."⁶³

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) recommended that the federal government "adopt quotas to enhance the representation of women in managerial positions in companies" 64.

Recommendation: That the Government of Canada require that half of all government appointments to the boards of Crown corporations and government agencies be women and require that publicly traded, federally regulated companies have a minimum of 40% women on their boards.

CONCLUSION

A key test of Prime Minister Trudeau's feminist agenda will be whether he immediately implements the NDP's concrete measures to ensure that Canadian women do not fall further into precarious work and poverty.

We urge the Canadian government to demonstrate leadership, by walking the talk, and dedicating the political and financial support, resources and funding to improve women's economic security and ensure equal participation of women in the Canadian economy. It's beyond time to put words into action.

⁶⁰Women in Capital Markets, "Gender Diversity in the Economic — Gender Diversity in Canada's Corporate Leadership," Submitted Brief.

⁶¹FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1st Session, 42nd Parliament, 9 November 2017, 1205 (Frances McRae, Assistant Deputy Minister, Small Business, Tourism and Marketplace Services, Department of Industry).

⁶²Women in Governance, "Speaking notes for Caroline Codsi, President and Founder of Women in Governance," Submitted Brief, June 2017.

⁶³ FEWO, <u>Evidence</u>, 1 June 2017, 1025 (Caroline Codsi, President and Founder, Women in Governance).

⁶⁴ Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, "Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on the Status of Women – Study on women's economic security in Canada," Submitted Brief, October 2017.